TERTULLIANI

DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM

AD MARTYRAS: AD SCAPULAM

T. HERBERT BINDLEY

London
HENRY FROWDE
Oxford University Press Warehouse
Amen Corner, E.C.

New York
Macmillan & Co., 66 Fifth Avenue

QUINTI SEPTIMII FLORENTIS

TERTULLIANI

DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM

AD MARTYRAS: AD SCAPULAM

EDITED, WITH INTRODUCTIONS AND NOTES

BY

T. HERBERT BINDLEY, B.D.

MERTON COLLEGE, OXFORD
PRINCIPAL OF CODRINGTON COLLEGE, BARBADOS, AND EXAMINING
CHAPLAIN TO THE LORD BISHOP

'Quid enim Tertulliano doctius? quid in divinis atque humanis
rebus exercitatius?'
VINCENTIUS LIRINENSIS, Common. 18

Oxford

AT THE CLARENDON PRESS

1893

ANDOVER-HARVARD
THEOLOGICAL LIBRARY
CAMBRIDGE, MASS.

Oxford
PRINTED AT THE CLARENDON PRESS
BY HORACE HART, PRINTER TO THE UNIVERSITY

PREFACE

THE present volume has been edited as a companion to that containing the APOLOGETICUS, which was published by the Delegates of the Clarendon Press in 1889.

The treatise DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM was chosen for the especial purpose of illustrating the methods employed by Tertullian in defending the Church's position in view of the assault made upon it by heresy, as compared with those adopted in his earlier treatise for the vindication of the Church's innocence when assailed by the animosity and ignorance of paganism.

The two short Addresses AD MARTYRAS and AD SCAPULAM have been added as giving further examples of Tertullian's style under differing circumstances.

It seemed well also to include the Anonymous Appendix ADVERSUS OMNES HAERESES, inasmuch as it enumerates and briefly treats many of the phases of Gnosticism and other heresies, against the snares of

which the De Praescriptione Haereticorum was intended to be a comprehensive warning.

I have endeavoured in the Introductions and Notes to enter into the spirit of Tertullian and to reproduce in each case his immediate point of view, but in so rugged and surprising a writer I can scarcely hope to have been always successful.

T. H. B.

Codrington College, Barbados,
October, 1893.

CONTENTS

DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM

INTRODUCTION

CORRIGENDA

Page 82, line 4 notes, *for* charis *read* chairs
" 107, " 13 notes, *for* matrix *read* nutrix
" 108, " 12, *for* et ima *read* et in ima
" 137, " 11 notes, *add* 'But see Ramsay, *Church and Rom. Empire*, p. 334.'
" 149, " 6 from bottom, *for* innoscibilum *read* innoscibilem

examples of such a use.

It has also been interpreted as a 'demurrer'[2], although the

[1] Gore, *Christian Ministry*, p. 125; Hurter, *Opuscula Selecta*, ix. p. 11; Schaff, *Church History*, ii. 830. I must plead guilty to the same error in my note *Apol.* 7.

[2] Wordsworth, *Ch. Hist.* i. 238.

INTRODUCTION

THE treatise DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM seems to have been called forth by some specially directed effort on the part of heretical teachers to undermine the stability of the Karthaginian Christians. The methods of the heretical attack can be fairly well gathered from the course of the reply; and it is clear from several passages that, although professedly arguing on general principles against all heresies, Tertullian had chiefly in his mind the insidious snares of Gnosticism, and particularly the systems of Valentinus and Marcion.

The title of the work first demands a few words of comment. PRAESCRIPTIO is a term borrowed, like so many of Tertullian's expressions, from the language of the law-courts. But its real use and meaning have been frequently misunderstood; and Tertullian's employment of it has been explained as though it denoted a 'preliminary plea' or objection, lodged at the commencement of a suit, which if maintained dispensed with the need of entering into any discussion of the merits of a case [1]. The preliminary objection which might be ruled against heretics on account of their late origin would be an instance of such a 'praescriptio.' But a close study of the employment of the 'praescriptio' in Roman law affords no examples of such a use.

It has also been interpreted as a 'demurrer' [2], although the

[1] Gore, *Christian Ministry*, p. 125; Hurter, *Opuscula Selecta*, ix. p. 11; Schaff, *Church History*, ii. 830. I must plead guilty to the same error in my note *Apol.* 7.

[2] Wordsworth, *Ch. Hist.* i. 238.

argument of the treatise does not bear the least resemblance to the nature of that plea. It might with better show of reason be explained in its modern sense of 'an acquired right,' a plea which Tertullian does actually adopt in treating of the Church's original title to the possession of the Scriptures (chap. 37). But this is not the general meaning underlying the 'praescriptio' and our author's use of it.

'Praescriptio' technically denoted a clause prefixed to the 'intentio' of a 'formula' for the purpose of *limiting the scope of an enquiry*, which the 'intentio' would otherwise have left open for discussion before the 'judex.' At the same time the employment of the 'praescriptio' did not bar the plaintiff from taking subsequent action on any other points for the present left out of the suit. At the time when Tertullian was writing the use of the 'praescriptio' was confined to the plaintiff[1]. We may conclude therefore that it was Tertullian's idea in this treatise to place the Church in the position of plaintiff, and the heretics in that of defendants. And the first exercise and use of the 'praescriptio' in the case of the Church *v.* Heresy is *to limit the enquiry* to the single point of the legitimacy of the heretics' appeal to the Holy Scriptures (chap. 15). It is argued that the use of the Christian documents by the heretics is not allowable, inasmuch as they have forfeited their right to the name of Christian, and with that their right of possession in the Christian literature. Moreover they have mutilated and [illegible] the Scriptures to suit their own beliefs, whereas the genuine Scriptures and the true faith will always be found together. The question is therefore further narrowed down to this point:—In whose possession is the Apostolic [illegible] of Faith, which was delivered by Christ Himself to His [illegible], and by them to the bishops of the several churches [illegible] they founded? (chap. 21). It cannot be in the pos-

[1] [illegible] 'His temporibus, omnes praescriptiones ab actore [illegible] [illegible]um autem quaedam et pro reo opponebantur.'

session of the heretics, who can produce no episcopal successions; while on the other hand the unity and identity of the belief preserved by the Apostolic churches in all parts of the world guarantee its truth and genuineness. The very lack of episcopal succession from the Apostles—a lack which is itself both proof and consequence of later origin—would be alone sufficient to refute the pretensions of heresy, without taking into account its divergence from the apostolic creed (chap. 29). Heretics thus stand convicted, historically, of recent origin—'novitas,' 'posteritas'—and, practically, of innovation upon the faith—'fidem innovare' (chap. 42)—or deviation from the catholic standard of belief—'labi a regula' (chap. 3), 'exorbitare' (chap. 44). Such is the general drift of the treatise; but one or two of the points raised in the course of the argument claim more attention.

1. The appeal to the unity of the Church's doctrine as a witness to its truth leads Tertullian to set forth the Creed of the North African Church. His method here follows that of Irenaeus, and he points to the existence of a fixed body of truth which is all-sufficient as a saving doctrine, and beyond the bounds of which all is error. The form of the 'Regula Fidei' given in chap. 13 (comp. *adv. Prax.* 2; *de virg. vel.* 1) is essentially the same with that preserved in Irenaeus (i. 10; iii. 4; iv. 33[1]), and with the early Roman and Eastern creeds[2].

It may be noticed in passing that the early fathers did not lay that stress upon verbal identity which some commentators have demanded from them. Strong in the conscious possession of the one Catholic Faith, they were content to set out the facts of their belief in language which did indeed often employ well-known and stereotyped phrases, but which

[1] The references to Irenaeus throughout this volume are given according to Harvey's edition, Cambridge 1857.

[2] See them printed in full in Heurtley, *Harmonia Symbolica*, and *De Fide et Symbolo*.

equally often merely expressed and emphasized in the readiest manner those particular articles of the Faith to which the exigencies of the moment drew special attention. Even at a later time we find very considerable latitude in quoting the phraseology of the Nicene symbol—a carefully-written and explicit document, in the citation of which, one would suppose, not the smallest verbal deviation would have been tolerated [1]. And there is no evidence that the creed of the African Church, which in Tertullian's time and much later was orally preserved, had been embodied in a written document and synodically accepted. Even if it had, we need not feel surprise at the existence of verbally differing forms of it. There are at least two recensions of the Baptismal Creed in our own Book of Common Prayer.

2. The appeal to the Episcopal Succession as a test of Catholicity seems at first sight startling and far-fetched. Yet Tertullian was only following the course taken by earlier writers. It was indeed a natural and common ground of defence against heretics. And its cogency makes itself felt the more closely the facts of the case are studied. Christianity was laid in a basis of history: it was, and is, a *life*—a series of facts and events, commencing with the Incarnation and continuing to the end of time. The record of these facts formed the matter of the 'Gospel' which was preached by the Apostles in every church founded by their instrumentality; and the living voice of the collective Apostolic witness constituted the authoritative source of the record and the court of appeal on all questions connected with it. Had Christianity been a mere collection of ethical rules and principles, a written book would have sufficed: as the Q'urân suffices for the preservation of Mohammadanism and for the guidance of the adherents of the Arabian 'Prophet.' But the Christian doctrines were enshrined in, or rather were themselves,

[1] Athan. *Epist. ad Epict.* 4; Epiphan. *Ancor.* 120 f.; Socr. *H. E.* iv. 12; Basil *Epist.* 140. 2.

facts of history, the truth of which, in the first instance, eye-witnesses alone could substantiate. Christ's Death and Resurrection were events which had taken place at a definite time in the world's history. How, then, amid the natural tendencies of human thought and belief to disintegration and change, was the unimpaired tradition of the fundamental facts of Our Lord's life, or cardinal doctrines of the faith—call them which we will—to be guaranteed to future ages? How was the unity of belief, which is of the essence of the Church's life, to be preserved? Here again we find exactly the same kind of warrant supplied as at the first, namely, a continuous living voice of personal witness. For the paramount obligation which the Apostles felt to be laid upon them, as the period of their own witness drew to a close, was to entrust to others, who should succeed them as fathers and teachers, the duty of handing down the creed of the early Church intact and unimpaired. Thus S. Paul, on the eve of his martyrdom, reminds Timothy, his episcopal delegate at Ephesus, of this his first duty:

'The things which thou hast heard of me among many witnesses, the same commit thou to faithful men, who shall be able to teach others also' (2 Tim. ii. 2).

And the method adopted by S. Paul and Timothy, which is plainly and explicitly laid down in this command, was the one method which could most effectually secure the end in view. The Rule of Faith was posited in a creed; but the creed was not necessarily written. It was handed down orally, and its guardians were the bishops in the several churches, who were on this point the ultimate court of appeal. And the line of succession of these bishops most naturally became the link which connected each local church with its apostolical origin, and at the same time both guaranteed the identity of the belief of each generation with that of the preceding, and ensured its continuity in the future. As an illustration, we may take the notable case of

S. Polycarp, bishop of Smyrna. The important position which he occupied in this connexion arises from the fact that 'in him one single link connected the earthly life of Christ with the close of the second century, though five or six generations had intervened. S. John, Polycarp, Irenaeus—this was the succession which guaranteed the continuity of the Evangelical record, and of the Apostolic testimony'[1]. The case of S. Polycarp was a typical one of the value of the episcopal succession; and accordingly we find Hegisippus[2] carefully noting the Roman succession and bringing it down to the date of the 'Memoirs' he was writing; and Irenaeus appealing to the succession of the bishops from the Apostles as the great preservative of the Catholic traditions, and the great bulwark against heresy[3]. He claims, too, for the teaching of these successors of the Apostles an obedient acceptance, since they received along with their episcopate the sure gift of the truth[4].

It is clear, then, that the regularly constituted witness of a continuous personal voice in the episcopate was, as a matter of history, the method by which the unimpaired integrity of the Catholic Creed was ensured to succeeding ages. And looking back upon the constitution of the early churches, and regarding human nature as we are bound to regard it, we can see that the episcopate was the one adequate means for the preservation of the one body of truth. Amid much that was shifting and transient, the unshaken and permanent episcopal succession formed a solid phalanx of testimony all the world over.

It was not unnatural then, since all the true churches could produce the roll of their bishops down from the men

[1] Lightfoot, *Ignatius*, i. 474.

[2] *Apud* Euseb. *H.E.* iv. 22. I adopt Lightfoot's defence of this meaning of the passage (*Clem. Rom.* i. 154).

[3] iv. 33. 8.

[4] iv. 26. 2.

who were appointed by Apostles, and since such unbroken chains formed the security for the faithful transmission of the true faith, for Tertullian to call upon the heretics to produce their episcopal succession as the authority for their teaching. Nor was it an unfair conclusion that the impossibility of their complying with this demand proved the falsity and novelty of their doctrines. The episcopal succession was in truth a test of Catholicity, inasmuch as it formed at once the link with the past, the witness to continuity of life, and the guarantee of unity of faith.

3. Agreeably with his line of argument in this treatise, Tertullian maintains that the Scriptures are not to be made the final court of appeal in discussions with the heretics (ch. 15–19). The real question at issue begins higher up as it were; and the futility of an appeal to a literature whose text was disputed and whose meaning was distorted was obvious. Yet in other treatises (e.g. *adv. Marcion*), when discussing and refuting heresies on their merits, he does not hesitate to argue from the Scriptures, deducing their true meaning from a comparison of passages, and rejecting one-sided or heretical interpretations. This was the method which had been adopted by Irenaeus, and which was pursued with signal success in later times by Athanasius and Augustine.

The need of some recognized authoritative interpretation was clearly felt by all, and Tertullian urges that the Scriptures are to be interpreted by the consentient testimony of the Apostolic churches, because in them the true traditional exegesis will be found side by side with the true text of the sacred writings (ch. 19). His remarks on the impropriety of arguing from isolated texts in disregard of the context, or of other passages of Scripture, will be recognized as alike sound and acute (ch. 9).

The style of this treatise is far less vehement than that of the Apology, although instances are not wanting of Ter-

DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM

TEXT

The following are the authorities for the text of this treatise :—

I. **Manuscripts.**

1. Codex Agobardinus (*Agob.*). No. 1622 in the National Library at Paris. A parchment MS. of the ninth century, much mutilated. Used by Gothofred and Rigalt. Described by Oehler as 'longe omnium qui extant praestantissimus.' 'Solus enim superstes nobis liber intactus a correctrice magistrorum manu.' But it is disfigured by many lacunae and clerical blunders. The best account of it is given by M. Klussmann *Curarum Tert. part.* iii.
2. Codex Leidensis (*Leid.*). A parchment MS. of the fifteenth century. Described by Oehler as 'scatens vitiis vulgaris codicum Tertulliani familiae propriis.'

3. 4. Two Florentine MSS. (*Flor.* 13, *Flor.* 55) of the fifteenth century, one of parchment and one of paper, numbered 13 and 55 in the Laurentian library. They exhibit the same type of text as Cod. Leidensis.

5. A Florentine MS. (*Magl.* 527) of the fifteenth century written on paper, numbered 527 in the Magliabechian library. 'Concordat hic codex passim cum Pithoeano, Montispessulano, videturque unus certe prae reliquis Florentinis dignus qui ab futuro aliquo editore plenius excutiatur.'
6. A Florentine MS. (*Magl.* 528), No. 528 in the same library, in type and date resembling those in the Laurentian library.
7. Codex Paterniacensis (*Patern.*). A parchment MS. of uncertain date in the Rhenanian library at Schlettstadt. One of the two MSS. used by Rhenanus for his editio princeps (Basle, 1521), the other MS., Codex Hirsaugiensis, being now lost.
8. Codex Gorziensis (*Gorz.*). A MS. of the same family as the last two, but with many emendations. Used by Rhenanus for his third edition (Basle, 1539).

9. Codex Britannicus or Masburensis (*Brit.*). An unidentified MS. used by Gelenius for his edition (Basle, 1550).
10. Codex Vaticanus (*Vat.*). A MS. of a depraved type of text employed by Pamelius in his edition (Antwerp, 1579).
11. Codex Clementis (*Clem.*). An English MS., now lost, of good type, used by Pamelius. Perhaps identical with Codex Corbeiensis.
12. Codex Corbeiensis (*Corb.*). A MS. described by Ang. Mai, *Spicil. Rom.* v, 203; and identified by Oehler with the last named.

II. Editions.

Rhenanus (*Rhen.*) Editio princeps, Basle, 1521. Based upon two MSS. only, *Patern.* and *Hirsaug.* This edition was reprinted in 1525, and a second edition, in which the text was altered and emended *from conjecture,* was published in 1528. A third edition followed in 1539, for which a new MS., *Gorz.*, was employed.

Gangnaeus (*Gang.*). Paris, 1545. It is not known what MSS. were used for this edition.

Gelenius (*Gel.*). Basle, 1550. Text revised with the help of 'several MSS. from various parts of Germany and France' (probably those already used by Rhenanus), and of the *Cod. Brit.*, which is described as 'longe incorruptissimus.'

Pamelius (*Pam.*). Antwerp, 1579. This editor used three Vatican MSS. (only one, however, for the DE PRAESCR. HAER.), two Belgian, one English (*Cod. Clem.* or *Corb.*). The present division of Tertullian's works into chapters was due to Pamelius.

Barraeus [de la Barre]. Paris, 1580. Based entirely on the editions of Gangnaeus and Gelenius.

Franciscus Junius. Franeker, 1587. Reproduced Pamelius' text.

La Cerda. Paris, 1624–1630. Edition uncompleted. A composite text of no critical value, but illustrated with careful notes.

Rigaltius (*Rig.*). Paris, 1634. This editor used, besides previous editions, the *Cod. Agob.*, and adopted also many conjectural emendations of Fulv. Ursinus which he mistook for MS. readings. He also employed four other MSS. Codd. Pithoei, Puteanus, Fuldensis, Divionensis—none of which however contained the DE PRAESCR. HAER., although the last of the four is cited occasionally in his notes to this and other treatises, notwithstanding that Rigalt himself omitted them from his own list of its contents.

Semler. Halle, 1770.

Routh. Oxford, 1840. Script. Eccles. Opuscula.

Leopold. Leipsic, 1841.

Migne. Paris, 1844. A composite text, very inaccurately printed, but with a good selection of annotations from previous editors.

Oehler. Leipsic, 1853. A very carefully edited text, with a reliable apparatus criticus, and some valuable notes.

Hurter. Innsbruck, 1880. Sanctorum Patrum opuscula, vol. ix.

III. Essays.

M. Klussmann. *Curarum Tert. particulae* iii. Gotha, 1887.

Van der Vliet. *Studia Eccles., Tertullianus.* Leiden, 1891.

Zeitschrift für wissenschaft. Theol. 1860, pp. 82 f., 363 f.

In editing the present text I have been able through the kindness of Professor G. Wissowa to profit by the fresh collation of *Codex Agobardinus* made by Reifferscheid for the edition of Tertullian's works in the Vienna 'Corpus.' The volume in that series containing this treatise will not appear for some time, and being unwilling to delay the printing of my own volume I the more appreciate the generous aid of Professors Wissowa and Hartel, the co-editors of Tertullian in the Vienna series.

The peculiar orthography of certain words found in *Agob.*: e.g. *temptatio*, *inconsiderato*, has been retained.

ANALYSIS

I. Introduction; ch. 1–14.

1. Heresies a necessary evil; ch. 1–7.
2. Refutation of the heretical misapplication of Christ's command, 'Seek and ye shall find;' ch. 8–12.
3. The Rule of Faith; ch. 13, 14.

II. Main 'Praescription;' ch. 15–44.

i. 1. Heretics forbidden to use and appeal to the Scriptures in argument (ch. 15–19); because the Catholic Church is the sole possessor of the true faith and its records. And the Apostles whom Christ sent can alone be received as teachers; and the substance of their teaching can be learnt from Apostolic churches only (ch. 20, 21).

2. Consideration of heretical objections drawn from
   (*a*) The alleged ignorance of the Apostles:
      (1) Rebuke of Peter by Paul.
      (2) Special revelations to Paul; ch. 22–24.
   (*b*) The alleged non-publication of the whole Gospel by the Apostles; ch. 25–27.
   (*c*) The alleged error in the Church's reception of it; ch. 27, 28.

ii. 1. Heresies essentially of later date than the Church; their teachers lacking mission, and their followers without episcopal succession; ch. 29–34.

2. The true doctrine and the true Scriptures preserved by the Apostolic churches; ch. 35–40.

3. Description of the heretical organization and life; ch. 41–44.

III. Conclusion; ch. 45.

SYNOPSIS

CHAPTER

I. Neither the existence nor the power of heresies should cause surprise to the faithful, since they were foretold and are necessary for the testing of faith.

II. The power of a deadly fever causes no wonder, but precautions are taken against it: so ought heresies to be guarded against, and not wondered at, for they have power only against those who invite attack, either by foolish wonder or by weakness of faith.

III. The lapse of apparently faithful men into heresy should not ensnare others, for instances of the fall of good men are found in Scripture, and the defection of Christians is no proof of the truth of the heretical position. The test of faithfulness is endurance to the end. Even the Lord Himself was deserted by some of His followers, and the Apostle by his converts. The Church likewise suffers similarly to her Lord.

IV. Christ and His Apostles forewarned us against heresies and false teachers which abound in the present day and afford means whereby 'the approved' are made manifest both by brave confession and by loyalty to the truth. The Apostle's exhortation to 'prove all things' is perversely misapplied by the heretics, as though error were impossible to those who do so.

V. Whereas the Apostle classes heresy amongst evils along with schisms and dissensions, and indeed regards it as the greater evil which explained the lesser. He exhorts to unity of speech and mind, which heresies forbid.

VI. The same Apostle also classes heresies amongst carnal sins, and bids a heretic be rejected after one admonition,

CHAPTER

as self-condemned. He also repeatedly censures false doctrines which are the production of heresies.

The word 'heresy' is derived from a Greek word meaning 'choice,' and refers to the self-willed choice of a doctrine in opposition to the Rule handed down from Christ by His Apostles.

VII. Heresies borrow their tenets from philosophy. Valentinus is indebted to Plato, Marcion to the Stoics, Lucanus to Epicurus, Hermogenes to Zeno, Apelles to Heraclitus, while the Gnostic denial of the Resurrection is common to all philosophers.

The same questions are discussed by heretics and philosophers: the origin of evil, of creation, of the Creator. But between the Church and philosophies of every school there is an irreconcileable antagonism.

VIII. It is asserted, however, by heretics and by some churchmen that Christ's words 'Seek and ye shall find' justify speculation. But (1) this injunction was given at the beginning of His Ministry, before He was recognized and known: and (2) it was addressed to Jews who possessed Scriptures which proclaimed the Christ. In the same way the injunctions 'Knock, and it shall be opened to you,' 'Ask, and ye shall receive,' were addressed to the Jews who knew where to knock and from Whom to ask. It was not until the end of His Ministry that Christ gave any commands about the Gentiles. The Apostles were taught directly by the Holy Spirit, and therefore had no need to 'seek' the truth in order to 'find' it: still less is there any need of such an admonition for us who hold the Apostolic doctrine.

IX. But even granting that the injunction was for us: the words must still be interpreted according to their context and true purport. From these it is clear that there is a definite truth revealed by Christ which the Gentiles are to believe, and that they must therefore seek in order to find it and believe it. Search leads to discovery and discovery to belief. The truth taught by Christ will be found with us.

X. Belief, which is the goal of 'seeking and finding,' does away with the need for further search.

There is no finality in heresies, which all urge the same

CHAPTER

injunction, and one who listened to them would never arrive at any goal at all.

XI. Search implies that something has yet to be found, and on the part of a believer proves that he either never truly believed or else has lost his belief.

XII. Even supposing a continual search to be our duty, it must be carried on within the Church, and must not relate to matters which touch the Rule of Faith.

XIII. The Rule of Faith embraces a belief in One God the Creator; in the Word His Son, the Instrument of Creation and of Revelation; Who became Incarnate in the womb of the Virgin Mary, and lived as Jesus Christ; Who proclaimed a New Law and the promise of the Kingdom of Heaven, worked miracles, was crucified, rose again the third day, and ascended into Heaven, whence He sent the Holy Spirit; at Whose second Advent the resurrection of all with their bodies will take place, and the saints will enjoy eternal life, and the wicked depart into eternal condemnation.

XIV. This Faith, posited in a Creed, must remain intact, nor does it admit of speculation.

Heretics by their continual seeking prove themselves to be still in doubt, and thus, lacking belief, they have no claim to be called Christians.

They urge, however, that search is necessary even after belief for purposes of defence. So that in order to defend their belief they first deny it, for search implies lack of belief!

'But,' it may be said, 'they use the Scriptures and argue from them.'

Naturally, in dealing with the Faith they use the records of the Faith.

XV. And therefore our first step is to prohibit heretics from the use of the Scriptures in argument, since the Scriptures ought only to be used by those to whom they belong.

XVI. There are two reasons for this: (1) It is the clear teaching of the Apostle Paul, 1 Tim. vi. 11, Tit. iii. 10. (2) A discussion from the Scriptures is always futile.

XVII. For heretics either mutilate the text or pervert the meaning of the Scriptures.

XVIII. And argument with such persons on such grounds will

CHAPTER

only perplex the weak brethren, for the heretics are sure to retort upon us that falsification of the Scriptures with which we charge them.

XIX. No appeal therefore can be made to the Scriptures in arguing with heretics.

The immediate question to be settled is 'Who are the true possessors of the true Faith with its records, and by what transmission have they been handed down.' For the true Scriptures and their right interpretation will be found where the true Faith is.

XX. Our Lord Jesus Christ taught His twelve Apostles, and sent them to teach and baptize all nations. They founded churches in every city and committed to them all the same Rule of Faith. From these churches others also obtained and are daily obtaining the same tradition. These together form the whole Church, which is one and primitive in virtue of its unity of Faith and Apostolic origin.

XXI. Only those whom Christ sent can be received as preachers. The churches taught and founded by them have preserved the Apostolic doctrine, and all teaching which differs from this must be at once ruled to be false. We therefore limit the question to this one point: Is the Faith we have just set forth identical with that handed down by the Apostles? If it is, all deviations from it are false. Now our communion with the Apostolic churches is consequent upon our identity in doctrine with them, and witnesses to our possession of the truth.

XXII. The heretical objections to this argument are either

(1) that the Apostles did not know all things, or

(2) that they practised reservation in their public teaching.

But (1) the Apostles did know all things, for Christ fully instructed them, privately expounding mysteries, and fulfilling His promise of the Spirit Who should guide them into all truth.

XXIII. The heretics bring forward as an example of Apostolic ignorance: (*a*) the rebuke of Peter by Paul which, they say, implied a fuller knowledge on Paul's part. But they ought to shew that Paul introduced another Gospel, differing from that of Peter and the rest. We

CHAPTER

know, however, that Paul's Gospel was identical with Peter's and that there was a voluntary distribution of office between them, that each should preach the same Gospel but to different persons,—Peter to the Circumcision and Paul to the Gentiles. Paul's rebuke was for a fault in conduct, not in teaching.

XXIV. Yet the Apostles' conduct indeed was not necessarily the same in all cases, but was adapted to particular circumstances.

(*b*) Nor did the special revelations made to Paul render him superior in point of teaching to Peter, for these were by their nature ineffable.

XXV. (2) The heretical assertion that the Apostles taught some things openly to all, and other things secretly to a few is equally senseless, and involves a false interpretation of those passages in S. Paul's writings upon which it is based (1 Tim. vi. 20, 2 Tim. i. 14, ii. 2).

XXVI. The Lord's example and commands enjoined the open preaching of the Gospel in its fulness. And especially would it be fully taught to churches founded by the Apostles themselves, whose conduct would otherwise be deceitful and inconsistent.

XXVII. These two objections having been disposed of there remains yet a third: (3) the possibility of error on the part of the churches in their reception of the Apostles' teaching. This is deduced by the heretics from the rebukes administered by Paul to the Galatians and Corinthians. But the Apostle's reproof wrought amendment.

XXVIII. Let it be granted however that all the churches erred; how comes it that so many churches hit upon the same error? The very unity of their belief is evidence not of error, but of their preservation of a true tradition; and the authors of the tradition could not be in error.

XXIX. Error, no doubt, prevailed until the rise of heresies! the truth waited for the heretics to declare it! But the priority of the doctrine of the Church is evidence of its truth, for the counterfeit cannot precede, but always follows the genuine.

XXX. Marcion and Valentinus lived but a short time ago and were apostates from the Church. Apelles was a pupil of Marcion's. And this late date of heresies is proof of

CHAPTER

their falsity. Further, their works also condemn them; for the mutilation and perversion of the Scriptures is a necessarily later work than the Scriptures themselves.

New doctrines demand for their proper authentication new Apostles whose due appointment would necessitate Christ Himself coming anew and repeating His Life and Work on earth.

XXXI. Christ's parable of the Tares shews the prior sowing of the good seed and the subsequent introduction of the bad.

XXXII. If any heresies claim to date from Apostolic times, and therefore to possess an Apostolic origin, they are bound to produce, as the Apostolic churches do, the succession of their bishops from the beginning; although even if they were to fabricate such a succession it would not profit them, since they would be convicted at once by their divergence from Apostolic doctrine. And by this same test they will also be convicted by all true churches founded in later times, which are Apostolical not by foundation, but in doctrine.

XXXIII. Certain heresies did exist in Apostolic times, and were denounced. The same condemnation therefore attaches to present heresies which either existed in those days or are derived from those which did. The heretics named and condemned by the Apostles, in whose tenets present heresies share, are

(*a*) Those who denied the Resurrection, 1 Cor. xv. 12 (Sadducees, Marcion, Valentinus, Apelles).

(*b*) Judaizers, Gal. vi. 1 f. (Ebionites).

(*c*) Those who forbade marriage, 1 Tim. iv. 3 (Marcion and Apelles).

(*d*) Those who maintained that 'the Resurrection was past already,' 2 Tim. ii. 18 (Valentinians).

(*e*) The framers of 'endless genealogies,' 1 Tim. i. 4 (Valentinus).

(*f*) Those 'in bondage to elements,' Gal. iv. 9 (Hermogenes).

(*g*) The Nicolaitans, Rev. ii. 14 (Cainites).

(*h*) The deniers of the Incarnation, 1 John iv. 3 (Marcion).

(*i*) The deniers of the Divinity of Jesus, 1 John ii. 22 (Ebion.).

CHAPTER

(*k*) The practisers of sorcery and angelolatry, Coloss. ii. 18 (Simon Magus).

XXXIV. The doctrine of a second God, the Creator, was not broached before the time of Marcion, Apelles, and Valentinus, to whom first, no doubt, the truth respecting the Divine Nature was revealed! Heretics may therefore settle their particular dates for themselves. If they date from Apostolic times or have affinity with such, they share in the Apostolic condemnation; if they are not named by the Apostles, they are condemned on the ground of their late origin.

XXXV. Heretics can bring none of these objections against the faith of the Church. If they deny its truth they are bound (1) to prove it to be heresy, and therefore convicted by the same rules that convict themselves; and (2) to shew where the Truth is to be found, since it has already been established that it is not in their possession. Our doctrine is proved to be true by its being earlier than all others; and it is proved to be Apostolic from the fact that the Apostles maintained it while condemning every teaching foreign to it.

XXXVI. The Apostolic churches speak with the voices of the Apostles. There is Corinth for Achaia, Philippi for Macedonia, Ephesus for Asia, and Rome, the great Apostolic see of the West, for Italy and Africa. This church preserves that Apostolic rule and practice from which heresies have degenerated like a wild plant from the cultivated fruit-tree.

XXXVII. The truth is in our possession who hold that which the churches have handed down from the Apostles, and which the Apostles received from Christ, and Christ from God. Hence our refusal to allow the Scriptures to be used by those to whom they do not belong; for heretics are named after their own choice, not from Christ, and therefore, being non-Christians, they have no right to the Christian literature, which the Church holds in her possession by an ancient, true, and assured title.

XXXVIII. The falsification and perversion of the Scriptures were effected by the heretics when they began to teach false doctrines. The one was necessary to the other. In the

CHAPTER

Church true doctrine is found along with true Scriptures, for the Church has no reason for interpolating them. Corruptions of the text are necessarily the work of later hands, and arise from hostility to the truth. The cunning of Valentinus, who perverted the meaning, made as great havoc of the Scriptures as did the boldness of Marcion, who excised the text.

XXXIX. Similar examples of textual manipulation are found in the case of secular writings at the present day. Centos from Virgil and Homer are well known; much more readily do the Divine Writings lend themselves to perverse uses. And purposely so; since 'heresies must needs be,' yet cannot be without the Scriptures.

XL. Heretical interpretations are suggested by the devil, who even rivals the mysteries of God. Just as in idolatrous rites he counterfeits Christian ceremonies, so also has he adapted the Christian documents to the rival faith of profane heresies. Heresies therefore and idolatry have the same author, and all heresy is in a certain sense idolatry.

XLI. The conduct of heretics is, like their faith, reckless and undisciplined. They obliterate the distinction between catechumens and the baptized; they are even careless about the presence of heathen in their assemblies. They undiscriminatingly unite in communion with any who will attack the truth. Their women are presumptuous; their ordinations heedless; and they disregard the due distinction between priest and laic.

XLII. In the ministry of the word they can only destroy, and are unable to build up. Their internal schisms are not apparent, for schism is their bond of unity. Schism begets schism; for the same licence is claimed by the individual heretic as by the heresiarch, of fashioning his own beliefs. Hence great differences exist between the heresies and their founders. Heretics are outcast wanderers, churchless, motherless, homeless, creedless.

XLIII. They associate with magicians, quacks, and philosophers, justifying such conduct by the precept 'Seek and ye shall find.' Their discipline is the index to their doctrine. Denying that God is to be feared, they are naturally lax in conduct. The orderliness of the Catholic

CHAPTER

discipline is due to the fear of God and the sense of His presence.

XLIV. Our stricter discipline is a further evidence of truth which ought not to be overlooked. In the great Judgement at the Last Day will the heretics allege any lack of warning given them by Christ? Will they deserve pardon, and those who were mindful of Christ's admonition forfeit it? Can they imagine Christ speaking falsely, altering His Gospel, stultifying His own promises, owning Himself mistaken?

XLV. The argument has been conducted on a general principle applicable against all heretics, that they are to be prohibited from using the Scriptures in their discussions. If possible, certain heresies shall also be answered specifically in separate treatises.

TERTULLIANI

DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM

CAPUT I.

CONDICIO praesentium temporum etiam hanc admonitionem provocat nostram, non oportere nos mirari super haereses istas, sive quia sunt; futurae enim praenuntiabantur: sive quia fidem quorumdam subvertunt; ad hoc enim sunt, ut fides habendo temptationem haberet etiam probationem. Vane ergo et inconsiderato plerique hoc ipso scandalizantur,

TITLE.—In the oldest MSS. (*Agob.*, *Patern.*) this treatise is entitled DE PRAESCRIPTIONE HAERETICORUM, and it is so printed in the editions of Rigalt, Migne, and Oehler. In other MSS. and ancient editions the title varies: DE PRAESCRIPTIONIBUS HAERETICORUM *Leid.*, *Flor.* 13, *Flor.* 55, *Magl.* 528, *Corb.*, *Rhen.*; DE PRAESCRIPTIONIBUS *Magl.* 527; DE PRAESCRIPTIONIBUS ADVERSUS HAERETICOS *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*

The oldest form of the title may be compared with that of the treatise DE EXHORTATIONE CASTITATIS, or of S. Cyprian's tract DE EXHORTATIONE MARTYRII, which are respectively equivalent to 'De Exhortatione ad Castitatem,' and 'De Exhortatione ad Martyrium.' The 'Praescriptio Haereticorum' is the 'Praescriptio adversus Haereticos,' a phrase which Tertullian himself uses in a passage referring to this treatise, *de carne Christi* 2 'sed plenius eiusmodi praescriptionibus adversus omnes haereses alibi iam usi sumus.'

CHAP. I.—3. **praenuntiabantur.** S. Matt. vii. 15; xxiv. 4, 11, 24; Acts xx. 24 f.; 1 Tim. iv. 1 f.; 2 Pet. ii. 1. Comp. 1 Cor. xi. 19, and on the question whether S. Paul was in this last passage quoting definite words of Christ, see Resch, *Agrapha*, p. 175 f.; Knowling, *Witness of the Epistles*, p. 119.

4. **ut fides habendo, &c.** Comp. the same thought in the *Apology*, ch. 21 'fides difficultate constat.'

6. **plerique scandalizantur.** S. Matt. xxiv. 10.

quod tantum haereses valeant. Quantum, si non fuissent! Cum quid sortitum est ut omnimodo sit, caussam accipit ob quam sit. Hic vim consequitur per quam sit, ne esse non possit.

CAPUT II.

Febrem denique inter ceteros mortiferos et cruciarios exitus erogando homini deputatam, neque quia est miramur, est enim; neque quia erogat hominem, ad hoc enim est. Proinde haereses ad languorem et interitum fidei productas,

1. **Quantum, si non fuissent!** 'How much power would they have, if they did not exist!' A paradox quite in Tertullian's manner. Heresies would prevail more mightily by their non-existence than by their existence, since their non-existence would overthrow the truth of Scripture. The text has the best authority, *Agob.*, *Rhen.*, *Rig.*: Quantum non valerent, si non fuissent: cum quod . . . . *Gang.*, *Gel.*

2. **sortitum est.** Passive, as *Apol.* 2 'latronibus vestigandis per universas provincias militaris statio sortitur.'

3. **Hic.** 'In this case.' So *Leid.*: Haec *Agob.*, *Rig.*: Sic *reliqui.* Van der Vliet suggests Hâc or Huic.

Chap. II.—4. **denique** = 'ut uno exemplo fungar.' Tertullian constantly uses this word in the sense of 'for instance,' 'in short': e.g. ch. 32 'quae denique cottidie instituuntur'; ch. 37 'quo denique, Marcion, iure'; ch. 39 'denique Hosidius Geta,' &c.; *Apol.* 1, 9, 40; *de bapt.* 10; *ad nat.* i. 5; *de coron.* 3, 10, 11. See also note *ad Scap.* 1.

5. **exitus.** Tertullian uses this word for the 'fall,' 'end,' 'final catastrophe,' or 'destruction.' Here of 'death,' as below, ch. 36 'Ioannis exitu'; *ad Scap.* 3 'exitus quorumdam praesidium'; *adv. Iud.* 10 'Christi exitum'; *de ieiun.* 10; *Scorp.* 4, 15; *ad mart.* 6. In the sense of 'fall,' 'ruin,' *ad Scap.* 3 'exitu Byzantino'; *de res. carn.* 20, 22; *Apol.* 19 frag. 'Iliacum exitum'; *ib.* 21, 50.

erogando. *Erogare* is properly used of 'the disbursement or expenditure of money,' especially from the public treasury; Liv. xxii. 23 (comp. xxxiii. 47); Cicero *or. in vat.* 12; and thence generally of 'spending' or 'consuming.' In Tertullian it is often used of life exhausted or wasted, and = *destruere*, as here; *Apol.* 44, 48; *ad nat.* i. 10; *de spect.* 12; *de anim.* 51. More literally *ad mart.* 4; *Scorp.* 6 where it = *impendere*; and *de idol.* 8 where it = *consumere*: comp. Min. Fel. 35 'ignes Aetnae montis . . . . flagrant, nec erogantur.' The subst. *erogatio* = *abrogatio*, *de idol.* 5 'erogationem legis.'

si expavescimus hoc eas posse; prius est, ut expavescamus hoc eas esse; quae dum sunt, habent posse, et dum possunt, habent esse.

Sed enim febrem ut malum, et de caussa et de potentia sua, ut notum est, abominamur potius quam miramur et, quantum in nobis est, praecavemus, non habentes abolitionem eius in nostra potestate: haereses vero mortem aeternam et maioris ignis ardorem inferentes malunt quidam mirari quod hoc possint, quam devitare ne possint, cum habeant devitandi potestatem. Ceterum nihil valebunt, si illas tantum valere non mirentur. Aut enim dum mirantur, in scandalum subministrantur, aut quia scandalizantur, ideo mirantur quasi quod tantum valeant ex aliqua veniat veritate. Mirum scilicet, ut malum vires suas habeat: nisi quod haereses apud eos multum valeant, qui in fide non valent. In pugna pugilum et gladiatorum plerumque non quia fortis est vincit quis, aut quia non potest vinci, sed quoniam ille qui victus est nullis viribus fuit: adeo idem ille victor, bene valenti postea comparatus, etiam superatus recedit. Non aliter haereses de quorumdam infirmitatibus habent quod valent, nihil valentes, si in bene valentem fidem incurrant.

CAPUT III.

SOLENT quidem isti infirmiores etiam de quibusdam

11. **subministrantur**: 'lay themselves open to': comp. *Apol.* 39 'sua matrimonia amicis patientissime subministrant.'

14. **nisi quod.** Tertullian often uses *nisi quod* pregnantly; 'only there is this point to be noticed': comp. ch. 4 'nisi quod persecutio ...'; and 'nisi' alone, ch. 8.

CHAP. III.—22. **infirmiores.** So *Agob., Rig.*: miriones *rel.*

de quibusdam. The preposition *de* is very variously used by Tertullian, but the exact meaning is generally obtainable from the context. Here it = *propter*, as often in African latin: comp. ch. 7 'melior de tranquillitate'; ch. 17 'de ambiguitate'; *Apol.* 18 'de sententiae communione'; *ib.* 22 'de incolatu aeris'; *adv. Marc.* v. 14. Below 'de ecclesiis' is 'in the case of churches'; ch. 21 'de mendacio,' 'on

personis ab haeresi captis aedificari in ruinam. Quare illa vel ille fidelissimi et prudentissimi et usitatissimi in ecclesia in illam partem transierunt? Quis hoc dicens non ipse sibi respondet neque prudentes neque fideles neque usitatos aestimandos, quos haereses potuerint demutare? Et hoc mirum, opinor, ut probatus aliqui retro postea excidat? Saul, bonus prae ceteris, livore postea evertitur. David, vir bonus secundum cor Domini, postea caedis et stupri reus est. Solomon, omni gratia et sapientia donatus a Domino, ad idololatriam a mulieribus inducitur. Soli enim Dei Filio servabatur sine delicto permanere. Quid ergo, si episcopus, si diaconus, si vidua,

the score of falsehood' (see note); and so ch. 34 'de aetate sola'; *Apol.* 5 'portio Neronis de crudelitate,' 'as regards cruelty.'

Frequently too *de* has an instrumental force: e.g. ch. 7 'de ingenio sapientiae saecularis'; ch. 40 'expositionem delictorum de lavacro'; *Apol.* 1 'de iustitiae diligentia'; *ib.* 9, 11, 23, 50; *de spect.* 25. More often it = *ab*, *ex*: e.g. ch. 21 'de apostolorum traditione'; ch. 22 'de caelo'; chs. 23, 30; *Apol.* 21 'de Deo Deus'; *ib.* 25; *ad Scap.* 2 'de hominibus expellimus.' It is also employed with adjectives to form adverbial expressions: e.g. *Apol.* 23 'de vero,' 'de falso'; *ib.* 27; *de coron.* 7; *de spect.* 2; *de pat.* 5, 7.

1. **aedificari in ruinam.** Note the oxymoron, and comp. the similar ironical use of οἰκοδομέω by S. Paul, 1 Cor. viii. 10.

2. **usitatissimi.** So *Rhen.* (marg.), *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*: vetustissimi *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Vat.*

6. **opinor.** This is a favourite ironical expression in Tertullian: comp. *Apol.* 2, 9, 11, 18, 47; *ad nat.* i. 12. He uses 'plane' similarly ch. 16; *Apol.* 15, 35.

8. **secundum cor Domini.** 1 Sam. xiii. 14.

9. **Solomon.** 1 Kings xi. 1 ff.

11. **sine delicto.** 1 Pet. ii. 22.

12. **si vidua.** The Order of Widows had been instituted in the Apostolic age, 1 Tim. v. 9; and the numerous references to it in sub-apostolic writings shew that it held a position of great importance in the ecclesiastical organization of the second century. Comp. *de pudic.* 13 'prosternis in medium ante viduas, ante presbyteros'; Ignatius, *Smyrn.* 13 (see Lightfoot's note); Polyc. *ad Phil.* 4; Herm. *Vis.* ii. 4; Clem. Hom. xi. 36; Lucian. *de mort. Peregr.* 12. The Order of Widows was quite distinct from that of Deaconesses: see 1 Tim. iii. 11 (deaconesses), v. 9 (church widows); *Apost. Const.* ii. 36; iii. 7. The

si virgo, si doctor, si etiam martyr lapsus a regula fuerit, ideo haereses veritatem videbuntur obtinere? Ex personis probamus fidem, an ex fide personas? Nemo est sapiens, nemo fidelis, nemo maior, nisi Christianus; nemo autem Christianus, nisi qui ad finem usque perseveraverit. Tu, ut homo, extrinsecus unumquemque nosti. Putas quod vides. Vides autem quousque oculos habes. Sed oculi, inquit, Domini alti.

status of these Widows was regarded as one of almost equal sanctity with that of Virgins; Tert. *ad uxor.* i. 4; *de virg. vel.* 10; *de exh. cast.* 1: comp. *de monog.* 2; Renan, *Les Apôt.* p. 123 f. It appears from Tertullian that they sat in a special position in the church; *de virg. vel.* 9 'sed ea auctoritate illic sedet intecta qua et virgo, ad quam sedem praeter annos sexaginta non tantum ... nuptae aliquando eliguntur, sed et matres,' &c.; and this custom gave rise to the technical term (*sedit*) by which the length of a viduate was described: see the inscriptions cited by Martigny, *Dict. des Ant. Chrét.* p. 787.

1. **si virgo.** This mention of virgins in the same category with bishops, deacons, and widows, seems to shew that they were already attaining to a position in the Church akin to an 'Ordo.' Polycarp, *ad Phil.* 4 ff., similarly mentions in succession widows, deacons, virgins, presbyters.

si doctor. In the North African Church 'doctores' were Church officers, whose especial duty was the instruction of the catechumens ('auditores,' 'audientes,' *de paenit.* 6). They might be readers, deacons, or presbyters. Cyprian, *Epist.* 24 'quando cum presbyteris doctoribus lectores diligenter probaremus, Optatum inter lectores doctorem audientium constituimus.' *Pass. S. Perp.* 13 'vidimus ... Optatum episcopum ... et Aspasium presbyterum doctorem.' Dionys. Alex. apud Euseb. *H. E.* vii. 24 *συγκαλέσας τοὺς πρεσβυτέρους καὶ διδασκάλους τῶν ἐν ταῖς κώμαις ἀδελφῶν.*

martyr, i. e. 'confessor': see note *ad mart.* 1.

a regula = 'a fide Catholica': see ch. 13.

3. **nemo fidelis.** So *Agob., Leid., Rhen.*: nisi fidelis *rel.*

4. **nemo maior.** This is explained by Oehler to mean 'Nemo in dignitate aliqua aut honore'; but Wordsworth (*Ch. Hist.* i. 239) conjectured that for 'maior' we should read 'magr̄,' i. e. 'magister.'

5. **qui ad finem.** S. Matt. x. 22.

7. **inquit,** sc. 'Scriptura,' or 'instrumentum.' The citation is not found *totidem verbis,* but Tertullian has been thought to refer to 4 Esdras viii. 20: cp. Ierem. xvi. 17; xxxii. 19. It is Tertullian's habit to quote Scripture very loosely, either giving the sense or weaving together several texts. For examples, see a little below; and again

Homo in faciem, Deus in praecordia contemplatur. Et ideo contemplatur et ideo cognoscit Dominus qui sunt eius, et plantam quam non plantavit, eradicat, et de primis novissimos ostendit, et ventilabrum in manu portat ad purgandum aream suam.

Avolent quantum volunt paleae levis fidei quocumque adflatu temptationum, eo purior massa frumenti in horrea Domini reponetur. Nonne ab ipso Domino quidam discentium scandalizati diverterunt? Nec tamen propterea ceteri quoque discedendum a vestigiis eius putaverunt, sed qui scierunt illum vitae esse Verbum, et a Deo venisse, perseveraverunt in comitatu eius usque ad finem, cum illis, si vellent et ipsi discedere, placide obtulisset. Minus est si et apostolum eius aliqui, Phygelus, et Hermogenes, et Philetus, et Hymenaeus reliquerunt; ipse traditor Christi de apostolis fuit. Miramur de ecclesiis eius, si a quibusdam deseruntur, cum ea nos ostendunt Christianos, quae patimur ad exemplum ipsius Christi. Ex nobis, inquit, prodierunt, sed non fuerunt ex nobis: si fuissent ex nobis, permansissent utique nobiscum.

ch. 7 (Coloss. ii. 8); ch. 8 (S. Luke xvi. 29; S. John xvi. 24); ch. 11; *Apol.* 33; and for other instances of untraceable quotations, Kaye, p. 300. On the relation of Tertullian's citations to the Old Latin Version see Westcott, *Canon*, p. 255.

1. Homo, &c. 1 Kings xvi. 7.

2. cognoscit, &c. 2 Tim. ii. 19.

3. plantam, &c. S. Matt. xv. 13.

8. discentium, i. e. 'discipulorum': so again chs. 20, 22, 30, et saepe; *de spect.* 30; *de bapt.* 9, 11; *de carn. Chr.* 6; *de pat.* 3. Cyprian, *Epist.* 68 'surrexit Petrus in medio discentium.' Similarly the part. 'audientes' is used substantivally and interchangeably with 'auditores,' *de paenit.* 6, &c.

13. placide obtulisset, 'calmly put before them the test question whether they too were willing to go away.' S. John vi. 67.

Minus est si. A common form of expression with Tertullian. Comp. *Apol.* 6 'parum est si'; *ib.* 21 'multum est si'; *de idol.* 7. 'It is a matter of less moment if ...' The ἀποστροφή of the Apostle by a follower (2 Tim. i. 15, ii. 17) was of slight importance compared with the παράδοσις of the Saviour by an Apostle.

18. inquit, sc. 'apostolus.' 1 John ii. 19.

CAPUT IV.

QUIN potius memores simus tam dominicarum pronuntiationum quam apostolicarum litterarum, quae nobis et futuras haereses praenuntiaverunt et fugiendas praefinierunt, et sicut esse illas non expavescimus, ita et posse id, propter quod effugiendae sunt, non miremur. Instruit Dominus multos esse venturos sub pellibus ovium rapaces lupos. Quaenam istae sunt pelles ovium, nisi nominis Christiani extrinsecus superficies? Qui lupi rapaces, nisi sensus et spiritus subdoli, ad infestandum gregem Christi intrinsecus delitescentes? Qui pseudoprophetae sunt, nisi falsi praedicatores? Qui pseudoapostoli, nisi adulteri evangelizatores? Qui antichristi interim et semper, nisi Christi rebelles? Hoc sunt haereses non minus doctrinarum perversitate ecclesiam lacessentes, quam tunc antichristus persecutionum atrocitate persequetur: nisi quod persecutio et martyras facit, haeresis apostatas tantum. Et ideo haereses quoque oportebat esse, ut probabiles quique manifestarentur, tam qui in persecutionibus steterint, quam qui ad haereses non

CHAP. IV.—8. **superficies.** 'The outward profession': so *Apol.* 46; but Tertullian uses this word with considerable latitude of meaning: e. g. *Apol.* 16; *ad nat.* i. 11 = 'caput'; *de cult. fem.* ii. 1, 23 = 'an upper garment'; *adv. Val.* 24 = 'covering.'

11. **adulteri evangelizatores,** 'spurious evangelizers'; *adulter* as an adjective often bears this passive sense of 'counterfeit,' 'false': see Cyprian, *Epist.* 45 'adulterum et contrarium caput extra ecclesiam fecit' (of a schismatic bishop): so of coin, *Cod. Theodos.* ix. 22. 1; Apul. *Metam.* x. 9; and of legends, Arnob. v. 36. Comp. below, ch. 6 'adulterae doctrinae'; ch. 17 'adulter sensus' of a false exegesis.

12. **interim,** 'hitherto,' 'now': comp. note, ch. 20.

13. **Hoc,** i. e. 'Hoc tempore,' opposed to 'tunc.'

15. **nisi,** 'only there is this difference': see note, ch. 2.

martyras. Tertullian often prefers to retain and transliterate Greek inflexions in words derived from the Greek: e. g. 'haeresin,' below; 'agapen,' *ad mart.* 2; 'eremo,' *de idol.* 5.

exorbitaverint. Neque enim eos probabiles intelligi iuvat qui in haeresin fidem demutant: sicut ex diverso sibi interpretantur quia dixerit alibi Omnia examinate, quod bonum est tenete. Quasi non liceat omnibus male examinatis in electionem alicuius mali impingere per errorem.

CAPUT V.

PORRO, si dissensiones et schismata increpat, quae sine dubio mala sunt, et in continenti haereses subiungit. Quod malis adiungat, malum utique profitetur, et quidem maius, cum ideo credidisse se dicat de schismatibus et dissensionibus, quia sciret etiam haereses oportere esse. Ostendit enim gravioris mali conspectu de levioribus se facile credidisse, certe non ut ideo de malis crediderit, quia haereses bonae essent, sed uti de peioris quoque notae temptationibus praemoneret, non esse mirandum, quas diceret tendere ad probabiles quosque manifestandos, scilicet quos non potuerint depravare. Denique si totum capitulum ad unitatem continendam et separationes coercendas sapit, haereses vero non minus ab unitate divellunt, quam schismata et dissensiones; sine dubio et haereses in ea condicione reprehensionis con-

1. **exorbitaverint.** This is a favourite word of Tertullian's, and appropriately expresses the desertion of the defined path of safety for the trackless mazes of heresy. [*Orbita* = 'a wheel-rut'; *exorbitare* = 'to stray from the right course.'] *Adv. Marc.* iii. 2 'suspectum habebitur omne quod exorbitavit'; *de pud.* 8 'a vero lumine exorbitant': comp. Irenaeus, v. 20. 1 'haeretici, quoniam sint caeci ad veritatem, alteram et alteram ambulare exorbitantes viam.' Sidon. Apol. *Epist.* viii. 11 'a catholicae fidei regulis exorbitare.' Occasionally the verb is used actively, Sidon. Apol. *Epist.* v. 16; Tert. *Apol.* 9. For other instances of the word, see ch. 44, *Apol.* 6, 16, 20; *ad nat.* i. 13, ii. 2; *de pall.* 5: and for the subst. 'exorbitatio,' *de idol.* 8, 10; *adv. Marc.* i. 29; *de anim.* 24.

iuvat, sc. 'apostolum.' *Rig.* iubet.

5. **impingere.** This intransitive use of *impingere* is not classical. Tertullian employs it as = *incurrere*: comp. ch. 30; *Apol.* 3 'in odium eius impingunt'; *ib.* 'caecitate odii in suffragium impingunt'; *adv. Marc.* iii. 11. Elsewhere transitively, *adv. Marc.* iv. 7, v. 16, &c.

stituit, in qua et schismata et dissensiones: ac per hoc non eos probabiles facit qui in haereses diverterint, cum maxime diverti ab eiusmodi obiurget, edocens unum omnes loqui et idipsum sapere, quod etiam haereses non sinunt.

CAPUT VI.

NEC diutius de isto, si idem est Paulus, qui et alibi haereses inter carnalia crimina numerat, scribens ad Galatas; et qui Tito suggerit, hominem haereticum post primam correptionem recusandum, quod perversus sit eiusmodi et delinquat, ut a semetipso damnatus. Sed et in omni paene epistula de adulterinis doctrinis fugiendis inculcans, haereses taxat. Quarum opera sunt adulterae doctrinae, haereses dictae graeca voce ex interpretatione electionis, qua quis

CHAP. V.—3. **ab eiusmodi.** Tertullian uses this word and 'huiusmodi' like substantives, constructing them with prepositions and verbs. Comp. *ad Scap.* 4; *de test. an.* 6; *de spect.* 26; *de ieiun.* 7; *de exh. cast.* 1; *de pat.* 9; *de pud.* 20; *de idol.* 13, 14, 15, 21; *de orat.* 15; *Apol.* 49.

CHAP. VI.—5. **Paulus.** Gal. v. 20; Titus iii. 10.

7. **suggerit.** *Suggerere* is not uncommonly used by Tertullian in this sense; *Apol.* 25, 27, 33; *ad Scap.* 4; and the subst. *suggestus*, *Apol.* 18 (see note); *de res. carn.* 40, 46: comp. *ad mart.* 1 'dictata suggesta.'

post primam correptionem. *Correptio* recurs in this sense below, ch. 16; *de pud.* 14; Iren. iv. 42. 2; Cyprian, *Epist.* 59; *Test. adv. Iud.* iii. 78. The Latin version of the New Testament used by Tertullian omitted the words 'et alteram': comp. Cyprian, *ad Quir.* 3, 78; *Epist.* 59; Ps.-Ambros. *in Tit.* iii. 10. Irenaeus, on the other hand, read *μετὰ μίαν καὶ δευτέραν*, with which the Syriac version known to him also agreed. His translator wavers, following the Greek text i. 9. 3, and departing from it iii. 3. 4.

12. **graeca voce.** *Αἵρεσις.* Tertullian defines the essential spirit of heresy, and explains it (1) etymologically as 'self-willed choice' in contrast with the receptive docility of the Catholic temper; (2) practically, as the wilful invention or espousal of erroneous teaching contrary to the tradition handed down by the Apostles and Apostolic Churches from Christ. Comp. chs. 14, 37; *Apol.* 47. See Gore, *Christ. Ministry*, p. 18. In *adv. Marc.* ii. 2 'electio' and 'haeresis' are practically synonymous.

sive ad instituendas, sive ad suscipiendas eas utitur. Ideo et sibi damnatum dixit haereticum, quia et in quo damnatur sibi elegit. Nobis vero nihil ex nostro arbitrio indulgere licet, sed nec eligere quod aliquis de arbitrio suo induxerit. Apostolos Domini habemus auctores, qui nec ipsi quicquam ex suo arbitrio, quod inducerent, elegerunt; sed acceptam a Christo disciplinam fideliter nationibus assignaverunt. Itaque etiamsi angelus de caelis aliter evangelizaret, anathema diceretur a nobis. Providerat iam tunc Spiritus Sanctus futurum in virgine quadam Philumene angelum

3. **indulgere**: inducere *Pam.*, *Rig.*, and so Isidor. *Orig.* viii. 3. 2 and Hraban-Maur, *de inst cler.* ii. 58, in their transcriptions of this passage.

7. **disciplinam**: 'the teaching,' 'rule of faith,' or 'system of doctrines.' The word *disciplina* has various significations in ecclesiastical Latin. Originally referring to military discipline, it came to be applied to 'good conduct and propriety,' so *Apol.* 6, 35; or, agreeably with its derivation from *disco*, to a particular 'school of thought,' *Apol.* 3; *de res. carn.* 6; to a system of ethics, *Apol.* 46; to a system of doctrines, and especially the Christian rule of faith and practice, or to the religion of Christ absolutely, as here and chs. 19, 35; *Apol.* 7, 18, 30, 39; *ad Scap.* 1; *de spect.* 1, 3, 15; *de idol.* 14, 20, 21; and this is a very general use.

It also signifies what we mean by 'ecclesiastical discipline': see below, ch. 41; *de orat.* 19; and is applicable generally to any strict rule of life: e.g. ch. 43; *de spect.* 1; *Apol.* 2, 18; *adv. Val.* 1; *ad Scap.* 2 (patience); *de cor.* 11 (camp-life); Cyprian, *de hab. virg.* 1 (celibacy). In later times it denoted the monastic life as being '*the* rule' *par excellence*; and from this signification it was an easy step to transfer it to the 'penalties' which enforced the rule; and finally to the 'instrument of castigation' itself. (Woodham's *Tertullian's Apology*, p. 18.)

8. **angelus.** Gal. i. 8. Hieronym. *in Epist. Gal.* ii 'Eleganter vir doctissimus Tertullianus adversus Apellem et eius virginem Philumenen, quam angelus quidam diabolici spiritus et perversus impleverat, hunc esse scribit, angelum cui multo antequam Apelles nasceretur Spiritus Sancti vaticinio sit anathema per apostolum prophetatum.'

10. **Philumene.** A virgin to whom Apelles attached himself, believing her to be prophetically inspired by an angel and endowed with miraculous powers. Her utterances were the source of several of his heretical tenets, and he wrote a book of 'Revelations' at her dictation. See ch. 30; *de carn. Chr.* 6 'Apelles, qui, posteaquam a

seductionis, transfigurantem se in angelum lucis, cuius signis et praestigiis Apelles inductus, novam haeresin induxit.

CAPUT VII.

HAE sunt doctrinae hominum et daemoniorum, prurientibus auribus natae de ingenio sapientiae saecularis, quam Dominus stultitiam vocans, stulta mundi in confusionem

disciplina Marcionis in mulierem carne lapsus, dehinc in virginem Philumenen spiritu eversus est'; *adv. Marc.* iii. 11 'nam et Philumene illa magis persuasit Apelli ceterisque desertoribus Marcionis, ex fide quidem Christum circumtulisse carnem, nullius tamen nativitatis, utpote de elementis eam mutuatum'; *de anim.* 36 'Apelles . . . haereticus ante corpora constituens animas viriles ac muliebres sicut ab Philumene didicit, utique carnem ut posteriorem ab anima facit accipere sexum.' Comp. Euseb. *H. E.* v. 13 (quoting Rhodon, a younger contemporary of Tert. and opponent of Marcion) Ἀπελλῆς . . . *μίαν ἀρχὴν ὁμολογεῖ, τὰς δὲ προφητείας ἐξ ἀντικειμένου λέγει πνεύματος, πειθόμενος ἀποφθέγμασι παρθένου δαιμονώσης, ὄνομα Φιλουμένης.* Hippol. *adv. haer.* x. 20; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6.

angelum seductionis. The evil spirit to whose power Tertullian ascribes her miracles and legerdemain. Philumena appears to have been a clairvoyante. Bunsen, *Hippolytus*, i. 379.

1. **transfigurantem.** 2 Cor. xi. 14.

2. **Apelles.** The most famous of Marcion's disciples, born early in the second century, being an old man when Rhodon conversed with him: Euseb. *H. E.* v. 13. The charge of immorality brought against him (ch. 30; *de carn. Chr.* 6) by Tertullian was no doubt a baseless slander. Apelles rejected the dualism which was Marcion's fundamental principle, and completely subordinated the world-creator to the Supreme God. Like his master, however, he regarded the Old Testament as anti-Christian, and excised many parts of the New Testament. He seems also to have dissociated good works from right faith. See further chs. 30, 33 f.; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6; Hippol. vii. 38; x. 16; Rhodon apud Euseb. *H. E.* v. 13. Tertullian wrote a tract against Apelles (*de carn. Chr.* 8) which is no longer extant, but which Harnack has attempted to reconstruct from fragments and quotations; *De Apellis Gnosis Monarchia*, Lips. 1874.

CHAP. VII.—3. **doctrinae . . . daemoniorum.** 1 Tim. iv. 1.
prurientibus auribus. 2 Tim. iv. 3.

4. **de ingenio.** On the instrumental force of *de*, see note, ch. 3.
sapientiae saecularis. 1 Cor. i. 27; iii. 19.

etiam philosophiae ipsius elegit. Ea est enim materia sapientiae saecularis, temeraria interpres divinae naturae et dispositionis. Ipsae denique haereses a philosophia subornantur. Inde aeones, et formae nescio quae infinitae, et trinitas hominis apud Valentinum; Platonicus fuerat. Inde Marcionis deus melior de tranquillitate; a Stoicis venerat. Et ut anima interire dicatur, ab Epicureis obser-

1. **materia.** Heumann, *Acta erud.*, conjectured 'mater.'

4. **subornantur**: 'are equipped.' Comp. *Apol.* 47 'ex horum [philosophorum] semine et nostram hanc novitiolam paraturam viri quidam suis opinionibus ad philosophicas sententias adulteraverunt, et de una via obliquos multos tramites et inexplicabiles sciderunt'; *adv. Herm.* 8 'haereticorum patriarchae philosophi.'

aeones et formae. On the 'aeones et formae infinitae' of Valentinus, see below, ch. 33; *adv. Val.* 8; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 4; Iren. i. 5 ff.

5. **trinitas hominis.** For the 'trinitas Valentiniana' (*de anim.* 21), see *adv. Val.* 26, where the discussion of the three natures of man—*materialis, animalis, spiritalis*—is based upon Iren. i. 1. 11.

Platonicus. So again ch. 30; *de carn. Chr.* 20 'apostatae et haeretici et Platonici Valentini'; *de anim.* 18, 23.

6. **Marcionis deus melior**, i. e. not the Creator, the 'just' God, in Marcion's system, but the 'deus solius bonitatis,' ch. 34. Marcion denied the unity of the First Principle, and postulated two ἀρχαί or ruling powers. These were a Supreme God of pure benevolence who was unknown to man until revealed by Christ; and a just or severe God, the Creator of the visible universe, the God of the Old Testament. Comp. *adv. Marc.* i. 2; Iren. i. 25; Hippol. *adv. haer.* x. 19; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6 (see note).

de tranquillitate. On *de* = *propter*, see note, ch. 3.

a Stoicis. So again ch. 30; but the idea more nearly approaches the gods of Epicurus than of the Stoics: comp. Theoph. *ad Aut.* ii. 4. Tertullian confuses the Stoics and Epicureans, *Apol.* 47. 'De tranquillitate,' however, is used here in contrast to the mundane activity of the Creator, since Marcion's 'higher God' neither concerned himself with mankind nor was known to them. Neander (*Anti-gnost.*, Bohn, ii. 433) remarks upon the strange error of tracing Marcion's notion of the good God back to the Stoic ἀπάθεια.

7. **ut anima interire dicatur.** The peculiar heresy of Marcion's disciple Lucanus; *de res. carn.* 2 'Lucanus, nec huic quidem substantiae [i. e. 'animae'] parcens, quam secundum Aristotelem dissolvens aliud

vatur. Et ut carnis restitutio negetur, de una omnium philosophorum schola sumitur. Et ubi materia cum Deo aequatur, Zenonis disciplina est: et ubi aliquid de igneo deo allegatur, Heracletus intervenit. Eadem materia apud haereticos et philosophos volutatur, idem retractatus implicantur: unde malum et quare? et unde homo, et quomodo? et, quod proxime Valentinus proposuit, unde Deus? scilicet de enthymesi et ectromate.

quid pro eo subicit, tertium quidam resurrecturus, neque anima neque caro, id est non homo sed ursus qua Lucanus.' Comp. Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6; Philast. 46; Epiphan. *Haer.* xliii; Orig. *c. Cels.* ii. 27; Hippol. vii. 37.

ab Epicureis: comp. *de res. carn.* 1 'nihil esse post mortem Epicuri schola est.'

2. **sumitur.** The resurrection of the flesh was of all Christian doctrines the one most derided by pagan philosophers: *Apol.* 48; *de res. carn.* 1: comp. August. *de civ. Dei* xxii. 20; *in Ps.* 88. 2.

3. **Zenonis disciplina.** Diog. Laert. vii. 148 *οὐσίαν δὲ θεοῦ Ζήνων μέν φησι τὸν ὅλον κόσμον, καὶ τὸν οὐρανόν.* The eternity of matter was a tenet of Hermogenes, *adv. Herm.* 4.

4. **Heracletus**: comp. *Apol.* 47; Diog. Laert. ix. 7 *ἐκ πυρὸς τὰ πάντα συνεστάναι καὶ εἰς τοῦτο ἀναλύεσθαι*; and of Plato, *ib.* iii. 74 *θεοὺς μὲν οὖν ἔχειν τὸ πολὺ πορίνους.* Tertullian refers to the fiery god or angel, the Creator and Old Test. deity of Apelles' system. See ch. 34; *de carn. Chr.* 8; *de anim.* 23; Ps-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6. Apelles' notion was no doubt derived from the angel in the fiery bush, Exod. iii. 2.

5. **retractatus**, 'the same subjects of consideration are involved.' *Retractatus* is a word almost peculiar to Tertullian, who uses it in the sense of 'consideration' or 'reconsideration.' *Apol.* 4, 11; *de spect.* 11; *de res. carn.* 2; *adv. Prax.* 2, 11; *adv. Herm.* 33.

8. **de enthymesi.** Ἐνθύμησις was the 'Animatio' or 'desire' of the ἄνω Σοφία in the Valentinian system, and, being a formless abortion, ἔκτρωμα, was driven forth from the Pleroma. Having at length been endowed with form (*μόρφωσις κατ' οὐσίαν*) by the pity of the ἄνω Χριστός, her emotions on failing to gain admission to the Pleroma gave birth to various kinds of existences, from one of which came the Demiurge, the God of mankind. See ch. 34; *adv. Val.* 9 ff.; Iren. i. 1. 2 ff.; Hippol. vi. 31; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 4.

ectromate. Hieronym. *Comment. in Amos.* iii. 9 ff. 'Samaria refertur ad haereticos qui custodes mandatorum Dei esse se mentiuntur . . . dum unusquisque fingit quod voluerit et adorat figmentum suum,

Miserum Aristotelem! qui illis dialecticam instituit, artificem struendi et destruendi, versipellem in sententiis, coactam in coniecturis, duram in argumentis, operariam contentionum, molestam etiam sibi ipsi, omnia retractantem, ne quid omnino tractaverit.

Hinc illae fabulae et genealogiae interminabiles, et quaestiones infructuosae, et sermones serpentes velut cancer; a quibus nos apostolus refrenans nominatim philosophiam contestatur caveri oportere, scribens ad Colossenses: Videte ne qui sit circumveniens vos per philosophiam et inanem seductionem, secundum traditionem hominum, praeter providentiam Spiritus Sancti. Fuerat Athenis, et istam sapientiam humanam, affectatricem et interpolatricem veritatis, de congressibus noverat, ipsam quoque in suas haereses multipartitam varietate sectarum invicem repugnantium.

Quid ergo Athenis et Hierosolymis? quid academiae et

ut Marcion bonum deum et otiosum, ut Valentinus *αἰῶνας* triginta et extremum Christum quem appellat *ἔκτρωμα*, id est, abortivum, ut Basilides qui omnipotentem Deum portentoso nomine appellat *ἄβραξας*.'

6. **genealogiae interminabiles.** 1 Tim. i. 4; Titus iii. 9; 2 Tim. ii. 17, 23: comp. ch. 33; *adv. Val.* 3.

9. **ad Colossenses.** Coloss. ii. 8.

14. **congressibus,** 'argumentative encounters': so again ch. 18 'scripturarum congressum'; *de carn. Chr.* 21; *de res. carn.* 55: it is used of judicial contests, Quint. iii. 6. 4. The verb and the allied subst. *congressio* frequently bear this sense: e.g. chs. 15, 26; *Apol.* 25, 46; *de test. an.* 4.

16. **Quid ergo Athenis et Hieros.**: comp. *Apol.* 46. Such passages as these characteristically mark the attitude of isolation into which the Carthaginian school of apologists forced Christianity as regards the main streams of human thought in the past. The rigid divorce here insisted on between the Church's creed and pagan philosophy may of course be strictly and rightly maintained from one point of view; but the narrowness of vision which made this point of view the central, if not the only one, to the exclusion of any larger and more sympathetic insight into the value of non-Christian systems, contrasts unfavourably with the wiser and more comprehensive spirit of the Alexandrian apologists.

ecclesiae? quid haereticis et Christianis? Nostra institutio de porticu Solomonis est, qui et ipse tradiderat Dominum in simplicitate cordis esse quaerendum. Viderint qui Stoicum et Platonicum et dialecticum Christianismum protulerunt. Nobis curiositate opus non est post Christum Iesum, nec inquisitione post evangelium. Cum credimus, nihil desideramus ultra credere. Hoc enim prius credimus, non esse quod ultra credere debeamus.

CAPUT VIII.

VENIO itaque ad illum articulum quem et nostri praetendunt ad ineundam curiositatem, et haeretici inculcant ad importandam scrupulositatem. Scriptum est, inquiunt,

1. **quid haereticis et Christianis?** Tertullian denies the name of Christian to heretics, ch. 14 'cum autem nondum crediderunt, non sunt Christiani': cp. chs. 16, 37.

2. **de porticu Solomonis** = 'de Christo et apostolis.' S. John x. 23; Acts iii. 2, v. 12. The implied contrast is the Porch of Zeno.

in simplicitate. Wisdom i. 1.

3. **Viderint.** This elliptical expression is of very frequent occurrence in Tertullian: e.g. *ad Scap.* 4; *de cor.* 2, 13; *de test. an.* 1; *de spect.* 7, 15; *de idol.* 7, 11; *adv. Val.* 9; *Pass. S. Perpet.* 1. It may often be idiomatically rendered, as here and ch. 11, 'Away with . . . !' or, as *Apol.* 16, 25, 43 'No matter that . . .': comp. Min. Fel. 38; Cyprian. *de hab. virg.* 3; Cicero, *epist. ad Att.* xii. 21. 1.

5. **curiositate.** A rare word (found however in Cicero, Gellius, and Macrobius), the significations of which vary as greatly as those of its English derivative. Here it means 'inquisitive speculation,' 'curious inquiry,' and so chs. 14, 30, 43. In ch. 40 it denotes 'fantastic quaintness'; *Apol.* 18 'rarity,' 'curiousness'; *ib.* 25 'superstitious assiduity,' and so *de test. an.* 1; but *Apol.* 47 'meddlesome fancy.'

CHAP. VIII.—9. **articulum.** Properly in rhetoric *articulus* = 'a simple sentence,' Cornif. iv. 26; here more generally, 'a clause,' as in *Digest* xxxvi. 1. 27; or better still, 'the cardinal point,' 'the test question,' as in Arnob. vii. 39 'ventum est ergo . . . ad ipsum articulum caussae, ventum rei ad cardinem, ventum veram atque adiunctissimam quaestionem.' Below, ch. 10 'in tribus articulis' = 'in three points, or divisions.'

11. **scrupulositatem.** This use of *scrupulositas* corresponds with

Quaerite, et invenietis. Quando hanc vocem Dominus emisit, recordemur. Puto in primitiis ipsis doctrinae suae, cum adhuc dubitaretur apud omnes, an Christus esset; cum adhuc nec Petrus illum Dei Filium pronuntiasset; cum etiam Ioannes de illo certus esse desisset. Merito ergo tunc dictum est, Quaerite et invenietis, quando quaerendus adhuc erat qui adhuc agnitus non erat.

Et hoc quantum ad Iudaeos. Ad illos enim pertinet totus sermo suggillationis istius, qui habebant ubi quaererent Christum. Habent, inquit, Moysen et Heliam, id est legem et prophetas Christum praedicantes: secundum quod et alibi aperte, Scrutamini scripturas, in quibus salutem speratis, illae enim de me loquuntur. Hoc erit, Quaerite et invenietis.

Nam et sequentia in Iudaeos competere manifestum est, Pulsate et aperietur vobis. Iudaei retro penes Deum fuerant, dehinc eiecti ob delicta, extra Deum esse coeperunt.

that in *Apol.* 47, where it refers to that restless spirit of the philosophers which introduced doubts, hesitancies, and uncertainties into every subject with which they concerned themselves. The same habit of the heretics is described by the same word below in ch. 27.

Scriptum est. S. Matt. vii. 7; S. Luke xi. 9,

2. **primitiis**, lit. 'first-fruits'; but here = 'principiis,' as in Apul. *Metam.* x. 12; xi. 23.

4. **Petrus.** S. Matt. xvi. 16.

5. **Ioannes.** S. Matt. xi. 2; S. Luke xii. 18 f.: comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 18; *de bapt.* 10: and for other patristic interpretations of S. John's question see Orig. *Hom.* 27 *in Luc.*, Chrysostom, Hilary, Augustine, Jerome *in Matt. l. c.*; and Ambros. *de fid.* iv. 1. 4; these passages are collected in *Libr. Fath.* ad loc.

9. **suggillationis**, lit. 'a black and blue bruise'; hence 'an insult,' 'taunt,' 'reproach,' or as here 'stern admonition': see *Apol.* 11; *de carn. Chr.* 24; *de res. carn.* 16; and for the verb 'suggillare' as a strong substitute for 'notare,' 'to brand with censure,' 'ridicule,' see below, chs. 23, 33; *Apol.* 4, 59; *adv. Val.* 6; *adv. Marc.* iv. 34.

10. **Moysen et Heliam.** S. Luke xvi. 29. An instance of careless quotation. For the idea, comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 34.

12. **Scrutamini.** S. John v. 39.

16. **Pulsate et aperietur vobis.** S. Matt. vii. 7.

Nationes vero nunquam penes Deum, nisi stillicidium de situla, et pulvis ex area et foris semper. Ita qui foris semper, quomodo pulsabit eo, ubi nunquam fuit? quam ianuam novit, in qua nec receptus, nec eiectus aliquando? an qui scit se intus fuisse et foras actum, is potius pulsavit, et ostium novit?

Etiam Petite et accipietis ei competit, qui sciebat a quo esset petendum, a quo et erat aliquid repromissum, a Deo scilicet Abraham, Isaac et Iacob, quem nationes non magis noverant quam ullam repromissionem eius. Et ideo ad Israël loquebatur: Non sum, inquit, missus, nisi ad oves perditas domus Israël. Nondum canibus iactarat panem filiorum: nondum in viam nationum ire mandabat. Si quidem in fine praecepit, vaderent ad docendas et tingendas nationes; consecuturi mox Spiritum Sanctum Paracletum, qui illos deducturus esset in omnem veritatem. Et hoc ergo

1. **nisi.** See note, ch. 2.

stillicidium, i. e. 'stilla,' 'gutta'; comp. *de spect.* 27 'stillicidia mellis'; *ad. nat.* ii. 2 'de stillicidio . . . veritatis.' Isa. xl. 15 'Ecce gentes quasi stilla situlae, et quasi momentum staterae reputatae sunt: ecce insulae quasi pulvis exiguus' (Vulg.).

2. **Ita qui.** *Agob.*, I . . . qui: Itaque *Leid.*, *Rhen.*: Itaque qui *rel.*

5. **an** = annon.

7. **Petite et accipietis.** S. John xvi. 24. Tertullian frequently confuses this verse with Matt. vii. 7 (Luke xi. 9), which he evidently meant to quote here. See *de bapt.* 20; *de orat.* 10; *Pass. S. Perp.* 19 (Robinson's ed., pp. 49, 88).

10. **ad Israël.** S. Matt. xv. 24 f.; x. 5; xxviii. 19.

14. **tingendas,** i. e. 'baptizandas.' This technical sense frequently attaches to *tingere*: chs. 20, 29, 40; *de res. carn.* 47 (quoting Rom. vi. 3); *adv. Prax.* 26; *de bapt.* passim.

15. **Paracletum.** S. John xvi. 13.

16. **deducturus esset.** 'Deductor (= καθηγητής) is a common epithet of the Holy Spirit in Tertullian's writings: e. g. *de fug.* 1 'Paracletum deductorem omnis veritatis: *ib.* 14; *de cor.* 4; *adv. Prax.* 2; but *Apol.* 21, of the Son of God, 'Illuminator atque Deductor generis humani.'

ergo illo. So *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Rig.*: erga illos *Rhen. emend.* Heumann would emend 'Et hoc erga illos si vacat qui nationibus. . . .'

illo facit. Quod si nationibus destinati doctores apostoli, ipsi quoque doctorem consecuturi erant Paracletum, multo magis vacabat erga nos, Quaerite et invenietis: quibus ultro erat obventura doctrina per apostolos, et ipsis apostolis per Spiritum Sanctum. Omnia quidem Domini dicta omnibus posita sunt, quae per aures Iudaeorum ad nos transierunt. Sed pleraque in personas directa, non proprietatem admonitionis nobis constituerunt, sed exemplum.

CAPUT IX.

CEDO nunc sponte de gradu isto. Omnibus dictum sit, Quaerite et invenietis; tamen et hic expetit sensus certare cum interpretationis gubernaculo. Nulla vox divina ita dissoluta est et diffusa, ut verba tantum defendantur, et ratio verborum non constituatur.

2. **multo magis vacabat,** 'much more was this admonition, "Seek and ye shall find," superfluous for us.'

7. **in personas,** 'against particular classes of persons,' like the Jews or various Jewish sects.

CHAP. IX.—9. **Cedo . . . de gradu.** The metaphor is that of the arena, 'gradus' being the position or ground occupied by each combatant; comp. ch. 15 'gradum obstruimus'; *Apol.* 27; *de virg. vel.* 15; *de res. carn.* 2, 48; *adv. Marc.* i. 1 'alius libellus hunc gradum sustinebit adversus haereticos; iv. 6 'gradum alium inire'; *Scorp.* 8 'gradum insistimus.'

10. **expetit,** 'one desires to determine the sense in accordance with a true canon of interpretation.' Comp. *Iren.* ii. 46; iii. 38. 2. 'Gubernaculo' is like 'disciplina rationis' below, 'the strict rule of reason' or 'the teaching of the real drift of the words.' Tertullian plainly rejects a narrow literalism in the interpretation of Scripture, and in his censure of the neglect of the context he is followed by Cyprian, *de unit. eccl.* 12 'Corruptores evangelii atque interpretes falsi extrema ponunt et superiora pretereunt partis memores et partem subdole comprimentes; ut ipsi ab ecclesia scissi sunt, ita capituli unius sententiam scindunt.'

12. **defendantur,** 'are to be brought forward in argument,' a Ciceronian use of *defendere*.

ratio verborum, 'the true purport or drift of the words.' *Ratio* is the principle underlying the letter of an expression.

Sed in primis hoc propono: unum itaque et certum aliquid institutum esse a Christo, quod credere omnimodo debeant nationes, et idcirco quaerere, ut possint, cum invenerint credere. Unius porro et certi instituti infinita inquisitio non potest esse: quaerendum est donec invenias, et credendum ubi inveneris; et nihil amplius, nisi custodiendum quod credidisti, dum hoc insuper credas, aliud non esse credendum, ideoque nec requirendum, cum id inveneris et credideris, quod ab eo institutum est, qui non aliud tibi mandat inquirendum, quam quod instituit.

De hoc quidem si quis dubitat, constabit penes nos esse id, quod a Christo institutum est. Interim ex fiducia probationis praevenio admonens quosdam, nihil esse quaerendum ultra quae crediderunt id esse quod quaerere debuerunt: ne, Quaerite et invenietis, sine disciplina rationis interpretentur.

CAPUT X.

RATIO autem dicti huius in tribus articulis constitit: in re, in tempore, in modo. In re, ut quid sit quaerendum consideres: in tempore, ut quando: in modo, ut quousque. Igitur quaerendum est quod Christus instituit, utique quamdiu non invenis, utique donec invenias. Invenisti autem cum credidisti. Nam non credidisses, si non invenisses; sicut nec quaesisses, nisi ut invenires. Ad hoc ergo quaerens, ut invenias, et ad hoc inveniens ut credas. Omnem prolationem quaerendi et inveniendi credendo fixisti. Hunc tibi modum statuit fructus ipse quaerendi. Hanc tibi fossam determi-

4. porro. Like atquin,' 'atenim,' ἀλλὰ γάρ, 'but surely': comp. *Apol.* 9, 23, 25, 37; *ad nat.* i. 2, 3, 4, 8; ii. 2, 3, 4, 5.

12. Interim. See note, ch. 20.

15. sine disciplina rationis, 'without strict regard to the real purport of the injunction.'

CHAP. X.—17. articulis. See note, ch. 8.

26. fossam, 'terminus, limit.' A figure of speech borrowed from camp-life: *fossa* answers to the *vallum* beyond which the soldiers were not allowed to pass.

navit ipse, qui te non vult aliud credere, quam quod instituit, ideoque nec quaerere.

Ceterum si, quia et alia tanta ab aliis sunt instituta, propterea in tantum quaerere debemus in quantum possumus invenire, semper quaerimus, et nunquam omnino credimus. Ubi enim erit finis quaerendi? ubi statio credendi? ubi expunctio inveniendi? Apud Marcionem? sed et Valentinus proponit, Quaerite et invenietis. Apud Valentinum? sed et Apelles hac me pronuntiatione pulsabit, et Hebion, et Simon, et omnes ex ordine non habent aliud quo se mihi insinuantes me sibi addicant. Ero itaque nusquam, dum ubique convenio, Quaerite et invenietis, et velut si nusquam; quasi qui nunquam apprehenderim illud, quod Christus instituit, quod quaeri oportet, quod credi necesse est.

CAPUT XI.

IMPUNE erratur, nisi delinquatur, quamvis et errare delinquere est: impune, inquam, vagatur, qui nihil deserit. At

3. **tanta,** for 'tot,' as very frequently in African writers. *Apol.* 1, 40, 50; *adv. Marc.* ii. 5; *de idol.* 6, 8; *de spect.* 29; *ad Scap.* 4, 5; *de anim.* 30; Apul. *Metam.* vii. 9. So 'quanti' for 'quot,' *ad Scap.* 4, 5; *adv. Marc.* i. 7.

6. **statio,** 'the resting-place.' The idea is either that of the stations on the great roads at which travellers found refreshment, or that of the anchorage of a ship in the desired haven (Verg. *Georg.* iv. 421; *Aen.* ii. 23; Livy x. 2; xxviii. 6). The latter notion best suits the context, since belief is the goal or terminus of search. Contrast the technical ecclesiastical meaning of 'statio,' 'sentry day,' *de cor.* 11, the church vigils borrowing the name of the military watch.

7. **expunctio,** i.e. 'consummatio'; so *de idol.* 16; *de iei.* 10. Tertullian uses *expungere* in the sense of *perficere, Apol.* 15, 21, 35; *ad nat.* i. 7; *de orat.* 9; *de res. carn.* 41.

9. **Hebion et Simon.** See notes, ch. 33.

12. **et velut si nusquam.** There are several variants here. The text (*Rig., Oehler*), 'just as if I were nowhere,' and *Rhen., Gang.* 'et velint sic nusquam' (*Pam.* 'et velint me esse sic nusquam'), 'and they, the heretics, wish me to be thus nowhere,' give equally appropriate meanings. *Leid., Gel.* 'et velim sic nusquam': *Agob.* 'et velim si nunquam.' Heumann believed the words to be an interpolation.

enim si quod debui credere credidi, et aliud denuo puto requirendum; spero utique et aliud esse inveniendum; nullo modo speraturus istud, nisi quia aut non credideram qui videbar credidisse, aut desii credidisse. Ita fidem meam deserens, negator invenior. Semel dixerim, Nemo quaerit, nisi qui aut non habuit, aut perdidit. Perdiderat unam ex decem drachmis anus illa, et ideo quaerebat; ubi tamen invenit, quaerere desiit. Panem vicinus non habebat, et ideo pulsabat: ubi tamen apertum est ei et accepit, pulsare cessavit. Vidua a iudice petebat audiri, quia non admittebatur: sed ubi audita est, hactenus institit. Adeo finis est et quaerendi et pulsandi et petendi. Petenti enim dabitur, inquit, et pulsanti aperietur, et quaerenti invenietur. Viderit qui quaerit semper, quia non invenit: illic enim quaerit, ubi non invenietur. Viderit qui semper pulsat, quia nunquam aperietur: illuc enim pulsat, ubi nemo est. Viderit qui semper petit, quia nunquam audietur: ab eo enim petit, qui non audit.

CAPUT XII.

NOBIS etsi quaerendum est adhuc et semper, ubi tamen quaeri oportet? Apud haereticos, ubi omnia extranea et adversaria nostrae veritati, ad quos vetamur accedere? Quis servus cibaria ab extraneo, ne dicam ab inimico domini sui, sperat? Quis miles ab infoederatis, ne dicam ab hostibus regibus, donativum et stipendium captat, nisi plane desertor

CHAP. XI.—5. **negator.** A post-class. word. It recurs below, ch. 14; *de res. carn.* 39 'respuens negatores eius Sadducaeos.' The fem. *negatrix* occurs *de idol.* 23.

7. **anus illa.** S. Luke xv. 8; xi. 5; xviii. 2 ff.

10. **admittebatur.** The technical word for 'granting an audience': Cicero, *Ep. ad Att.* xiii. 52; *de offic.* i. 39; Sueton. *Aug.* 52, 79.

11. **hactenus**, i.e. 'non ultra,' 'nunquam posthac.' This is Tertullian's ordinary use of the word: comp. *de test. an.* 1; *de res. carn.* 58; *de pall.* 2; *de iei.* 10; *de exhort. cast.* 1; *adv. Herm.* 34.

12. **inquit**: sc. 'Dominus.' S. Luke xi. 10.

13. **Viderit.** See note, ch. 7.

et transfuga et rebellis? Etiam anus illa intra tectum suum drachmam requirebat: etiam pulsator ille vicini ianuam tundebat: etiam vidua illa non inimicum, licet durum, iudicem interpellabat. Nemo inde instrui potest, unde destruitur: nemo ab eo illuminatur, a quo contenebratur. Quaeramus ergo in nostro, et a nostris, et de nostro: idque dumtaxat quod, salva regula fidei, potest in quaestionem devenire.

CAPUT XIII.

REGULA est autem fidei, ut iam hinc quid defendamus profiteamur, illa scilicet qua creditur unum omnino Deum esse nec alium praeter mundi conditorem, qui universa de nihilo produxerit per Verbum suum primo omnium demissum: id Verbum Filium eius appellatum, in nomine Dei varie visum a patriarchis, in prophetis semper auditum, postremo

CHAP. XII.—4. **interpellabat.** This word appears to be used technically, like 'interpellatio,' Digest v. 1, 23; i. 16, 188, of 'appealing to a judge.' Comp. *ad Scap.* 3.

CHAP. XIII.—9. **Regula . . . fidei.** Comp. *de virg. vel.* 1; *adv. Prax.* 2; *Apol.* 17, 21; Irenaeus i. 10; iv. 26.

12. **demissum.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.*: 'emissum' *reliqui.* It is not clear whether Tertullian intends by this phrase the Eternal Generation of the Son, or His going forth to create the world. Either reading, 'demissum' or 'emissum,' would suit the latter interpretation, but neither is a strictly technical expression for the former, although Tertullian's language in other passages is somewhat similar: e. g. *Apol.* 21 'Hunc ex Deo prolatum didiscimus et prolatione generatum'; *adv. Prax.* 2, 7. The technical defects in such phraseology, viewed, that is, in the light of subsequent definition, are compensated by the contexts in these and other passages, which assert in unmistakable terms the coeternity and coessentiality of the Son with the Father: e. g. *adv. Prax.* 8 'Sermo in Patre semper, . . . nunquam separatus a Patre'; *ib.* 4 'Filium non aliunde deduco sed de substantia Patris'; *ib.* 6. 19; *Apol.* 21 'Filium Dei et Deum dictum ex unitate substantiae.'

14. **visum a patriarchis.** This was the general view of the ante-

delatum ex spiritu Patris Dei et virtute in virginem Mariam, carnem factum in utero eius, et ex ea natum egisse Iesum Christum: exinde praedicasse novam legem, et novam promissionem regni caelorum, virtutes fecisse, cruci fixum, tertia die resurrexisse; in caelos ereptum sedisse ad dexteram Patris; misisse vicariam vim Spiritus Sancti, qui credentes agat; venturum cum claritate ad sumendos sanctos in vitae aeternae et promissorum caelestium fructum, et ad profanos iudicandos igni perpetuo, facta utriusque partis resuscitatione cum carnis restitutione. Haec regula a Christo, ut probabitur, instituta nullas habet apud nos quaestiones, nisi quas haereses inferunt, et quae haereticos faciunt.

CAPUT XIV.

CETERUM manente forma eius in suo ordine, quantum libet quaeras et tractes et omnem libidinem curiositatis effundas, si quid tibi videtur vel ambiguitate pendere, vel obscuritate obumbrari. Est utique frater aliqui doctor gratia scientiae donatus: est aliqui inter exercitatos conversatus,

Nicene, or, rather, prae-Augustinian fathers: Just. Mart. *Dial.* 56, 59, 61; Tert. again *adv. Prax.* 13; *adv. Marc.* ii. 27; iii. 9; Iren. iii. 6. 1; iv. 7. 4; Clem. Alex. *Paed.* i. 7; Theoph. *ad Autol.* ii. 31; Cypr. *adv. Iud.* ii. 5 f.; Cyril Ier. *Catech.* 10. After this view had been turned to Arian purposes Augustine (*de Trin.* iii. 11) maintained that 'the Theophanies were not direct appearances of a Person in the Godhead, but self-manifestations of God through a created being.' Liddon, *Bampton lect.* p. 58. Comp. Athanas. *de conc. Arim.* apud Lib. Fath. p. 120, note *g*.

2. egisse, 'lived and acted as Jesus Christ.' 'Egisse' is the reading of *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Rig.*; and *agere* is thus used *Apol.* 10, 37; *de exh. cast.* 7. 'Exisse' was the conjecture of *Fulv. Ursinus*, and is adopted by *Oehler*.

4. virtutes = δυνάμεις, 'miracula': so below, chs. 20, 29, 30, 44; *Apol.* 18 (of the miracles of O. T. prophets).

9. utriusque partis, i. e. 'sanctorum atque profanorum.'

CHAP. XIV.—16. doctor. See note, ch. 3.

aliqui tecum curiosus, tecum tamen quaerens novissime ignorare [te] melius sciet, ne quod non debeas noris, quia quod debeas nosti. Fides, inquit, tua te salvum fecit, non exercitatio scripturarum. Fides in regula posita est: habet legem, et salutem de observatione legis: exercitatio autem in curiositate consistit, habens gloriam solam de peritiae studio. Cedat curiositas fidei, cedat gloria saluti. Certe aut non obstrepant, aut quiescant. Adversus regulam nihil scire omnia scire est.

Ut non inimici essent veritatis haeretici, ut de refugiendis eis non praemoneremur, quale est conferre cum hominibus qui et ipsi adhuc se quaerere profiteantur? Si enim adhuc vere quaerunt, nihil adhuc certi repererunt: et ideo quaecumque videntur interim tenere, dubitationem suam ostendunt, quamdiu quaerunt. Itaque tu, qui perinde quaeris, spectans ad eos qui et ipsi quaerunt, dubius ad dubios, incertus ad incertos, caecus a caecis in foveam deducaris necesse est.

Sed cum decipiendi gratia praetendant se adhuc quaerere, ut nobis per sollicitudinis iniectionem tractatus suos insinuent: denique ubi adierunt ad nos statim quae dicebant quaerenda esse defendant, iam illos sic debemus refutare, ut

1. **novissime**, i. e. 'postremo,' as below, ch. 20; *adv. Prax.* 27; *ad mart.* 4. Routh and others have understood it as a vocative, 'Thou newest of novices'; but this seems a very forced interpretation.

ignorare [te] melius sciet. I have adopted Oehler's emendation, 'sciet' for 'est,' which is read in all MSS. and edd. But see *Van der Vliet*, p. 50, who criticizes *Oehler* and prefers to emend thus: '[aliqui] tecum curiosius, tecum tamen [te] quaerentem nov. ign. melius erit. . . .'

3. **Fides.** S. Luke xviii. 42.

11. **quale est.** See note, ch. 29.

13. **certi.** *Agob.* 'certe.'

14. **interim.** See note, ch. 20.

17. **caecus.** S. Matt. xv. 14.

20. **tractatus,** 'treatment of questions,' something like 'retractatus,' ch. 7; scarcely 'homilies,' 'compositions.' The word is used of 'discussions' by Cyprian, *Epist.* iii. 3; comp. Digest xvii. 2. 32.

22. **refutare.** *Agob.*, *Rig.* 'reputare.'

sciant nos non Christo, sed sibi negatores esse. Cum enim quaerunt adhuc, nondum tenent: cum autem non tenent, nondum crediderunt: cum autem nondum crediderunt, non sunt Christiani. At cum tenent quidem et credunt, quaerendum tamen dicunt ut defendant: antequam defendant, negant quod confitentur se nondum credidisse, dum quaerunt. Qui ergo nec sibi sunt Christiani, quanto magis nobis? qui per fallaciam veniunt, qualem fidem disputant? cui veritati patrocinantur, qui eam a mendacio inducunt? Sed ipsi de scripturis agunt, et de scripturis suadent! Aliunde scilicet loqui possent de rebus fidei, nisi ex literis fidei?

CAPUT XV.

VENIMUS igitur ad propositum. Hoc enim dirigebamus, et hoc praestruebamus allocutionis praefatione, ut iam hinc de eo congrediamur de quo adversarii provocant. Scripturas obtendunt, et hac sua audacia statim quosdam movent. In ipso vero congressu firmos quidem fatigant, infirmos capiunt, medios cum scrupulo dimittunt. Hunc igitur potissimum gradum obstruimus, non admittendos eos ad ullam de scripturis disputationem. Si hae sunt illae vires eorum, uti eas

9. **patrocinantur.** See note, *Apol.* 6. Tertullian frequently uses the word in the sense of 'protect,' 'foster,' 'countenance': *Apol.* 18, 19 frag.; *Scorp.* 4; *de idol.* 9; *adv. Marc.* iv. 1, 5.

CHAP. XV.—14. **congrediamur.** See note, ch. 7.

provocant, 'make their appeal'; comp. *Apol.* 10 'Appellamus et provocamus a vobis ipsis ad conscientiam vestram'; *ib.* 46 'de pudicitia provocemus' (where *de*='on the point of,' as here); and below, ch. 19 'Ergo non ad scripturas provocandum est.'

15. **obtendunt,** 'they make the Scriptures the ground of their plea.' *Obtendere* lit.='to put one thing in front of another in order to hide it'; and so 'to plead something in excuse of a line of conduct'; Tacit. *Ann.* iii. 35; Quint. xii. 10. 15.

17. **medios,** 'the undetermined, undecided ones'; comp. Cicero *Epist. ad Att.* x. 8. 4.; Livy ii. 27.

18. **gradum obstruimus.** See note, ch. 9.

habere possint, dispici debet cui competat possessio scripturarum, ne is admittatur ad eas, cui nullo modo competit.

CAPUT XVI.

Hoc de consilio diffidentiae, aut de studio aliter ineundae constitutionis induxerim, nisi ratio constiterit, in primis illa, quod fides nostra obsequium apostolo debeat, prohibenti quaestiones inire, novis vocibus aures accommodare, haereticum post unam correptionem convenire, non post disputationem. Adeo interdixit disputationem, correptionem designans caussam haeretici conveniendi, et hoc unam scilicet quia non est Christianus: ne more Christiani semel et iterum, et sub duobus aut tribus testibus castigandus videretur, cum ob hoc sit castigandus, propter quod non sit cum illo disputandum, dehinc quoniam nihil proficiat congressio scripturarum, nisi plane ut stomachi qua ineat eversionem, aut cerebri.

CAPUT XVII.

Ista haeresis non recipit quasdam scripturas; et si quas recipit, et adjectionibus et detractionibus ad dispositionem

Chap. XVI.—4. **constitutionis**, 'the point in dispute'; *constitutio* is a legal term used synonymously with *status*, 'the main question,' Cicero *de inven. rhet.* i. 8 'eum igitur quaestionem ex qua caussa nascitur, constitutio appellamus'; and again 'constitutio est prima conflictio caussarum'; Cornific. i. 11 'Constitutiones apud rhetores sunt .... quae status etiam dicuntur'; comp. Quint. iii. 6. 2 ff.

induxerim, 'I might be bringing forward this objection.' *Inducere* is primarily 'to bring forward on the stage,' 'to exhibit'; and thence in legal use 'to bring before a court'; Sueton. *Dom.* 11; *Claud.* 40; Plin. *Epist.* ii. 12. 2.

5. **prohibenti quaestiones.** 1 Tim. vi. 4; Tit. iii. 10.

7. **post unam correptionem.** See note, ch. 6.

10. **more Christiani.** S. Matt. xviii. 15 f.

13. **congressio scripturarum**, i. e. 'congressio de scripturis;' so again ch. 18 'congressum scripturarum.' Comp. note, chap. 7.

14. **plane**, ironical, as generally in Tertullian: see note on 'opinor,' ch. 3.

qua, 'in so far as'; see *Apol.* 5 'sed qua et homo.'

instituti sui intervertit; et si recipit non recipit integras; et si aliquatenus integras praestat, nihilominus diversas expositiones commentata convertit. Tantum veritati obstrepit adulter sensus quantum et corruptor stilus. Vanae praesumptiones necessario nolunt agnoscere ea per quae revincuntur. His nituntur quae ex falso composuerunt, et quae de ambiguitate ceperunt. Quid promovebis, exercitatissime scripturarum, cum si quid defenderis, negetur ex diverso, si quid negaveris, defendatur? Et tu quidem nihil perdes nisi vocem in contentione, nihil consequeris nisi bilem de blasphematione.

CAPUT XVIII.

ILLE vero, si quis est cuius caussa in congressum descendis scripturarum, ut eum dubitantem confirmes, ad veritatem, an magis ad haereses deverget? Hoc ipso motus, quod te videat nihil promovisse, aequo gradu negandi et defendendi

CHAP. XVII.—1. **intervertit.** On heretical mutilation and perversion of the Scriptures, see ch. 38; and comp. Hippolytus *apud* Euseb. v. 28.

3. **obstrepit,** 'hinders,' 'injures,' as in Florus iv. 29; or perhaps 'distorts,' 'perverts,' as in Val. Max. viii. 15. 8. Comp. Iren. iii. 12. 15; Clem. Alex. *Strom.* vii. 16; Augustin. *Haer.* 70.

4. **adulter sensus** = 'expositionum mendacia,' ch. 18; 'a false exegesis.'

corruptor stilus = 'adulteria scripturarum,' ch. 18; 'a tampered text.' On *stilus*, see note, ch. 38.

Vanae. Fr. Junius' happy correction of the MSS. 'variae.'

6. **quae ex falso composuerunt,** e.g. the Psalms of Valentinus, *de carn. Chr.* 17, 20; the Phaneroseis of Apelles, ch. 30; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6; comp. Iren. iii. 11. 12, of the false gospel of the Valentinians, 'Hi vero qui sunt a Valentino, iterum exsistentes extra omnem timorem, suas conscriptiones proferentes, plura habere gloriantur, quam sint ipsa Evangelia . . . .'

7. **de ambiguitate** = 'propter ambiguitatem.'

11. **blasphematione.** This word and its cognates are read only in ecclesiastical Latin.

adversa parte, statu certe pari, altercatione incertior discedet, nesciens quam haeresin iudicet. Haec utique et ipsi habent in nos retorquere. Necesse est enim et illos dicere a nobis potius adulteria scripturarum et expositionum mendacia inferri, qui proinde sibi defendant veritatem.

CAPUT XIX.

Ergo non ad scripturas provocandum est, nec in his constituendum certamen in quibus aut nulla, aut incerta victoria est, aut parum incerta. Nam etsi non ita evaderet collatio scripturarum, ut utramque partem parem sisteret, ordo rerum desiderabat illud prius proponi, quod nunc solum disputandum est: quibus competat fides ipsa cuius sunt scripturae: a quo, et per quos, et quando, et quibus sit

Chap. XVIII.—1. **altercatione**, 'rejoinder.' See note *Apol.* 2.

3. **habent . . . retorquere.** This construction of 'habere' with the infinitive is very common in Tertullian. Here 'habere' = 'debere,' 'to be obliged to,' or, as we say, 'to have to': so *Apol.* 36; *ad mart.* 4; *de cult. fem.* i. 1 'etiam Filius Dei mori habuit; *de anim.* 35, 55; *de res. carn.* 27; *de fug.* 12; *de pat.* 7; *ad uxor.* i. 2; *de idol.* 5; *adv. Prax.* 4; and this use is very usual in Lactantius; e.g. iv. 12, 15, 18, 22; comp. Tacit. *Ann.* xiv. 44; *de orat.* 36; Plin. *Epist.* i. 8. 12; Baed. *H. E.* iv. 24.

Very frequently too by a Graecism Tertullian uses 'habere' with the infinitive for 'posse,' ἔχειν: e.g. ch. 22 'probare non habent'; ch. 42 'eloqui non habent'; *Apol.* 22, 37; *de iei.* 8; *ad nat.* ii. 4; similarly 'tenere,' *ad nat.* ii. 2 'tenebat determinare.'

5. **proinde**, for 'perinde,' as often in Tertullian; *de spect.* 2, 7, 27; *Apol.* 13; *de idol.* 1; *de coron.* 10, 12; *de cult. fem.* ii. 9. *Agob.* reads 'perinde' here and in one or two other passages.

Chap. XIX.—6. **provocandum est.** See note, ch. 15.

8. **parum incerta.** So *Agob.*, *Leid.*, and the irony is quite in Tertullian's style. *Oehler* follows *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.* in printing 'parum certa.' *Rig.* weakly conjectured 'par incertae.'

collatio scripturarum, 'discussion of the Scriptures,' as in ch. 45; or perhaps 'the critical comparison of Scriptures,' the pitting of falsified texts against true, and isolated passages one against another.

11. **cuius sunt scripturae.** So *Agob.*, *Leid.* *Rel.* 'sint,' making another point of inquiry.

tradita disciplina, qua fiunt Christiani. Ubi enim apparuerit esse veritatem disciplinae et fidei Christianae, illic erit veritas scripturarum, et expositionum, et omnium traditionum Christianarum.

CAPUT XX.

CHRISTUS IESUS Dominus noster, permittat dicere interim, quisquis est, cuiuscumque Dei filius, cuiuscumque materiae homo et Deus, cuiuscumque fidei praeceptor, cuiuscumque mercedis repromissor, quid esset, quid fuisset, quam Patris voluntatem administraret, quid homini agendum determinaret, quamdiu in terris agebat, ipse pronuntiabat sive populo palam, sive discentibus seorsum, ex quibus duodecim praecipuos lateri suo adlegerat, destinatos nationibus magistros. Itaque uno eorum decusso, reliquos undecim digrediens ad Patrem post resurrectionem iussit ire et docere nationes, tingendas in Patrem, et in Filium, et in Spiritum Sanctum.

Statim igitur apostoli, quos haec appellatio missos interpretatur, assumpto per sortem duodecimo Mathia in locum Iudae, ex auctoritate prophetiae, quae est in psalmo David, consecuti promissam vim Spiritus Sancti ad virtutes et

1. **disciplina.** See note, ch. 6.

CHAP. XX.—5. **Christus Iesus.** Tertullian brushes aside for the moment all speculations of heresy, and concentrates attention solely upon the bare historical fact of the practical teaching of the historic Person Jesus Christ.

interim, 'for the moment,' 'for the sake of argument.' This is Tertullian's general use of 'interim'; see chs. 9, 14, 22; *Apol.* 8, 21; *de coron.* 8; comp. Min. Fel. 7, 16. Above, ch. 4, it = '*nunc,*' '*adhuc.*'

11. **discentibus.** See note, ch. 3.

14. **ire et docere.** S. Matt. xxviii. 19.

15. **tingendas.** See note, ch. 8.

18. **prophetiae.** This word and its cognates were early imported from the Greek to suit the requirements of ecclesiastical Latin; comp. *de coron.* 1; *Apol.* 19 frag.; *de anim.* 35; *de iei.* 3, 17; *de res. carn.* 21; *adv. Iud.* 9.

David. Ps. cix. 8; Acts i. 20.

19. **virtutes.** See note, ch. 13.

eloquium, primo per Iudaeam contestata fide in Iesum Christum, et ecclesiis institutis; dehinc in orbem profecti, eandem doctrinam eiusdem fidei nationibus promulgaverunt. Et perinde ecclesias apud unamquamque civitatem condiderunt, a quibus traducem fidei et semina doctrinae ceterae exinde ecclesiae mutuatae sunt, et cottidie mutuantur ut ecclesiae fiant: ac per hoc et ipsae apostolicae deputantur, ut soboles apostolicarum ecclesiarum. Omne genus ad originem suam censeatur necesse est. Itaque tot ac tantae ecclesiae una est illa ab apostolis prima, ex qua omnes. Sic omnes primae et omnes apostolicae, dum una omnes probant unitate communicatio pacis et appellatio fraternitatis et contesseratio

5. **traducem**, 'the transmission;' lit. 'an offshoot, or sucker.' This is a favourite word of Tertullian; see ch. 32; *Apol.* 7, 9, 21; *ad nat.* i. 4, 7, 13, 16; *de test. an.* 3; *Scorp.* 9; *de pat.* 5; *de anim.* 9.

9. **censeatur**, 'must be referred back,' 'reckoned.' This is the root meaning of the verb; comp. *Apol.* 10, 39; *ad nat.* i. 12; *de monog.* 11; *adv Marc.* i. 8; and similarly 'census' = 'the class, rank, or order in which any person or thing is reckoned'; *de idol.* 4; *ad nat.* ii. 1; *de verg. vel.* 4, 11; *adv. Marc* i. 21; *de monog.* 5 (comp. Arnob. iv. 1). Sometimes the context reflects the senses of 'originate,' and 'source' into 'censere,' and 'census': e.g. below, ch. 21, 32; *Apol.* 7, 10, 12, 21; *adv. Herm.* 33; *de test. an.* 5; *de coron.* 13.

11. **dum una omnes probant unitate communicatio.** So *Oehler*, I think rightly. The suggestion of *Routh*, 'dum una omnes. Probant unitatem,' &c., is simpler, and on that account less probable; whereas all the varr. lectt. of MSS. and edd. can be explained from the text, different punctuations having necessitated different verbal alterations. *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.* 'unam omnes probant unitatem. Communicatio,' &c.: *Agob.*, *Rig.* 'una om. pr. unitatem [dum est illis] com.,' &c.; but *Agob.* (teste Hildebrand) omits 'dum est illis.'

12. **appellatio fraternitatis.** Comp. *Apol.* 39 'Sed et quod fratrum appellatione censemur,' &c.; Clem. Alex. *Strom.* ii. 9; Hieronym. *adv. Helv.* 8; Athenag. 32; Lactant. v. 16.

contesseratio hospitalitatis, 'the common bond of friendship.' For the Roman custom of dividing the 'tessera hospitalis' as a pledge of amity, see Plaut. *Poen.* v. 2. 87, 92; *Cist.* ii. 1. 27. Inscr. Orell. 1079. The use of the phrase here is of course quite non-technical, the great bond of fellowship between Christians in every part of the world being their unity of doctrine: comp. ch. 36, for the 'contesse-

hospitalitatis, quae iura non alia ratio regit quam eiusdem sacramenti una traditio.

CAPUT XXI.

HINC igitur dirigimus praescriptionem, si Dominus Christus Iesus apostolos misit ad praedicandum, alios non esse recipiendos praedicatores, quam Christus instituit; quia nec alius Patrem novit nisi Filius, et cui Filius revelavit; nec aliis videtur revelasse Filius, quam apostolis quos misit ad praedicandum, utique quod illis revelavit. Quid autem prae-

ratio' between Rome and the African churches. It is possible too that Tertullian had in his mind the 'systatics,' or 'commendatory letters,' the use of which linked church to church in a unity truly catholic: see August. *Epist.* 44. 3; Euseb. vii. 30; Sozom. v. 16; Chalc. Conc. *can.* 11. Hatch, *Infl. of Greek ideas*, p. 344, is too literal.

2. **sacramenti** = 'regula fidei.' The word 'sacramentum' has various significations in ecclesiastical Latin. It sometimes corresponds to the N. T. use of μυστήριον in its two senses of: (1) 'a sacred ordinance, doctrine, or fact'; (2) 'a symbol'; and sometimes to its original classical use, 'a solemn obligation, pledge, or oath'; occasionally the two ideas combine. Typical instances will be found—chs. 26, 32 (doctrine); *Apol.* 2, 7 (religious ordinance), 15, 19, 47 (system of religion); *de idol.* 6; *de cor.* 13; *ad mart.* 3; *Scorp.* 4 (Baptism); *adv. Marc.* iv. 34; *de cor.* 3 (Eucharist); *Scorp.* 9 (martyrdom); *de anim.* 9 (mysterious revelations). The word has even a wider range of meaning in the writings of Augustine, who applies it to the salt given to catechumens (*de cat. rud.* 50; *de pecc. mer.* ii. 42), to the Paternoster and the Creed (*Serm.* 228), to the chrism and imposition of hands (*de bapt. c. Don.* v. 28), as well as to the 'Sacramenta fontis et altaris' (*Serm.* 228). See Bright, *Serm. of S. Leo*, note 6; Lightfoot, *Ignatius* i. 51; Rönsch, *N. T. Tertullians*, p. 585; Hatch, *Biblical Greek*, p. 61.

CHAP. XXI.—3. **praescriptionem.** The whole question between the heretics and the Catholic Church is now 'limited' to one point—the retention of Apostolic doctrine—the guarantee and proof of such retention being shewn (ch. 32) to depend on a true episcopal succession from the Apostles.

Dominus. The MSS. read 'Deus' by a very common confusion.

5. **nec alius Patrem.** Matt. xi. 27.

dicaverint, id est, quid illis Christus revelaverit, et hic praescribam non aliter probari debere, nisi per easdem ecclesias quas ipsi apostoli condiderunt, ipsi eis praedicando tam viva, quod aiunt, voce quam per epistulas postea.

Si haec ita sunt, constat perinde omnem doctrinam, quae cum illis ecclesiis apostolicis matricibus et originalibus fidei conspiret, veritati deputandam; id sine dubio tenentem quod ecclesiae ab apostolis, apostoli a Christo, Christus a Deo accepit: omnem vero doctrinam de mendacio praeiudicandam, quae sapiat contra veritatem ecclesiarum et apostolorum Christi et Dei. Superest ergo ut demonstremus an haec nostra doctrina, cuius regulam supra edidimus, de apostolorum traditione censeatur, et ex hoc ipso, an ceterae de mendacio veniant. Communicamus cum ecclesiis apostolicis, quod nulla doctrina diversa. Hoc est testimonium veritatis.

CAPUT XXII.

SED quoniam tam expedita probatio est, ut, si statim proferatur, nihil iam sit retractandum, ac si prolata non sit a nobis, locum interim demus diversae parti, si quid putant ad infirmandam hanc praescriptionem movere se posse. Solent dicere, non omnia apostolos scisse, eadem agitati

4. **viva, quod aiunt, voce.** 2 Thess. ii. 15; 1 Cor. xi. 23, xv. 1; Phil. iv. 9; Gal. i. 9.

6. **apostolicis.** On the various applications of this word see Lightfoot, *Clem. Rom.* i. 2.

matricibus. This is a common word in Tertullian for 'the original fount or source.' *Adv. Iud.* 2 'Primordialis lex est enim data Adae et Evae in paradiso, quasi matrix omnium praeceptorum Dei'; *Apol.* 21; *adv. Herm.* 16; *de virg. vel.* 5 'Eva matrix generis feminini'; *adv. Val.* 7; *de res. carn.* 6; *adv. Marc.* ii. 16, iv. 35.

9. **de mendacio,** 'de' is either 'on the score of,' or the expression = 'ut ex mendacio originem habentem.'

12. **supra edidimus.** Ch. 13.

13. **censeatur.** See note, ch. 20.

CHAP. XXII.—18. **interim.** See note, ch. 20.

20. **non omnia apostolos scisse.** Comp. Iren. iii. 1. 1 'Nec enim

dementia qua susum rursus convertunt omnia quidem apostolos scisse, sed non omnia omnibus tradidisse; in utroque Christum reprehensioni inicientes, qui aut minus instructos aut parum simplices apostolos miserit.

Quis igitur integrae mentis credere potest aliquid eos ignorasse quos magistros Dominus dedit, individuos habens in comitatu, in discipulatu, in convictu; quibus obscura quaeque seorsum disserebat, illis dicens datum esse cognoscere arcana, quae populo intellegere non liceret? Latuit aliquid Petrum, aedificandae ecclesiae petram dictum, claves regni caelorum

fas est dicere quoniam ante praedicaverunt quam perfectam haberent agnitionem; sicut quidam audent dicere, gloriantes emendatores se esse Apostolorum.'

1. **susum.** So *Agob.*, *Divion.* This archaic form (Cato, *de re rust.* 157. 15) of sursum (=subvorsum) is found also in Augustine, e. g. *Tract.* 8 *in Epist. Ioan.* i. 2; *Tract.* 10; and Lactant. *de mort. pers.* 19. 4.

omnia quidem apostolos scisse: comp. Iren. iii. 5. 1 'Neque discipuli eius alium quemdam Deum nominaret . . . quemadmodum dicunt hi . . . quoniam Apostoli cum hypocrisi fecerunt doctrinam secundum audientium capacitatem,' &c.

8. **seorsum disserebat.** S. Mark iv. 34. Irenaeus (iii. 3. 1) maintains that even if the Apostles had been entrusted with esoteric doctrines, their successors, the bishops of the Apostolic Churches, were the very persons to whom they would have communicated them.

dicens. S. Matt. xiii. 11.

10. **petram dictum.** S. Matt. xvi. 18 ff. Similarly *de monog.* 8; *de pud.* 21, Tertullian interprets the 'rock' of S. Peter's person; but *adv. Marc.* iv. 13 of Christ. The patristic exegesis of the passage varied with different Fathers, and in different writings of the same Father: see Lib. Fath. in loc. and note p. 508 ff. Lightfoot, *Clem. Rom.* ii. 482 ff. The point of view varies, and varying interpretations are not necessarily conflicting. Compare for instance, the different points of view which regard Christ sometimes as Himself the 'foundation' of the Church (1 Cor. iii. 11), and sometimes as the 'corner-stone,' with the Apostles and Prophets as the foundation (Eph. ii. 20).

claves regni. Similarly the gift of the keys is assigned to Peter personally *de pud.* 21, but it is there explained in a Montanistic sense of his first preaching the Gospel (Acts ii. 22) and opposed to the authority of the Church. Cyprian, *de unit. eccl.* 3; *Epist.* 73 *ad*

consecutum, et solvendi et alligandi in caelis et in terris potestatem? Latuit et Ioannem aliquid, dilectissimum Domino, pectori eius incubantem, cui soli Dominus Iudam traditorem praemonstravit, quem loco suo filium Mariae demandavit? Quid eos ignorasse voluit, quibus etiam gloriam suam exhibuit, et Moysen et Helian, et insuper de caelo Patris vocem? non quasi ceteros reprobans, sed quoniam in tribus testibus stabit omne verbum. Ignoraverunt itaque et illi, quibus post resurrectionem quoque in itinere omnes scripturas edisserere dignatus est.

Dixerat plane aliquando: Multa habeo adhuc vobis loqui, sed non potestis modo ea sustinere; tamen adiciens: Cum venerit ille Spiritus veritatis, ipse vos deducet in omnem veritatem. Ostendit illos nihil ignorasse, quos omnem veritatem consecuturos per Spiritum veritatis promiserat; et utique implevit repromissum, probantibus Actis apostolorum descensum Spiritus Sancti. Quam scripturam qui non reci-

Iubai. interprets it of Peter as intended to exhibit the unity of the Church; and again *Epist.* 33 *ad laps.* illustratively of all bishops: Augustine, *Serm.* 295. 2, representatively of the whole Church.

3. **pectori eius incubantem.** S. John xiii. 25.

4. **filium Mariae.** S. John xix. 26.

5. **gloriam suam exhibuit.** S. Matt. xvii. 1 ff.; S. Mark ix. 1 ff.; S. Luke ix. 28 ff.

7. **in tribus testibus.** Deut. xix. 15; S. Matt. xviii. 16; 2 Cor. xiii. 1.

9. **in itinere.** S. Luke xxiv. 27.

11. **Dixerat plane.** S. John xvi. 13.

14. **Ostendit illos, &c.** Tertullian as a Montanist did not regard this promise as completely fulfilled on the day of Pentecost: see *de monog.* 2, where he gives a very different interpretation to the same text. Comp. also *de virg. vel.* 1; and contrast the language there with that below, ch. 28, respecting the continued work of the Spirit in the Church.

17. **descensum Spiritus.** Acts ii. 1 ff.

qui non recipiunt. The Marcionites; *adv. Marc.* v. 2: comp. *ib.* iv. 5; Epiphan. *Haer.* 42. 9. For their other rejections and mutilations of the Scriptures see below, ch. 38.

piunt, nec Spiritum [Sanctum] possunt agnoscere discentibus missum sed nec ecclesiam se defendere, qui quando et quibus incunabulis institutum est hoc corpus probare non habent. Tanti est enim illis non habere probationes eorum quae defendunt, ne pariter admittantur traductiones eorum quae mentiuntur.

CAPUT XXIII.

PROPONUNT ergo ad suggillandam ignorantiam aliquam apostolorum, quod Petrus et qui cum eo reprehensi sunt a Paulo. Adeo, inquiunt, aliquid eis defuit, ut ex hoc etiam illud struant, potuisse postea pleniorem scientiam supervenire, qualis obvenerit Paulo reprehendenti antecessores.

Possum et hic Acta apostolorum repudiantibus dicere: Prius est ut ostendatis quis iste Paulus, et quid ante apostolum, et quomodo apostolus: quatenus et alias ad quaestiones plurimum eo utuntur. Neque enim, si ipse se apostolum de

1. **nec Spiritum, &c.** So *Agob.*: nec Spiritus Sancti esse possunt, qui necdum Spiritum Sanctum possint *Gang.*, *Rig.*, *Fulv. Urs.*

discentibus: see note, ch. 3.

2. **se defendere.** So *Agob.*, *Leid.*: se dicant defendere *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Oehl.*

4. **non habere probationes**, 'to be incapable of producing proofs.' This is, I think, the force of *habere* in this and the immediately preceding sentence: see note, ch. 18.

5. **traductiones**: see note, ch. 33.

CHAP. XXIII.—7. **suggillandam**: see note, ch. 8.

8. **quod Petrus . . . a Paulo.** Pauline opposition to Peter was a characteristic Marcionite tenet; with the whole of this chapter comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 2. 3.

reprehensi. Gal. ii. 11 ff.

10. **illud.** 'that other contention of theirs.'

supervenire, sc. 'Apostolos.'

11. **antecessores**, 'predecessors in the Apostleship.'

15. **plurimum eo utuntur.** On the Marcionite and Valentinian use of S. Paul's writings see Iren. iii. 13 f.

ipse se apostolum. 1 Cor. xv. 9.

persecutore profitetur, sufficit unicuique examinate credenti, quando nec Dominus ipse de se testimonium dixerit.

Sed credant sine scripturis, ut credant adversus scripturas: tamen doceant, ex eo quod allegant Petrum a Paulo reprehensum, aliam evangelii formam a Paulo superductam, citra eam quae praemiserat Petrus et ceteri. Atquin demutatus in praedicatorem de persecutore, deducitur ad fratres a fratribus, ut unus ex fratribus, et ad illos ab illis, qui ab apostolis fidem induerant. Dehinc, sicut ipse enarrat, ascendit in Hierosolyma cognoscendi Petri caussa, ex officio et iure scilicet eiusdem fidei et praedicationis. Nam et illi non essent mirati, de persecutore factum praedicatorem, si aliquid contrarium praedicaret: nec Dominum praeterea magnificassent, quia adversarius eius Paulus obvenerat. Itaque et dexteram ei dederunt, signum concordiae et convenientiae, et inter se distributionem officii ordinaverunt, non separationem evangelii, nec ut aliud alter, sed ut aliis alter praedicarent, Petrus in circumcisionem, Paulus in nationes. Ceterum si reprehensus est Petrus, quod cum convixisset ethnicis, postea se a convictu eorum separabat personarum respectu, utique conversationis fuit vitium, non praedicationis. Non enim ex hoc alius Deus quam Creator; et alius Christus quam ex Maria; et alia spes quam resurrectio annuntiabatur.

2. **nec Dominus ipse.** S. John v. 31.

5. **superductam,** i. e. 'insuper additam.' This is not the general use of 'superducere' in late writers, see Capitol. *M. Ant. Phil.* 29; Sidon. Ap. *Epist.* 5. 17; but it seems to be uniform in Tertullian: see ch. 26, *de coron.* 11; *ad nat.* i. 11; *de anim.* 36; *de orat.* 1; *de cult. fem.* ii. 5; *de monog.* 14; *de pud.* 20.

9. **fidem induerant:** comp. for the expression Gal. iv. 17 'Christum induistis.'

ipse enarrat. Gal. i. 18 ff.

15. **dexteram ei dederunt.** Gal. ii. 9.

20. **utique conversationis:** comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 3 'Adeo non de praedicatione sed de conversatione a Paulo denotabantur, aeque denotaturo, si quid de Deo Creatore aut Christo errassent.' On 'conversatio' see note, ch. 41.

CAPUT XXIV.

NON mihi tam bene est, immo non mihi tam male est, ut apostolos committam. Sed quoniam perversissimi isti illam reprehensionem ad hoc obtendunt, ut suspectam faciant doctrinam superiorem, respondebo quasi pro Petro: ipsum Paulum dixisse, factum se esse omnibus omnia, Iudaeis Iudaeum, non Iudaeis non Iudaeum, ut omnes lucrificaret. Adeo pro temporibus et personis et caussis quaedam reprehendebant, in quae et ipsi aeque pro temporibus et personis et caussis committebant: quemadmodum si et Petrus reprehenderet Paulum, quod prohibens circumcisionem circumciderit ipse Timotheum. Viderint qui de apostolis iudicant. Bene quod Petrus Paulo et in martyrio adaequatur.

Sed etsi in tertium usque caelum ereptus Paulus, et in paradisum delatus audiit quaedam illic, non possunt videri fuisse, quae illum in aliam doctrinam instructiorem praestarent, cum ita fuerit condicio eorum, ut nulli hominum proderentur. Quod si ad alicuius conscientiam manavit nescio quid illud, et hoc se aliqua haeresis sequi affirmat;

CHAP. XXIV.—1. **ut apostolos committam,** 'to pit Apostle against Apostle': comp. *ad mart.* 1 'ut vos committat,' 'so as to set you at variance'; Cyprian, *Epist.* 16. This use of *committere* is taken from the gladiatorial shows, and is common in Suetonius: e.g. *Claud.* 34; Martial, *Epigr.* viii. 43. 3 'Victores committe, Venus?' The word bears a different meaning below, see note.

3. **doctrinam superiorem,** 'the earlier teaching'; i. e. of Peter.

5. **Paulum dixisse.** 1 Cor. ix. 20 ff.

8. **in quae . . . committebant,** 'against which they themselves were accustomed to offend': *committere* is thus used absolutely *Apol.* 29 'Ideo ergo committimus in maiestatem imperatorum.' Comp. Cicero, *in Verr.* ii. 1. 43 'nemo enim committeret.'

11. **Timotheum.** Acts xvi. 3.

Bene quod. For this expression comp. *Apol.* 7 'Bene autem quod omnia tempus revelat'; *de idol.* 5. 15, 23 'bene quod . . . Dominus dixit'; *de iei.* 13; *de carn. Chr.* 24; *de res. carn.* 52; *adv. Marc.* iv. 7, 31, 43; v. 14, 29.

13. **ereptus Paulus.** 2 Cor. xii. 2 ff.

aut Paulus secreti proditi reus est, aut et alius postea in paradisum ereptus debet ostendi, cui permissum sit eloqui, quae Paulo mutire non licuit.

CAPUT XXV.

Sed, ut diximus, eadem dementia est, cum confitentur quidem nihil apostolos ignorasse, nec diversa inter se praedicasse, non tamen omnia volunt illos omnibus revelasse, quaedam enim palam et universis, quaedam secreto et paucis demandasse, quia et hoc verbo usus est Paulus ad Timotheum: O Timothee, depositum custodi; et rursum: Bonum depositum serva. Quod hoc depositum est tam tacitum, ut alterius doctrinae deputetur? An illius denuntiationis, de qua ait: Hanc denuntiationem commendo apud te, filiole Timothee? Item illius praecepti, de quo ait: Denuntio tibi ante Deum, qui vivificat omnia, et Iesum Christum, qui testatus est sub Pontio Pilato bonam confessionem, custodias praeceptum? Quod autem praeceptum, et quae denuntiatio? Ex supra et infra scriptis intellegetur non nescio quid subostendi hoc dicto de remotiore doctrina, sed potius inculcari de non admittenda alia praeter eam quam audierat ab ipso, et puto palam: Coram multis, inquit, testibus. Quos multos testes,

Chap. XXV.—4. **ut diximus.** Chap. 22.

6. **volunt**: comp. Iren. iii. 4. 1 f. 'Quemadmodum hi qui nunquam Paulo adiuncti fuerunt, gloriantur abscondita et inenarrabilia didicisse sacramenta? Quoniam autem Paulus simpliciter quae sciebat haec et docuit, non solum eos qui cum eo erant, verum omnes audientes se, ipse fecit manifestum.'

8. **Paulus ad Timotheum.** 1 Tim. vi. 20.

9. **et rursum.** 2 Tim. i. 14.

12. **Hanc denuntiationem.** 1 Tim. i. 18.

13. **Denuntio tibi.** 1 Tim. vi. 13 f.

17. **subostendi.** This non-classical word is used again of secret hints or indirect allusion, *adv. Marc.* iv. 38; *adv. Val.* 1; *adv. Herm.* 37; *de anim.* 12; *de bapt.* 19.

20. **Coram multis.** 2 Tim. ii. 2.

si nolunt ecclesiam intellegi, nihil interest, quando nihil tacitum fuerit quod sub multis testibus proferebatur. Sed nec quia voluit illum haec fidelibus hominibus demandare, qui idonei sint et alios docere; id quoque argumentum occulti alicuius evangelii interpretandum est. Nam cum dicit Haec, de eis dicit, de quibus in praesenti scribebat; de occultis autem, ut de absentibus, apud conscientiam, non Haec, sed Illa dixisset.

CAPUT XXVI.

PORRO consequens erat, ut cui demandabat evangelii administrationem non passim nec inconsiderate administrandam, adiceret secundum dominicam vocem, ne margaritam porcis et sanctum canibus iactaret. Dominus palam edixit, sine ulla significatione alicuius tecti sacramenti. Ipse praeceperat, si quid in tenebris et in abscondito audissent, in luce et in tectis praedicarent. Ipse per similitudinem praefiguraverat, ne unam mnam, id est unum verbum eius, sine fructu in abdito reservarent. Ipse docebat lucernam non sub modium abstrudi solere, sed in candelabrum constitui, ut luceat omnibus qui in domo sunt. Haec apostoli ut neglexerunt aut minime intellexerunt, si non adimpleverunt, abscondentes aliquid de lumine, id est, de Dei verbo et Christi sacramento. Neminem, quod scio, verebantur, non Iudaeorum vim, non ethnicorum: quo magis utique in ecclesia libere praedicabant, qui in synagogis et in locis publicis non tacebant. Immo neque Iudaeos convertere neque ethnicos inducere potuissent, nisi quod credi ab eis volebant ordine exponerent. Multo magis iam credentibus

CHAP. XXVI.—11. **dominicam vocem.** S. Matt. vii. 6.
13. **sacramenti**: see note, ch. 20.
14. **Ipse praeceperat.** S. Matt. x. 27.
15. **per similitudinem.** S. Luke xix. 12 ff.
17. **Ipse docebat.** S. Matt. v. 15.
27. **ordine exponerent**: comp. S. Luke i. 3.
Multo magis, &c.: comp. Iren. iii. 3.

ecclesiis nihil subtraxissent quod aliis paucis seorsum demandarent.

Quamquam etsi quaedam inter domesticos, ut ita dixerim, disserebant, non tamen ea fuisse credendum est quae aliam regulam fidei superducerent, diversam et contrariam illi quam catholice in medium proferebant; ut alium Deum in ecclesia dicerent, alium in hospitio; aliam Christi substantiam designarent in aperto, aliam in secreto; aliam spem resurrectionis apud omnes annuntiarent, aliam apud paucos; cum ipsi obsecrarent in epistulis suis, ut idipsum et unum loquerentur omnes, et non essent schismata et dissensiones in ecclesia, quia sive Paulus, sive alii, eadem praedicarent. Alioquin meminerant, Sit sermo vester, est, est, non, non: nam quod amplius, hoc a malo est, ne evangelium in diversitate tractarent.

CAPUT XXVII.

SI ergo incredibile est vel ignorasse apostolos plenitudinem praedicationis vel non omnem ordinem regulae omnibus edidisse, videamus ne forte apostoli quidem simpliciter et plene, ecclesiae autem suo vitio aliter acceperint quam apostoli proferebant. Omnia ista scrupulositatis incitamenta invenias praetendi ab haereticis. Tenent correptas ab apostolo ecclesias: O insensati Galatae, quis vos fascinavit? et: Tam bene currebatis, quis vos impediit? ipsumque principium: Miror quod sic tam cito transferimini ab eo, qui

5. **superducerent**: see note, Ch. 23.

6. **catholice** = 'apud omnes palam,' opposed to 'inter domesticos': comp. *de fug.* 3 where it is opposed to 'ex parte.' *Agob.*, *Rig.* 'catholicae' sc. 'ecclesiae' (see note, ch. 30).

10. **in epistulis suis.** 1 Cor. i. 10.

13. **Sit sermo.** S. Matt. v. 37.

CHAP. XXVII.—20. **scrupulositatis**: see note, ch. 8.

22. **O insensati Galatae.** Gal. iii. 1.

23. **Tam bene.** Gal. v. 7.

24. **Miror.** Gal. i. 6.

suos vocavit in gratia, ad aliud evangelium. Item ad Corinthios scriptum, quod essent adhuc carnales, qui lacte educarentur, nondum idonei ad pabulum; qui putarent se scire aliquid, quando nondum scirent quemadmodum scire oporteret. Cum correptas ecclesias opponunt, credant emendatas. Sed et illas recognoscant, de quarum fide et scientia et conversatione apostolus gaudet et Deo gratis agit: quae tamen hodie cum illis correptis unius institutionis iura miscent.

CAPUT XXVIII.

AGE nunc, omnes erraverint; deceptus sit et apostolus de testimonio reddendo: nullam respexerit Spiritus Sanctus, uti eam in veritatem deduceret, ad hoc missus a Christo, ad hoc postulatus de Patre, ut esset doctor veritatis: neglexerit officium Dei vilicus, Christi vicarius, sinens ecclesias aliter interim intellegere, aliter credere quod ipse per apostolos praedicabat: ecquid verisimile est, ut tot ac tantae in unam fidem erraverint? Nullus inter multos eventus unus est. Exitus variasse debuerat error doctrinae ecclesiarum. Ceterum, quod apud multos unum invenitur, non est erratum, sed traditum. Audeat ergo aliquis dicere illos errasse, qui tradiderunt?

1. **ad Corinthios.** 1 Cor. iii. 1 f.; viii. 2; xvi. 19.

6. **fide et scientia.** Rom. i. 8; xv. 14; xvi. 19; Eph. i. 15; Phil. i. 3 ff.; Coloss. i. 4 ff.; 1 Thess. i. 3 ff.; 2 Thess. i. 3 f.

7. **conversatione**: see note, ch. 41.

9. **miscent**, 'unite': see note, ch. 36.

CHAP. XXVIII.—12. **in veritatem deduceret.** S. John xiv. 26.

16. **ecquid verisimile est.** This is a celebrated argument. Tertullian urges that the unanimity of the testimony establishes the security of the tradition. Comp. Iren. iii. 3 f.; iv. 53. 2; v. 20.

17. **eventus unus est. Exitus variasse.** So *Rig.*: exitus: variasse *Gel.*, *Pam.* *Agob.* has simply eventus variasse, &c.: *Leid.*, eventus unus exitus variasset (*Rhen.* variasse).

18. **error**: ordo *Leid.*

CAPUT XXIX.

Quoquo modo sit erratum, tam diu utique regnavit error quam diu haereses non erant. Aliquos Marcionitas et Valentinianos liberanda veritas exspectabat. Interea perperam evangelizabatur, perperam credebatur; tot milia milium perperam tincta, tot opera fidei perperam administrata, tot virtutes, tot charismata perperam operata, tot sacerdotia, tot ministeria perperam functa, tot denique martyria perperam coronata. Aut si non perperam nec in vacuum, quale est ut ante res Dei currerent, quam cuius Dei notum esset? ante Christiani, quam Christus inventus? ante haereses, quam vera doctrina? Sed enim in omnibus veritas imaginem antecedit: postremo similitudo succedit.

Chap. XXIX.—5. **tincta**: see note, ch. 8.

6. **virtutes**: see note, ch. 13.

7. **ministeria.** So *Agob.*: *Rig.*, mysteria.

9. **quale est.** This is a favourite interrogation with Tertullian, implying a *reductio ad absurdum.* Comp. ch. 14; *de ieiun.* 13 'Quale est autem ut tuo arbitrio permittas quod imperio Dei non das?' *de pud.* 15; *adv. Marc.* i, 23, 26; *de fug.* 5, 7; *de virg. vel.* 1.

12. **veritas imaginem antecedit.** This historical argument from the later rise of heresies was the common weapon of Catholic writers; Iren. iii. 4. 3; v. 20. 1; Clem. Alex. *Strom.* vii. 17; Hippolytus *apud* Euseb. vii. 28; Pacian, *Epist. ad Sempr.* 3. 3: comp. Tertullian, *adv. Marc.* i. 1, 20; iv. 5; v. 19; *adv. Herm.* 1; *adv. Prax.* 2; *de carn. Chr.* 2.

postremo. So *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*: post rem *Rig.*: post vero *Oehl.*

similitudo succedit: comp. *Apol.* 47, where the same argument is turned to demonstrate the superiority of the Christian doctrines over their heathen counterfeits; and *adv. Prax.* 2, where after setting forth the rule of faith, Tertullian proceeds, 'Hanc regulam ab initio evangelii decucurrisse, etiam ante priores quoque haereticos . . . probabit tam ipsa posteritas omnium haereticorum quam ipsa novellitas Praxeae hesterni. Quo peraeque adversus universas haereses iam hinc praeiudicatum sit id esse verum quodcunque primum, id esse adulterum quodcunque posterius.'

Ceterum satis ineptum, ut pro priori doctrina haeresis habeatur: vel quoniam ipsa est quae futuras haereses cavendas praenuntiabat. Ad eius doctrinae ecclesiam scriptum est, immo ipsa doctrina ad ecclesiam scribit: Etsi angelus de caelo aliter evangelizaverit citra quam nos, anathema sit.

CAPUT XXX.

UBI tunc Marcion, Ponticus nauclerus, Stoicae studiosus? Ubi Valentinus, Platonicae sectator? Nam constat illos neque adeo olim fuisse, Antonini fere principatu, et in catholicae primo doctrinam credidisse apud ecclesiam Romanensem, sub episcopatu Eleutheri benedicti; donec ob inquietam semper curiositatem, qua fratres quoque vitiabant,

1. **pro priori doctrina.** This is Oehler's emendation of *Agob.*, 'proprior in doctrina.' *Leid.* and nearly all edd. read 'prior in doctrina.' For 'in' *Routh* proposed 'illa.'

4. **Etsi angelus.** Gal. i. 8.

CHAP. XXX.—6. **Ponticus nauclerus.** Marcion's home was Sinope, of which city his father was bishop, Epiphan. *Haer.* 42; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6. Tertullian frequently calls him 'nauclerus' (*adv. Marc.* i. 18, iii. 6, iv. 9), either in allusion to the maritime pursuits of his countrymen, or because he was really a ship-owner. So Rhodon (*apud* Euseb. v. 13) speaks of him as *ναύτης*.

Stoicae studiosus: see note, ch. 7.

8. **Antonini**: A.D. 138–161. Comp. Iren. iii. 4. 2 'Valentinus enim venit Romam sub Hygino: increvit vero sub Pio, et prorogavit tempus usque ad Anicetum . . . Marcion autem illi succedens, invaluit sub Aniceto.' Iust. Mart. *Apol.* i. 26 (writing in the reign of Antoninus) *Μαρκίωνα δέ τινα Ποντικόν, ὃς καὶ νῦν ἔτι ἐστὶ διδάσκων τοὺς πειθομένους*, &c.; *adv. Marc.* i. 19 '[Marcion] Antoninianus haereticus, sub Pio impius'; v. 19.

9. **catholicae**: sc. 'ecclesiae.' So *Agob.*, *Rig.* African writers frequently use 'catholica' thus elliptically. *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, catholicam. On the early use of this word see Lightfoot, *Ignatius*, ii. 310.

10. **Eleutheri**: probably A.D. 174–189. But Tertullian is mistaken in dating the excommunication of Marcion and of Valentinus so late as this episcopate: see Salmon and Lipsius in *D.C.B.* iii. 818; iv. 1078.

11. **curiositatem**: see note, ch. 7.

qua . . . vitiabant: quam . . . vitabant *Agob.*

semel et iterum eiecti, Marcion quidem cum ducentis sestertiis quae ecclesiae intulerat, novissime in perpetuum discidium relegati, venena doctrinarum suarum disseminaverunt. Postmodum idem Marcion paenitentiam confessus, cum condicioni datae sibi occurrit, ita pacem recepturus, si ceteros, quos perditione erudisset, ecclesiae restitueret, morte praeventus est.

Oportebat enim haereses esse. Nec tamen ideo bonum haereses, quia eas esse oportebat. Quasi non et malum oportuerit esse: nam et Dominum tradi oportebat, sed Vae traditori, ne quis etiam hinc haereses defendat.

Si et Apellis stemma retractandum est, tam non vetus et ipse quam Marcion institutor et praeformator eius: sed lapsus

1. **semel et iterum eiecti**: comp. the lapses and relapses of Cerdon, mentioned by Irenaeus, iii. 4. 2; it is probable indeed that Tertullian has here related of Marcion what was really true of Cerdon. The apostasy of Valentinus is attributed to disappointed ambition: *adv. Val.* 4 'speraverat episcopatum Valentinus,' &c.

cum ducentis sestertiis. *Adv. Mar.* iv. 4 '[Evangelium Lucae] adeo antiquius Marcione est, ut et ipse illi Marcion crediderit, cum et pecuniam in primo calore fidei catholicae ecclesiae contulit, proiectam mox cum ipso, postea quam in haeresim suam a nostra veritate descivit.'

5. **condicioni datae sibi**: comp. Cyprian, *Epist.* 55. 9 of the reconciliation of Trophimus on the same terms; and Euseb. vi. 45 for Dionysius' counsel to Novatian to restore the unity of the brethren which he had disturbed.

pacem recepturus. 'Dare pacem' was the regular term for receiving the lapsed into communion, so that 'the peace' became a synonym for the Eucharist: Cyprian, *Epist.* 15, 18, 19, 27. The kiss of peace, 'osculum pacis,' or simply 'pax,' was a prominent feature in the Eucharistic service. The phrase recurs below, ch. 32; see also ch. 41, on the heretics' indiscriminate admission of all comers.

8. **Oportebat.** 1 Cor. xi. 19: comp. ch. 1.

10. **Vae traditori**: comp. S. Mark xiv. 21.

12. **stemma**, 'the pedigree'; but *Agob.* reads stigma, 'the mark of disgrace.'

13. **lapsus in feminam**: comp. *de carn. Chr.* 6, quoted above, note, ch. 6. This story suspiciously resembles that told by Epiphanius, *Haer.* 42, and Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6, of Marcion at Sinope; and it is no

in feminam, desertor continentiae Marcionensis, ab oculis sanctissimi magistri Alexandriam secessit. Inde post annos regressus non melior, nisi tantum qua iam non Marcionites, in alteram feminam impegit, illam virginem Philumenen, quam supra edidimus, postea vero immane prostibulum et ipsam, cuius energemate circumventus, quae ab ea didicit Phaneroseis scripsit. Adhuc in saeculo supersunt qui meminerint eorum, etiam proprii discentes et successores ipsorum, ne posteriores negare possint.

Quamquam et de operibus suis, ut dixit Dominus, revincuntur. Si enim Marcion novum testamentum a vetere separavit, posterior est eo quod separavit, quia separare non posset, nisi quod unitum fuit. Unitum ergo antequam

referred to by any other writers. Both may have originated in the misunderstanding of some figurative phrase: see note, ch. 44.

1. **continentiae Marcionensis.** The strict asceticism and moral purity of Marcion's life are established beyond all doubt by the fact that Tertullian, who labours to find language severe enough to express his hatred of the man, clearly acquits him of immorality: see *adv. Marc.* i. 1, 29; iv. 11.

4. **in alteram feminam impegit.** From the phrase 'eversus spiritu,' not 'carne' (*de carn. Chr.* 6), it is clear in what sense Tertullian intended this expression. On **impegit**, see note, ch. 4.

Philumenen. Ch. 6.

5. **prostibulum.** This charge against Philumena, if not a figure of speech, is unsupported by any other authority, and may be set down to scandal. Not even Tertullian alleges any criminality between herself and Apelles.

6. **cuius energemate circumventus,** 'misled by whose influence': **energema** refers to the influence of the evil spirit (ch. 6) with which Tertullian believed her to be possessed. The word recurs in the same connexion *de carn. Chr.* 24 'ad energema Apelleiacae virginis Philumenes': comp. Hieronym. *Comment. in Gal.* i. 8; *Epist.* 133. 4.

7. **Phaneroseis scripsit.** It appears from Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 6, that Apelles caused public lections to be read from this book of 'Manifestations' dictated by Philumena: **scripsit** = 'wrote at her dictation': comp. Hippol. *adv. haer.* x. 20.

8. **discentes**: see note, ch. 3.

10. **ut dixit Dominus.** S. Matt. vii. 16.

separaretur, postea factum separatum posteriorem ostendit separatorem. Item Valentinus, aliter exponens, et sine dubio emendans, hoc omnino quicquid emendat, ut mendosum retro, alterius fuisse demonstrat.

Hos ut insigniores et frequentiores adulteros veritatis nominamus. Ceterum et Nigidius nescio qui, et Hermogenes, et multi alii adhuc ambulant pervertentes vias Domini. Ostendant mihi ex qua auctoritate prodierint? Si alium Deum praedicant, quomodo eius Dei rebus et litteris et nominibus utuntur, adversus quem praedicant? Si eundem, quomodo aliter? Probent se novos apostolos esse: dicant Christum iterum descendisse, iterum ipsum docuisse, iterum crucifixum, iterum mortuum, iterum resuscitatum. Sic enim apostolus descripsit [eum] apostolos solere facere;

4. **alterius.** So *Agob.*: anterius *Rig.*, *Fulv. Urs.*

6. **Nigidius nescio qui.** Of Nigidius nothing is known (Hilgenfeld, *Ketzergeschichte*, 554). Hermogenes is attacked in an extant treatise of Tertullian.

8. **Ostendant mihi**: comp. *de carn. Chr.* 2 'Ex qua, oro te, auctoritate? si apostolus, praedica publice; si apostolicus, cum apostolis senti.' The argument is imitated by Optatus, iii. 11; and Pacian, *Epist.* 3.

9. **quomodo eius Dei rebus**: comp. *de carn. Chr.* 6 'Sed tamen quale est ut alterius regulae fides ab ea fide quam impugnat instrumentum argumentationibus suis mutuetur? Si alius Deus est, aliter sint res eius. Sed utantur haeretici omnes scripturis eius cuius utuntur etiam mundo.'

14. **Sic enim apostolus, &c.** There is an old-standing corruption of the text here. *Agob.* reads Sic enim apostolus descripsit. Solet facere dare, &c. *Leid.* and edd., Sic enim apostolos solet facere; dare, &c., which is simple enough, but does not account for the insertion of 'descripsit' in *Agob.* *Rigalt* proposed to omit 'solet facere' from the text of *Agob.*, and to understand 'Dicant' before 'dare':—thus, Sic enim apostolus descripsit. [Dicant] dare, &c., which gives good sense, but arbitrarily omits *facere*. *Oehler* boldly repeats 'sic enim,' punctuating thus, Sic enim apostolus descripsit, sic enim apostolos solet facere, dare, &c.; but the change of subject from 'apostolus' in the first clause to [Christus] in the second is very harsh. In the impossibility of rescuing the original words I have preferred to print the passage as

dare illis praeterea virtutem, eadem signa edendi, quae et ipse. Volo igitur et virtutes eorum proferri: nisi quod agnosco maximam virtutem eorum, qua apostolos in perversum aemulantur. Illi enim de mortuis vivos faciebant, isti de vivis mortuos faciunt.

CAPUT XXXI.

SED ab excessu revertar ad principalitatem veritatis et posteritatem mendacitatis disputandam, ex illius quoque parabolae patrocinio, quae bonum semen frumenti a Domino seminatum in primore constituit, avenarum autem sterilis faeni adulterium ab inimico diabolo postea superducit. Proprie enim doctrinarum distinctionem figurat, quia et alibi verbum Dei seminis similitudo est. Ita ex ipso ordine manifestatur, id esse dominicum et verum, quod sit prius traditum: id autem extraneum et falsum, quod sit posterius immissum. Ea sententia manebit adversus posteriores quasque haereses, quibus nulla constantia de conscientia competit ad defendendam sibi veritatem.

CAPUT XXXII.

CETERUM, si quae audent interserere se aetati apostolicae,

it stands in the text, recognizing the peculiarity of *Agob.*, and supplying 'apostolos' before 'solere' from *Leid.*

2. **virtutes**: see note, ch. 13.

CHAP. XXXI.—6. **principalitatem**: 'pre-eminence,' 'priority': so again *de anim.* 13. 'Principalitatem dicit quod statim a primordio fuit, posteritatem quod postea subrepsit' (*Rigalt*). 'Principalitas' stands for ἀρχή, Iren. i. 31. 1; ii. 1. 2; iii. 3. 1; v. 14.

7. **disputandam.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.*: deputandam *reliqui.*

8. **parabolae.** S. Matt. xiii. 37 ff.

9. **avenarum,** 'wild oats' Cato, *de re rust.* 37. 4: comp. Plin. *N.H.* xviii. 17. § 149 'Primum omnium frumenti vitium avena est.'

10. **faeni**: properly 'hay': here, 'weed.'

CHAP. XXXII.—18. **Ceterum, si quae audent.** Having dealt with the question of date and late origin, Tertullian now brings forward

ut ideo videantur ab apostolis traditae, quia sub apostolis fuerunt, possumus dicere: Edant ergo origines ecclesiarum suarum; evolvant ordinem episcoporum suorum, ita per successionem ab initio decurrentem, ut primus ille episcopus aliquem ex apostolis, vel apostolicis viris qui tamen cum apostolis perseveraverit, habuerit auctorem et antecessorem. Hoc enim modo ecclesiae apostolicae census suos deferunt: sicut Smyrnaeorum ecclesia Polycarpum ab Ioanne collocatum refert; sicut Romanorum Clementem a Petro ordinatum

another argument, applicable to heresies which claimed to have existed from Apostolic times. The episcopal succession in each church from the Apostles forms the test of catholicity, and is the guarantee for the transmission of a pure faith. This appears to have been a very natural and usual argument in the early church. It is used by Hegesippus (*apud* Euseb. iv. 22, see Lightfoot, *Philippians*, p. 239; *Clem. Rom.* i. 154); by Irenaeus very fully, whom Tertullian here copies (see especially iii. 2, 3, 4; iv. 40. 2; 53. 2; v. 20; with Harvey's notes); and by Tertullian again *adv. Marc.* iv. 5; *Apol.* 47.

7. **census**: see note on *censeatur*, ch. 20.

8. **Smyrnaeorum ecclesia Polycarpum.** Iren. iii. 3. 4 Πολύκαρπος . . . ὑπὸ Ἀποστόλων κατασταθεὶς εἰς τὴν Ἀσίαν ἐν τῇ ἐν Σμύρνῃ ἐκκλησίᾳ ἐπίσκοπος . . . ταῦτα διδάξας ἀεί, ἃ καὶ παρὰ τῶν Ἀποστόλων ἔμαθεν, ἃ καὶ ἡ ἐκκλησία παραδίδωσιν, ἃ καὶ μόνα ἐστὶν ἀληθῆ. See Lightfoot, *Ignatius*, i. 441.

9. **Romanorum Clementem a Petro.** This statement is opposed to the traditional order of the early Roman succession witnessed to by Irenaeus, iii. 1. 1; 3. 3; by Eusebius, *H. E.* iii. 2, 4, 13, 15, 21; by Jerome *de vir. illustr.* 15; *Chron. Dom.* 12; by Epiphanius, *Haer.* xxvii. 6 (who probably reproduced Hegesippus, see Lightfoot, *Clem. Rom.* i. 329 ff.); and by Ruffinus, *Praef. in Recogn.*; who all insert Linus and Anencletus between Peter and Clement. Nor does it find support in the Liberian Catalogue, which placed Clement immediately after Linus. The immediate appointment of Clement by Peter is found only in the Clementine fictions (Lightfoot, *u. s.* i. 64, 158, 344) which, though valueless historically, greatly influenced popular opinion in the West. Hence Jerome, *de vir. illustr.* 15, after naming the true Irenaean order, adds 'tametsi plerique Latinorum secundum post Petrum apostolum fuisse Clementem': comp. *adv. Iovinian.* i. 12 'Clemens successor apostoli Petri'; *Comm. in Isaiam*, lii. 13 'Clemens vir apostolicus qui post Petrum Romanam rexit ecclesiam'; and the guesses of Epiphanius and Ruffinus, *ll. cc.*, and of the writer of the *Apost. Const.* vii. 46. 1

itidem. Perinde utique et ceterae exhibent quos ab apostolis in episcopatum constitutos apostolici seminis traduces habeant.

Confingant tale aliquid haeretici. Quid enim illis post blasphemiam illicitum est? Sed etsi confinxerint, nihil promovebunt. Ipsa enim doctrina eorum cum apostolica comparata, ex diversitate et contrarietate sua pronuntiabit, neque apostoli alicuius auctoris esse, neque apostolici; quia sicut apostoli non diversa inter se docuissent, ita et apostolici non contraria apostolis edidissent, nisi illi qui ab apostolis didicerunt aliter praedicaverunt. Ad hanc itaque formam probabuntur ab illis ecclesiis, quae licet nullum ex apostolis vel apostolicis auctorem suum proferant, ut multo posteriores, quae denique cottidie instituuntur, tamen in eadem fide conspirantes non minus apostolicae deputantur pro consanguinitate doctrinae.

Ita omnes haereses ad utramque formam a nostris ecclesiis provocatae probent se quaqua putant apostolicas. Sed adeo nec sunt, nec probare possunt quod non sunt; nec recipiuntur in pacem et communicationem ab ecclesiis quoquo modo apostolicis, scilicet, ob diversitatem sacramenti nullo modo apostolicae.

CAPUT XXXIII.

ADHIBEO super haec ipsarum doctrinarum recognitionem, quae tunc sub apostolis fuerunt, ab isdem apostolis et

Τῆς δὲ Ῥωμαίων ἐκκλησίας Λίνος μὲν ὁ Κλαυδίας πρῶτος ὑπὸ Παύλου, Κλήμης δὲ μετὰ τὸν Λίνου θάνατον ὑπ' ἐμοῦ Πέτρου δεύτερος κεχειροτόνηται [*ἐπίσκοπος*]. On the whole subject of the early Roman succession, see Lightfoot, *u. s.* i. 201 ff.

3. **traduces**: see note, ch. 20.

11. **didicerunt**. So *Agob.*, *Rig.*: discesserunt, *Clem.*: desciverunt *rel.*

14. **denique**: see note, ch. 2.

17. **ad utramque formam**, i.e. Apostolic succession and Apostolic doctrine.

19. **recipiuntur in pacem**: see note, ch. 30.

21. **sacramenti**, 'doctrine': see note, ch. 20.

demonstratae et deieratae. Nam et sic facilius traducentur, dum aut iam tunc fuisse deprehenduntur, aut ex illis quae iam tunc fuerunt seminia sumpsisse.

Paulus in prima ad Corinthios notat negatores et dubitatores resurrectionis: haec opinio propria Sadducaeorum. Partem eius usurpat Marcion et Apelles et Valentinus, et si qui alii resurrectionem carnis infringunt. Et ad Galatas scribens, invehitur in observatores et defensores circumcisionis et legis: Hebionis haeresis sic est.

Chap. XXXIII.—1. **deieratae**, = 'eieratae,' 'reprobatae.'

traducentur. Tertullian commonly uses 'traducere' in the sense of 'patefacere,' 'revincere'; e.g. *de fug.* 2, 12; *ad Scap.* 2; *adv. Marc.* iii. 4; iv. 25, 36; *de anim.* 1. Similarly the subst. 'traductio' = 'exposure, refutation,' above ch. 22; *adv. Marc.* ii. 20. 'Traductio,' 'traducere' are the words regularly employed by the Latin translator of Irenaeus for ἔλεγχος, ἐλέγχειν: e.g. iii. *praef.*, 4. 2; v. *praef.*, 21. 2.

3. **seminia.** So *Agob.*: semina *reliqui.*

4. **ad Corinthios.** 1 Cor. xv. 12.

5. **Sadducaeorum.** S. Matt. xxii. 23; Acts xxiii. 8: comp. *de res. carn.* 36.

6. **Marcion.** *Adv. Marc.* v. 10. This was not a prominent or characteristic tenet of Marcion, though the denial of the resurrection did form a part of his teaching in common with that of all Gnostics, being in fact a corollary from their fundamental belief as to the inherent malignity of matter: comp. Iren. i. 25. 2 '[Marcion docuit] corpus autem, videlicet quoniam a terra sit sumptum, impossibile esse participare salutem.' Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 1 (Basilides).

8. **ad Galatas.** Gal. v. 2.

9. **Hebionis.** The supposition of a heresiarch Ebion is first found in Tertullian: comp. *de carn. Chr.* 14, 18; *de virg. vel.* 6; but it is now agreed that no such individual existed. The name 'Ebionite' comes from the Hebrew אֶבְיוֹן 'poor,' and was no doubt a self-assumed title of these heretics in allusion to their voluntary poverty. Origen, *de prin.* iv. 22, followed by Euseb. *H. E.* iii. 27 *ad fin.* explains it as a term of reproach applied to them because of the poverty of their intellect; but elsewhere, *contr. Cels.* ii. 1 from the poverty of the Jewish Law to which they adhered. Eusebius also *l. c.* asserts that they were so called because of their mean and beggarly conceptions of the Person of Christ. Comp. Epiph. *Haer.* xxx. 17.

haeresis sic est. The heresy and the name Ἐβιωναῖοι, Ebionaei,

Timotheum instruens nuptiarum quoque interdictores suggillat: ita instituunt Marcion et Apelles eius secutor. Aeque tangit eos qui dicerent factam iam resurrectionem: id de se Valentiniani asseverant. Sed et cum genealogias indeterminatas nominat, Valentinus agnoscitur, apud quem Aeon ille nescio qui novi et non unius nominis generat ex sua Charite Sensum et Veritatem: et hi aeque procreant ex se Sermonem et Vitam; dehinc et isti generant Hominem et Ecclesiam; de qua prima ogdoade Aeonum exinde decem alii, et duodecim reliqui Aeones miris nominibus oriuntur in meram fabulam triginta Aeonum. Idem apostolus, cum improbat elementis

first occur in Irenaeus, i. 22, where their Judaizing tendencies are clearly stated; 'perseverant in his consuetudinibus quae sunt secundum legem et Iudaico charactere vitae': comp. Hippol. *adv. haer.* x. 22 Ζῶσι δὲ πάντα κατὰ νόμον Μωϋσῇ, οὕτω φάσκοντες δικαιοῦσθαι. For other early references to Ebionitism see Iren. iv. 52. 1; v. 1. 3. Hippol. vii. 22, x. 18; and the passages collected in Schliemann, *Die Clementinen*, p. 471. Nitzch, *Dogmeng.* p. 37 ff.; Harnack, *Dogmeng.* i. 226 ff.

1. **Timotheum.** 1 Tim. iv. 3.

suggillat, 'cudgels': see note, ch. 8.

3. **factam iam resurrectionem.** 2 Tim. ii. 18. Cp. *de res. carn.* 19 'Itaque [dicunt] et resurrectionem eam vindicandam qua quis adita veritate redanimatus et revivificatus Deo ignorantiae morte discussa velut de sepulchro veteris hominis eruperit . . . Exinde ergo resurrectionem fide consecutos cum Domino esse cum eum in baptismate induerint.' Iren. ii. 48. 2 'Tantum autem absunt ab eo ut mortuum excitent . . . ut ne quidem credant hoc in totum posse fieri: esse autem resurrectionem a mortuis, agnitionem eius, quae ab eis dicitur, veritatis.'

4. **Valentiniani.** Many of the Gnostics and Docetae admitted a 'spiritual' resurrection.

genealogias indeterminatas. 1 Tim. i. 4.

5. **Valentinus.** See Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 2, where the system is more fully, but somewhat confusedly, described.

6. **novi et non unius nominis.** Comp. *adv. Val.* 7 '[Valentinianorum deus] substantialiter quidem Αἰῶνα Τέλειον appellant, personaliter vero Προαρχὴν et Τὴν Ἀρχήν, etiam Bython'; Iren. i. 1. 1.

7. **Sensum** = Νοῦν, Iren. *l. c.*

8. **de qua** = 'ex qua.'

11. **elementis servientes.** Gal. iv. 9.

servientes, aliquid Hermogenis ostendit, qui materiam non natam introducens, Deo non nato eam comparat; et ita matrem elementorum deam faciens, potest ei servire, quam Deo comparat.

Ioannes vero in Apocalypsi idolothyta edentes et stupra committentes iubetur castigare. Sunt et nunc alii Nicolaitae. Gaiana haeresis dicitur. At in epistula eos maxime antichristos vocat, qui Christum negarent in carne venisse, et qui non putarent Iesum esse Filium Dei: illud Marcion,

1. **aliquid Hermogenis**: *adv. Herm.* 4 'Hinc denique incipiam de materia retractare, quod eam Deus sibi compareat proinde non natam, proinde non factam, proinde eternam sine initio, sine fine propositam.'

5. **Apocalypsi.** Rev. ii. 14.

6. **Nicolaitae.** On these heretics, named from Nicolas the Deacon, whose teaching they probably perverted, see Iren. i. 23, iii. 11. 7, who is followed by Hippolytus, vii. 36; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 1; Epiph. *Haer.* xxv. Clem. Alex. *Strom.* ii. 20, iii. 4 (pp. 411, 436, Paris ed.) gives an independent account quoted by Euseb. *H. E.* iii. 29, and followed by Theodore, *Haer. fab.* iii. 1. The sect is mentioned also Apost. Const. vi. 8; Ps.-Ignat. *Trall.* 11; *Phil.* 6, and in every case denounced for its impurities. Nothing is certainly known of the Nicolaitans beyond what is said in the Apocalypse, nor is there any evidence of their continuance as a sect after the death of the Apostle John.

7. **Gaiana haeresis.** So *Agob.*, *Leid.*, and again *de bapt.* 1. The name takes various forms in different writers, see *D. C. B.* i. 380, but the sect is generally known as the 'Cainite,' a branch of the Ophites. They probably derived their appellation from a current interpretation of the name 'Cain'; *Clem. Hom.* iii. 25, 42 Κάϊν ὃ ἑρμηνεύεται ζῆλος (קנא). Their tenets are described by Irenaeus, i. 28. 9; Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 2; Epiph. *Haer.* 38. They regarded the Creator as an evil being, and reversed the moral judgements of the O. T., opposing all Christian principles and making immorality a necessary part of their religion. Hence Tertullian terms them 'modern Nicolaitans.' Harvey, *Iren.* i. 214, note 1, has misunderstood Tertullian's words to imply an identification of the two sects.

in epistula. 1 John iv. 3.

8. **carne**, carnem, *Agob.*

9. **illud Marcion.** Marcion, in accordance with his Gnostic beliefs, denied that Christ had a real earthly body, or a human birth. The latter would have involved in Marcion's view Christ's subjection

hoc Hebion vindicavit. Simonianae autem magiae disciplina angelis serviens, utique et ipsa inter idololatrias deputabatur, et a Petro apostolo in ipso Simone damnabatur.

CAPUT XXXIV.

HAEC sunt, ut arbitror, genera doctrinarum adulterinarum, quae sub apostolis fuisse ab ipsis apostolis discimus: et tamen nullam invenimus institutionem inter tot diversitates perversitatum, quae de Deo creatore universorum controversiam moverit. Nemo alterum Deum ausus est suspicari. Facilius de Filio quam de Patre haesitabatur, donec Marcion praeter creatorem alium Deum solius bonitatis induceret; Apelles creatorem, angelum nescio quem gloriosum superioris Dei faceret Deum legis et Israëlis, illum igneum affirmans; Valentinus Aeonas suos spargeret, et unius Aeonis vitium in originem deduceret Dei creatoris. His solis et his primis revelata est veritas divinitatis, maiorem scilicet dignationem et pleniorem gratiam a diabolo consecutis, qui Deum sic

to the Demiurge. His Christology is described by Hippolytus, *adv. haer.* x. 19 *Τὸν δὲ Χριστὸν υἱὸν εἶναι τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ καὶ ὑπ' αὐτοῦ πεπέμφθαι ἐπὶ σωτηρίᾳ τῶν ψυχῶν, ὃν ἔσω ἄνθρωπον καλεῖ, ὡς ἄνθρωπον φανέντα λέγων, οὐκ ὄντα ἄνθρωπον, καὶ ὡς ἔνσαρκον, οὐκ ἔνσαρκον, δοκήσει πεφηνότα, οὔτε γένεσιν ὑπομείναντα οὔτε πάθος, ἀλλὰ τῷ δοκεῖν.* Comp. notes Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 3, 6.

1. **hoc Hebion.** The Ebionite Christology was purely psilanthropic, regarding Jesus simply as the son of Joseph and Mary, agreeing in this point with the tenets of Cerinthus and Carpocrates. Iren. i. 22; Hippol. vii. 34; Epiph. *Haer.* 30: comp. Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 3.

Simonianae. Acts viii. 9 ff.; Iren. i. 16; Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 1.

CHAP. XXXIV.—10. **Deum solius bonitatis**: see above, ch. 7.

11. **angelum**: see above, ch. 7; comp. *de res. carn.* 5 'Futile et frivolum istud corpusculum . . . etsi ignei alicuius exstructio aeque angeli, ut Apelles docet,' &c.; *de carn. Chr.* 8; *de anim.* 23 'Apelles solicitatas refert animas terrenis escis de supercaelestibus sedibus ab igneo angelo, deo Israelis et nostro,' &c.

13. **unius Aeonis vitium.** The fall of Sophia from the Pleroma; see note, ch. 7.

quoque voluerit aemulari, ut de doctrinis venenorum, quod Dominus negavit, ipse faceret discipulos super magistrum.

Eligant igitur sibi tempora universae haereses, quae quando fuerint, dummodo intersit quae quando, dum de veritate non sint et utique quae sub apostolis non fuerunt, fuisse non possint. Si autem fuissent, nominarentur et ipsae, ut et ipsae coercendae essent. Quae vero sub apostolis non fuerunt, in sua nominatione damnantur. Sive ergo eaedem nunc sunt aliquanto expolitiores, quae sub apostolis rudes, habent suam exinde damnationem: sive aliae quidem fuerunt, aliae autem postea obortae, quasdam ex illis opiniones usurpaverunt, habendo cum eis consortium praedicationis, habeant necesse est etiam consortium damnationis; praecedente illo fine supradicto posteritatis, quo etsi nihil de damnaticiis participarent, de aetate sola praeiudicarentur; tanto magis adulterae, quanto nec ab apostolis nominatae. Unde firmius constat, has esse, quae adhuc tunc nuntiabantur futurae.

CAPUT XXXV.

HIS definitionibus provocatae a nobis et revictae haereses omnes, sive quae posterae, sive quae coaetaneae apostolorum,

1. **aemulari**: see note, *Apol.* 2. 'Aemulus' and its kindred words are constantly used by Tertullian for 'inimicus,' &c., e. g. below, ch. 40. 'Aemulus' is uniformly used of the devil, *de spect.* 8.

4. **dummodo intersit.** An ironical parenthesis, *more Tertulliani*, the misunderstanding of which has led to many alterations of the passage. The text follows *Agob.* throughout, with the exception of the insertion of 'quae' after 'utique.' *Oehler* prints 'dum non intersit,' which is nonsense. *Routh* conjectured 'cum non intersit.'

5. **et utique, &c.** *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.* omit 'et' before 'utique,' and read 'possunt' for 'possint.' *Rig.* following the conjecture of *Fulv. Ursin.* altered and recast the text—'Utique quae ab apostolis nominatae non fuerunt, sub apostolis fuisse non possunt.'

7. **Quae sub apostolis non fuerunt.** The heresies mentioned above of Marcion, Valentinus, and Apelles.

14. **quo etsi.** *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*; quod etsi *Agob.*, *Oehl.*

dummodo diversae; sive generaliter, sive specialiter notatae ab eis, dummodo praedamnatae; audeant respondere et ipsae aliquas eiusmodi praescriptiones adversus nostram disciplinam. Si enim negant veritatem eius, debent probare illam quoque haeresin esse, eadem forma revictam, qua ipsae revincuntur; et ostendere simul ubinam quaerenda sit veritas, quam apud illas non esse iam constat.

Posterior nostra res non est, immo omnibus prior est, et hoc erit testimonium veritatis ubique occupantis principatum: apostolis ubique non damnatur, immo defenditur, hoc erit indicium proprietatis. Quam enim non damnant, qui extraneam quamque damnaverunt, suam ostendunt, ideoque et defendunt.

CAPUT XXXVI.

AGE iam qui voles curiositatem melius exercere in negotio salutis tuae, percurre ecclesias apostolicas, apud quas ipsae adhuc cathedrae apostolorum suis locis praesident; apud quas [ipsae] authenticae litterae eorum recitantur, sonantes

CHAP. XXXV.—3. **disciplinam**: see note, ch. 6.

CHAP. XXXVI.—14. **Age iam.** The argument of this chapter is a striking rhetorical expansion of Iren. iii. 3. 1; cp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 5.

15. **ipsae adhuc cathedrae.** Comp. the legend in Euseb. *H. E.* vii. 19 of the preservation in his day of the *θρόνος* of S. James at Jerusalem; but see note below.

16. **suis locis praesident,** 'have jurisdiction over their own districts'; see Lightfoot, *Ignatius*, ii. 190.

17. **[ipsae]**: omitted, perhaps rightly, by *Leid.*

authenticae litterae, 'authentic epistles,' the churches immediately named being examples of those to which epistles were addressed. Tertullian uses 'authenticus' in the sense rather of 'genuine,' 'true,' than of 'original'; and here the contrast is implied between the true text preserved by the Apostolic Churches, and the mutilated or corrupt copies used by the heretics. For the meaning of *authenticus* see *adv. Marc.* iv. 35 '[Christus] erat authenticus Pontifex Dei Patris'; *adv. Val.* 4 'de ecclesia authenticae regulae abrupit.' So too perhaps *de monog.* 11 'Sciamus plane non sic esse *in Graeco authentico* quomodo in usum exiit,' where the italicized words may

vocem et repraesentantes faciem uniuscuiusque. Proxima est tibi Achaia? Habes Corinthum. Si non longe es a Macedonia, habes Philippos. Si potes in Asiam tendere, habes Ephesum. Si autem Italiae adiaces, habes Romam, unde nobis quoque auctoritas praesto est. Ista quam felix ecclesia cui totam doctrinam apostoli cum sanguine suo profuderunt: ubi Petrus passioni dominicae adaequatur; ubi

simply mean 'in the genuine text,' and not necessarily contain an implied contrast to the Latin Version. In the present passage, Tertullian no more meant to assert the possession of the Apostolic autographs by Apostolic Churches than their possession of the very charis used by the Apostles.

1. **repraesentantes.** 'Repraesentare' is a legal term, 'to bring into court,' and so 'to exhibit a thing and make it present to the senses or the mind.' So *Apol.* 17 (see note), *de spect.* 17; *de paen.* 3; *adv. Marc.* i. 14 'panem quo ipsum corpus suum repraesentat'; *ib.* iv. 22. So 'repraesentatio,' 'the actuality' is opposed to 'visio,' *de coron.* 15: cp. *Pass. S. Perp.* 1 'quasi repraesentatione rerum,' *Texts and Studies*, i. 2, p. 9.

3. **Philippos.** *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.* add 'habes Thessalonicenses'; but the adjectival form of the words suggests that they were the insertion of a copyist desirous of mentioning the other Macedonian Church to which S. Paul wrote.

4. **Romam unde nobis.** *Adv. Marc.* iv. 5 'Videamus . . . quid etiam Romani de proximo sonent, quibus evangelium et Petrus et Paulus sanguine quoque suo signatum reliquerunt.' The African Church was not founded by an Apostle, but from Italy. Rome was therefore its natural authority. Indeed as the only 'Apostolic' Church of the West, and in deference to its unique foundation and history, the Roman Church was generally regarded as the great depositary of Apostolic tradition (Iren. iii. 3. 1); yet still only as 'one witness to the truth,' and as standing to the West in no different position from that of Corinth or Ephesus to their respective localities. See Pusey, *Rule of Faith*, p. 31.

6. **totam doctrinam**, without any reservation such as the heretics asserted, ch. 25.

7. **Petrus . . . adaequatur.** Tertullian (here and *Scorp.* 15) is the first to relate that S. Peter suffered martyrdom by crucifixion; Origen *apud* Euseb. iii. 1 adds that he was crucified head-downwards. The martyrdom is mentioned by Clement of Rome, *Corinth.* 5, but neither the place nor the manner is specified. Dionysius of Corinth

Paulus Ioannis exitu coronatur; ubi apostolus Ioannes, posteaquam in oleum igneum demersus nihil passus est, in insulam relegatur. Videamus quid didicerit, quid docuerit, quid cum Africanis quoque ecclesiis contesserarit. Unum Deum novit, creatorem universitatis, et Christum Iesum ex Virgine Maria Filium Dei creatoris, et carnis resurrectionem: legem et prophetas cum evangelicis et apostolicis litteris miscet; inde potat fidem; eam aqua signat, Sancto Spiritu vestit, eucharistia pascit, martyrio exhortatur, et ita adversus hanc institutionem neminem recipit.

apud Euseb. ii. 25 asserts that S. Peter and S. Paul both suffered at Rome and about the same time. Tradition generally affirmed that both apostles were martyred in the same year, if not on the same day, but on no sufficient grounds. Indeed the date of S. Peter's death is most uncertain. On his connexion with Rome see Lightfoot, *Clem. Rom.* ii. 481 ff.

1. **Paulus.** S. Peter and S. Paul are constantly mentioned together in connexion with the Roman Church; Clem. Rom. *Corinth.* 5; Ignatius, *Rom.* 4; Dionys. Cor., and Caius *apud* Euseb. ii. 25; and the beheadal of S. Paul under Nero is historically established.

Ioannis. John the Baptist.

exitu: see note, ch. 2.

Ioannes . . . passus est. Comp. Hieronym. *ad Matt.* xx. 23. This tradition has no historical value. For its possible source see Salmon, *Introduction to N. T.* p. 382.

4. **contesserarit**: see note, ch. 20.

Unum Deum, &c. The points of belief specially singled out for mention are those impugned by the Gnostics:—the Unity of God, the real Incarnation by a virgin-birth, the resurrection of the flesh, and the unity of Holy Scripture: chs. 33, 42.

8. **miscet,** 'unites'; for this sense of 'miscere,' see above, ch. 27. *Apol.* 21 (see note); *ib.* 39; *adv. Marc.* ii. 27; Iren. iii. 18. 3; Leo, *Serm.* 23 *in nat. Dom.* iii.

signat. A frequent expression for Holy Baptism is 'signaculum fidei,' *de spect.* 24; or simply 'signaculum nostrum,' *ib.* 4.

Spiritu vestit. Comp. *de bapt.* 13 'obsignatio baptismi, vestimentum quodammodo fidei, quae retro erat unda'; *de monog.* 7, where the 'clothing' is attributed to Christ.

9. **martyrio.** The ablative is read in *Gel.*, *Pam.*, and seems demanded by the context. *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Vat.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Rig.* give 'martyrium.'

Haec est institutio, non dico iam quae futuras haereses praenuntiabat, sed de qua haereses prodierunt. Sed non sunt ex illa, ex quo factae sunt adversus illam. Etiam de olivae nucleo mitis et opimae et necessariae asper oleaster oritur; etiam de papavere ficus gratissimae et suavissimae ventosa et vana caprificus exsurgit. Ita et haereses de nostro fructice, non nostro genere, [de] veritatis grano, sed mendacio silvestres.

CAPUT XXXVII.

SI haec ita se habent, ut veritas nobis adiudicetur, quicumque in ea regula incedimus, quam ecclesia ab apostolis, apostoli a Christo, Christus a Deo tradidit; constat ratio propositi nostri, definientis non esse admittendos haereticos ad ineundam de scripturis provocationem, quos sine scripturis probamus ad scripturas non pertinere.

Si enim haeretici sunt, Christiani esse non possunt, non a Christo habendo quod de sua electione sectati haereticorum

5. **de papavere ficus**, 'from the seed of the fig': 'papavere' = 'semine.'

6. **caprificus.** Comp. Plin. *H. N.* xv. 19, § 79 'Caprificus vocatur e silvestri genere ficus nunquam maturescens.'

7. **[de] veritatis grano**: 'de' is not found in the MSS., but seems to be required. The text follows *Agob.*, *Rig.* Most edd. with *Leid.*, *Gorz.* read 'haereses de nostro fructicaverunt, non nostrae: degeneres veritatis grano, et mendacio silvestres.'

CHAP. XXXVII.—11. **ratio propositi nostri**: ch. 15.

15. **Christiani esse non possunt.** Comp. above, chs. 7, 14, 16; Cyprian. *de eccl. unit.* 14 'nec Christianus videri potest qui non permanet in evangelii eius et fidei veritate'; Salvian. *de Gub. Dei*, iv. 1 'qui Christiani nominis opus non agit Christianus non esse videtur'; Augustin. *Epist.* 1 *ad Serap.* § 28. Error in action, as well as error in belief, deprived men of the right to the Christian name, see *Apol.* 44.

non a Christo habendo. Christians are so named from Christ, but heretics from their self-chosen leaders or opinions. Comp. Ignatius, *Magn.* 10; *Rom.* 3; Epiph. *Haer.* 42; Pacian. *Epist.* 1; Lactant. *Inst. Div.* iv. 30 'Cum enim Phryges, aut Novatiani, aut Valentiniani, aut Marcionitae, aut Anthropiani, aut Ariani, seu quilibet alii nomi-

nomine admittunt. Ita non Christiani, nullum ius capiunt Christianarum litterarum ad quos merito dicendum est: Qui estis? quando et unde venistis? quid in meo agitis, non mei? quo denique, Marcion, iure silvam meam caedis? qua licentia, Valentine, fontes meos transvertis? qua potestate, Apelles, limites meos commoves? Mea est possessio. Quid hic, ceteri, ad voluntatem vestram seminatis et pascitis? Mea est possessio, olim possideo, prior possideo, habeo origines firmas ab ipsis auctoribus, quorum fuit res. Ego sum heres apostolorum. Sicut caverunt testamento suo, sicut fidei commiserunt, sicut adiuraverunt, ita teneo. Vos certe exheredaverunt semper et abdicaverunt, ut extraneos, ut inimicos. Unde autem extranei et inimici apostolis haeretici, nisi ex diversitate doctrinae, quam unusquisque de suo arbitrio adversus apostolos aut protulit, aut recepit?

nantur, Christiani esse desierunt, qui Christi nomine amisso humana et externa vocabula induerunt.' Athan. *Orat. c. Ar.* i. 3.

1. **non Christiani**, i. e. 'haeretici.'

4. **denique**: see note, ch. 2.

Marcion . . . Valentine. The one excised, the other perverted: see next chapter.

silvam meam caedis? For the metaphor comp. *Apol.* 4 'squalentam silvam legum caeditis'; *de anim.* 3; *de coron.* 10; *de pud.* 16; *ad nat.* ii. 9.

6. **Apelles.** Who imitated his master in the mutilation of Scripture; Hippol. x. 38 *τῶν δὲ εὐαγγελίων, ἢ τοῦ ἀποστόλου τὰ μὴ ἀρέσκοντα αὐτῷ αἱρεῖται.*

8. **origines firmas**, 'sure title-deeds.'

10. **caverunt.** This is the technical legal sense of 'cavere,' 'to dispose,' 'decree by will or in writing.' Comp. Cicero, *in Verr.* ii. 1. 11; *de fin.* ii. 31. 103; Sueton. *Aug.* 1, *et saep.*

fidei commiserunt. 1 Tim. i. 18; 2 Tim. i. 14, ii. 2; Tit. i. 5.

11. **adiuraverunt.** 1 Tim. v. 21, vi. 13; 2 Tim. iv. 1.

12. **abdicaverunt.** The technical law-term in late Latin for 'disinheriting,' 'disowning'; Quint. iii. 6. 97 *et saep.*; *Apol.* 3, 6; *de exh. cast.* 13.

extraneos, 'aliens,' 'outsiders'; so *Apol.* 7, 16, 31.

14. **unusquisque de suo arbitrio.** Tertullian is following Hegisippus who, after naming various heretical sects, adds *ἕκαστος ἰδίως καὶ ἑτέρως ἰδίαν δόξαν παρεισηγάγοσαν* (*apud* Euseb. *H. E.* iv. 22).

CAPUT XXXVIII.

ILLIC igitur et scripturarum et expositionum adulteratio deputanda est, ubi doctrinae diversitas invenitur. Quibus fuit propositum aliter docendi, eos necessitas coegit aliter disponendi instrumenta doctrinae. Alias enim non potuissent aliter docere, nisi aliter haberent per quae docerent. Sicut illis non potuisset succedere corruptela doctrinae sine corruptela instrumentorum eius; ita et nobis integritas doctrinae non competisset sine integritate eorum, per quae doctrina tractatur.

Etenim quid contrarium nobis in nostris? quid de proprio intulimus, ut aliquid contrarium ei et in scripturis deprehensum detractione vel adiectione vel transmutatione remediaremus? Quod sumus, hoc sunt scripturae ab initio suo. Ex illis sumus, antequam aliter fuit, antequam a vobis interpolarentur. Cum autem omnis interpolatio posterior credenda sit, veniens utique ex caussa aemulationis, quae neque prior, neque domestica unquam est eius, quod aemulatur; tam incredibile est sapienti cuique, ut nos adulterum stilum intu-

CHAP. XXXVIII.—4. **instrumenta doctrinae.** 'Instrumentum' is a common word in Tertullian for the Scriptures: *Apol.* 18 'instrumentum litteraturae,' *ib.* 19, 47 'vetus instrumentum,' 'the Old Testament'; *adv. Jud.* 1; *de monog.* 4, 7; *adv. Marc.* i. 10, 19 'utriusque instrumenti,' 'of each Testament'; iv. 1 'duos deos dividens . . . alterum alterius instrumenti, vel, quod magis usui est dicere, Testamenti;' iv. 2; v. 2; *de spect.* 5; *de res. carn.* 39. Below 'integro instrumento' is the 'whole volume' of the sacred writings, like 'tota instrumenta,' *adv. Prax.* 28. Tertullian also uses 'instrumenta' of heathen documents, *Apol.* 10; *de test. anim.* 1. Late Latin writers apply it to public or official records, Sueton. *Vesp.* 8; *Cal.* 8.

14. **antequam aliter fuit, &c.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.* This will mean 'before any divergent teaching existed.' *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.* 'antequam nihil aliter fuit quam sumus. Quid denique fuit antequam nobis interpolarentur.' But the sense demands 'vobis.'

18. **stilum.** Loosely used for 'text' or 'reading,' as above, ch. 17. Below it is simply 'pen,' as generally. Comp. its use *adv. Marc.* i. 1; *de idol.* 23; *de bapt.* 12; *Apol.* 19.

lisse videamur scripturis, qui sumus a principio et primi, quam illos non intulisse, qui sunt et posteri et adversi.

Alius manu scripturas, alius sensus expositione intervertit. Neque enim si Valentinus integro instrumento uti videtur, non callidiore ingenio quam Marcion manus intulit veritati. Marcion enim exserte et palam machaera, non stilo usus est, quoniam ad materiam suam caedem scripturarum confecit. Valentinus autem pepercit, quoniam non ad materiam scripturas, sed materiam ad scripturas excogitavit: et tamen plus abstulit et plus adiecit, auferens proprietates singulorum quoque verborum, et adiciens dispositiones non comparentium rerum.

CAPUT XXXIX.

ERANT ingenia de spiritalibus nequitiae, cum quibus luctatio est nobis, fratres, merito contemplanda, fidei necessaria, ut electi manifestentur, ut reprobi detegantur. Et ideo

3. **intervertit.** Comp. ch. 17.

6. **Marcion.** Comp. Iren. i. 25; Epiph. *Haer.* 42: from these writers and from Tertullian's treatise against him, we learn that Marcion rejected the whole of the Old Testament, and received only S. Luke's Gospel and ten of S. Paul's Epistles (*Galat.*, 1 and 2 *Corinth.*, *Rom.*, 1 and 2 *Thess.*, *Eph.*, *Coloss.*, *Phil.*, *Philipp.*), all in a greatly mutilated condition. For a detailed account of his alterations, see Lardner, *Hist. of Heretics*, ch. x. §§ 35 ff. Cf. Theodoret, *Haer. fab.* i. 24; Cyr. Jer. *Catech.* vi. 16; xvi. 7; Orig. *c. Cels.* ii. 27; Ps.-Tert. *adv. omn. haer.* 6.

8. **Valentinus autem, &c.** Occasionally however Valentinus did 'invent scripture to suit his theme': see Theodoret, *Haer. fab.* i. 7; Iren. i. 1. 8, where it appears that he added θεότητες to Coloss. i. 16; and again Iren. i. 1. 16, where οὐκ οἶδα is added to S. John xii. 27. Comp. too the Valentinian Ptolemaeus' heretical reading and perversion of S. John i. 14, quoted Iren. i. 1. 18 (with Harvey's note, i. p. 79). The Valentinian perversions are detailed by Iren. i. 1. 15 ff.

CHAP. XXXIX.—13. **Erant.** *Agob.*, *Rig.*: Haec sunt *rel.*

ingenia, 'inventions,' 'artifices': so *Apol.* 15 'lasciviae ingenia' (see note); *ib.* 22 'cetera ingenia vel etiam vires fallaciae spiritalis'; *ib.* 49; *ad mart.* 4 'omne carnificis ingenium in tormentis.'

spiritalibus nequitiae. Eph. vi. 12.

15. **ut electi manifestentur.** Comp. 1 Cor. xi. 19.

habent vim, et in excogitandis instruendisque erroribus facilitatem, non adeo mirandam, quasi difficilem et inexplicabilem, cum de saecularibus quoque scripturis exemplum praesto sit eiusmodi facilitatis. Vides hodie ex Vergilio fabulam in totum aliam componi, materia secundum versus, et versibus secundum materiam concinnatis. Denique Hosidius Geta Medeam tragoediam ex Vergilio plenissime exsuxit. Meus quidam propinquus ex eodem poeta inter cetera stili sui otia Pinacem Cebetis explicuit. Homerocentones etiam vocari solent, qui de carminibus Homeri propria opera more cen-

4. **Vides.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.*: quo ius *Leid.*, *Rhen.*: vis *Gel.*, *Pam.*

in totum. This form of the adverbial phrase is common in late prose writers (Quintillian, Pliny, Seneca), and very usual in Tertullian.

6. **Denique**: see note, ch. 2.

Hosidius Geta. So *Rig.* The name varies in the MSS.: Vosidius *Agob.*; Ovidius citra *Leid.*: Offidius *Vatic.* Nothing is known of this writer beyond this isolated notice of him. He was evidently a contemporary of Tertullian, and therefore cannot be identified with Γναῖος Ὀσίδιος Γέτας mentioned in Dion Cass. lx. 9, 20.

7. **Medeam tragoediam.** This tragedy is extant, and is included in Burmann's *Anthol. Lat.* i. 178, and in Wernsdorf's *Poet. Lat. Min.* vii. 441 (Paris, 1826). It is a Virgilian cento consisting of 462 verses, and is 'perhaps the earliest specimen' of that kind of literature.

8. **stili sui otia**, 'literary trifles'; comp. Ovid. *Trist.* ii. 224 'Excutiasque oculis otia nostra tuis.'

9. **Pinacem Cebetis.** Πίναξ, Tabula, was the title of one of three Dialogues by Cebes, the Pythagorean philosopher of Thebes. This most popular work is referred to by several ancient writers: Diog. Laert. ii. 125; Lucian. *Apol.* 42; *in rhet. pr.* 6; Pollux, iii. 16. Scaliger suggested that 'Cebetis' should be read for 'Cerberi,' *de coron.* 7 'Habes tragoediam Cerberi.'

Homerocentones. Properly applied to the patchwork poems, but according to the text *Agob.*, *Leid.*, *Rig.* here used of the poetasters. The early edd. printed 'Homeri- (*v.* Homero-) centonas . . . vocare.' For a specimen see Iren. i. 1. 20. Comp. Hieronym. *Epist.* 103 *ad Paulin.* On the literary influence of the poems of Homer at this period see Hatch, *Hibbert Lect.*, p. 30; and for traces of the influence of Homeric centones on the early Christian sacred literature, Harris, *Study of Codex Bezae*, pp. 49, 237. These curious patchworks are treated by Manitius, *Gesch. d. christl. latein. Poesie* (Stuttgart, 1891).

tonario ex multis hinc inde compositis in unum sarciunt corpus. Et utique fecundior divina litteratura ad facultatem cuiusque materiae. Nec periclitor dicere ipsas quoque scripturas sic esse ex Dei voluntate dispositas ut haereticis materias subministrarent; cum legam oportere haereses esse, quae sine scripturis esse non possunt.

CAPUT XL.

SEQUETUR a quo intellectus interpretetur eorum quae ad haereses faciant? A diabolo scilicet, cuius sunt partes intervertendi veritatem, qui ipsas quoque res sacramentorum divinorum idolorum mysteriis aemulatur. Tingit et ipse quosdam, utique credentes et fideles suos; expositionem delictorum de lavacro repromittit; et si adhuc memini,

5. **oportere haereses esse.** 1 Cor. xi. 19.

CHAP XL.—7. **Sequetur.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.* Sed quaeritur *rel.*

interpretetur. Passive, as *de bapt.* 19 'nec incongruenter ad figuram interpretabitur'; *ad nat.* i. 3 'Christianum nomen de unctione interpretatur.' Cicero, *de div.* i. 25. 53; Ammian. Marc. xxiv. 6; Lactant. iv. 7. 7.

8. **A diabolo.** Comp. *de virg. vel.* 15 'Hoc vos interdum diabolo interpretamur, ipsius est enim boni odium'; where note that *interpretari* with dat. = *deputare, adtribuere.*

10. **aemulatur**: see note, ch. 34.

tingit: see *de bapt.* 5 'Nam et sacris quibusdam per lavacrum initiantur, Isidis alicuius aut Mithrae. . . . Certe ludis Apollinaribus et Eleusiniis tinguntur.' Comp. Iust. Mart. *dial. c. Try.* 70, 78; Clem. Alex. *Strom.* v. 11; August. *c. Don.* vi. 25.

11. **expositionem delictorum.** So *Agob.*, *Rig.*: expiationem (by an easy correction) *rel.* By African writers 'exponere' is constantly used for 'deponere'; see *de pall.* 5; *de orat.* 15; *adv. Marc.* v. 10; *de res. carn.* 45. Cyprian. *Epist.* 73 *ad Iubai.* § 21 'peccata antiqua non exposuerit'; Firmilian *apud* Cypr. *Epist.* 75, § 20. Lactant. iii. 26, vii. 5. Arnob. ii. 41, iv. 26. Comp. Paul. Nolan. *Carm.* xxiii. 609

'Ne maneam terrenus Adam, sed virgine terra
Nascar, et exposito veteri, nova former imago.'

12. **de lavacro.** On *de* instrumenta, see note, ch. 3.

Mithra signat illic in frontibus milites suos; celebrat et panis oblationem, et imaginem resurrectionis inducit, et sub gladio redimit coronam. Quid? quod et summum pontificem in unius nuptiis statuit? Habet et virgines, habet et con-

1. **Mithra signat**; comp. *adv. Marc.* i. 13; Augustin. *Enarr. in Psalm.* i 'Ceterum opinari etiam liceat Mithram sive Satanam signasse in frontibus milites suos, aemulatione unctionis Christianae.' Iust. Mart. *Dial. c. Try.* 70; Orig. *c. Cels.* vi. 22. On the Mithraic sacraments see King, *Gnostics*, pp. 122 ff, and on the 'Mark of Mithras,' *ib.* p. 139. Döllinger, *Heidenthum*, p. 373. Hardwick, *Christ and other Masters*, pp. 568 ff. Hatch, *Infl. of Greek ideas*, p. 292.

illic, *in lavacro, in mysteriis.*

panis oblationem. Iust. Mart. *Apol.* i. 66 *ὅπερ καὶ ἐν τοῖς τοῦ Μίθρα μυστηρίοις παρέδωκαν γίνεσθαι μιμησάμενοι οἱ πονηροὶ δαίμονες· ὅτι γὰρ ἄρτος καὶ ποτήριον ὕδατος τίθεται ἐν τοῖς τοῦ μυουμένου τελεταῖς μετ' ἐπιλόγων τινῶν.*

2. **imaginem resurrectionis.** See the account of Mithraic ceremonies in Iul. Firm. Maternus, *de err. prof. rel.* 20, 21, 27 *apud* Migne, *P. L.* xii. King, *u. s.* would explain this phrase by that 'simulation of death' in the Mithraic rites—one of the tests of the candidate's fortitude—which is referred to by Lampridius, *Commod.* 9 (quoted next note), and 'typified on so many talismans by the corpse bestridden by the Solar Lion.'

sub gladio redimit coronam, 'wins a crown under the sword.' This is explained by a passage *de coron.* 15 'cum [Mithrae miles] initiatur in spelaeo, in castris vere tenebrarum, coronam interposito gladio sibi oblatam, quasi mimum martyrii, dehinc capiti suo accommodatam, monetur obvia manu a capite pellere et in humerum, si forte, transferre.' Comp. Lamprid. *Commod.* 9 'sacra Mithriaca homicidio vero polluit, cum illic aliquid ad speciem timoris vel dici vel fingi soleat.' For an account of the Mithraic rites see King, *u. s.*; Lajard, *Recherches sur le culte de Mithra* (Paris, 1847); Prof. Stark, *Zwei Mithraeen der Grossherzogl. Alterthümersammlung in Karlsruhe* 1864; Sainte-Croix, *Myst. du Paganisme*, ii. p. 120 ff.; de Boze in *Mém. des Inscr.* ii. 443.

3. **summum pontificem . . . statuit.** *Ad uxor.* i. 7 'Pontificem Maximum rursus nubere nefas est'; *de exh. cast.* 13 'Certe Flaminica non nisi univira est: quae et Flaminis lex est. Nam quod ipsi Pontifici Maximo iterare matrimonium non licet'; *de monog.* 17. Hieronym. *Epist.* 123 *ad Ageruch.* § 8 'Flamen unius uxoris ad sacerdotium admittitur.' The implied reference is of course to the rule laid down. 1 Tim. iii. 2; Tit. i. 6.

4. **virgines . . . continentes.** The two terms are distinct. 'Conti-

tinentes. Ceterum si Numae Pompilii superstitiones revolvamus, si sacerdotalia officia et insignia et privilegia, si sacrificalia ministeria, et instrumenta et vasa ipsorum sacrificiorum, ac piaculorum et votorum curiositates consideremus, nonne manifeste diabolus morositatem illam Iudaicae legis imitatus est?

Qui ergo ipsas res, de quibus sacramenta Christi administrantur, tam aemulanter affectavit exprimere in negotiis idololatriae; utique et idem et eodem ingenio gestiit, et potuit instrumenta quoque divinarum rerum et sanctorum Christianorum, sensum de sensibus, verba de verbis, parabolas de parabolis, profanae et aemulae fidei attemperare. Et ideo neque a diabolo immissa esse spiritalia nequitiae, ex quibus etiam haereses veniunt, dubitare quis debet, neque ab idololatria distare haereses, cum et auctoris et operis eiusdem sint, cuius et idololatria. Deum aut fingunt alium adversus creatorem; aut si unicum creatorem confitentur, aliter eum disserunt, quam in vero est. Itaque omne mendacium, quod de Deo dicunt, quodammodo genus est idololatriae.

CAPUT XLI.

NON omittam ipsius etiam conversationis haereticae de-

nentia' is used of self-control in and after marriage, *ad uxor.* I. 6; and is contrasted with 'virginitas' *de virg. vel.* 10; *adv. Marc.* v. 15.

3. **sacrificalia ministeria.** From this point to the end of ch. 44 *Codex Agobardinus* is wanting.

4. **curiositates,** 'fantastic niceties'; see note, ch. 7.

5. **morositatem** = 'scrupulositatem'; comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 35 'morositatem legis'; and of the Mosaic ritual *ib.* ii. 18 'Sacrificiorum quoque onera et operantionum et oblationum negotiosas scrupulositatis nemo reprehendit'; *ad nat.* ii. 4; *de virg. vel.* 12.

10. **sanctorum Christianorum** = 'a sanctis Christianis scripta.' For 'sanctorum' *Routh* conjectured and preferred 'sacramentorum.'

CHAP. XLI.—20. **conversationis.** 'Conversatio,' like 'disciplina,' is used by the Latin Fathers for 'conduct, mode of life,' the Greek πολιτεία, the N. T. ἀναστροφή Heb. xiii. 7; I Pet. ii. 12. Comp. above ch. 23, 27, and again ch. 43; *de idol.* 20; *de coron.* 8; *ad mart.* 2; *de virg. vel.* I; *ad nat.* i. 10, ii. 5; *de orat.* 11; *de cult. fem.* ii. 10; *adv. Marc.* i. 20, v. 12, 14; *de paen.* I, 9, &c.

scriptionem, quam futilis, quam terrena, quam humana sit; sine gravitate, sine auctoritate, sine disciplina, ut fidei suae congruens. Inprimis quis catechumenus, quis fidelis, incertum est; pariter adeunt, pariter audiunt, pariter orant, etiam ethnici si supervenerint: sanctum canibus et porcis margaritas, licet non veras, iactabunt. Simplicitatem volunt esse prostrationem disciplinae, cuius penes nos curam lenocinium vocant. Pacem quoque passim cum omnibus miscent. Nihil enim interest illis, licet diversa tractantibus, dum ad unius veritatis expugnationem conspirent. Omnes tument, omnes scientiam pollicentur. Ante sunt perfecti catechumeni, quam edocti. Ipsae mulieres haereticae, quam procaces! quae audeant docere, contendere, exorcismos agere, curationes repromittere, forsitan et tingere.

2. **sine disciplina.** The words which follow seem to shew that Tertullian had in his mind the *disciplina arcani* practised with respect to catechumens. Cp. note, ch. 6; and for the idea, *adv. Val.* 1 'disciplina non terretur.'

3. **catechumenus . . . fidelis.** We learn from Jerome that the rejection of any distinction in public worship between the catechumens and the faithful was a characteristic of Marcion's teaching. Hieronym. *Comm. in Gal.* vi. 6 'Marcion hunc locum ita interpretatus est ut putaret fidelis et catechumenos simul orare debere.'

fidelis, i. e. baptizatus.

4. **adeunt, audiunt, orant.** There may be an early reference here to different classes of catechumens in the African Church: those who were not allowed to enter the sacred building, those admitted as hearers, and those admitted to the prayers; but it is possible that *adeunt* bears the technical meaning of approach to the altar, and refers to the presence of unbaptized persons during the celebration of the Holy Eucharist.

5. **sanctum canibus.** S. Matt. vii. 6. 'Sanctum' is used, absolutely, for the Eucharist *de spect.* 25; [Cyprian] *de spect.* 7; also with the addition of 'Domini,' Cypr. *de unit.* 8; *de laps.* 15, 26.

7. **lenocinium**, i. e. 'affectationem.'

8. **Pacem . . . miscent,** 'share the Peace,' 'unite in communion.' On *pacem* see note, ch. 30; and for *miscere* = 'to share,' Seneca *Epist.* iii. 3 'cum amico omnes curas omnes cogitationes tuas misce.'

13. **contendere** = 'disputare.'

14. **et tingere.** *De virg. vel.* 9 'Non permittitur mulieri in ecclesia

Ordinationes eorum temerariae, leves, inconstantes: nunc neophytos collocant, nunc seculo obstrictos, nunc apostatas nostros, ut gloria eos obligent, quia veritate non possunt. Nusquam facilius proficitur, quam in castris rebellium, ubi ipsum esse illic, promereri est. Itaque alius hodie episcopus, cras alius; hodie diaconus, qui cras lector; hodie presbyter, qui cras laicus: nam et laicis sacerdotalia munera iniungunt.

CAPUT XLII.

DE verbi autem administratione quid dicam, cum hoc sit negotium illis, non ethnicos convertendi, sed nostros evertendi? Hanc magis gloriam captant, si stantibus ruinam, non si iacentibus elevationem operentur. Quoniam et ipsum opus eorum non de suo proprio aedificio venit, sed de veritatis destructione, nostra suffodiunt, ut sua aedificent. Adime illis legem Moysi et prophetas, et creatorem Deum, accusationem eloqui non habent. Ita fit ut ruinas facilius

loqui, sed nec docere, nec tingere, nec offerre, nec ullius virilis muneris, nedum sacerdotalis officii sortem sibi vindicare.' *De bapt.* 17 'Petulantiae autem mulier, quae usurpavit docere, utique non etiam tingendi ius sibi pariet,' &c. Comp. *Apost. Const.* iii. 9; Epiphan. *Haer.* lxx.

2. **neophytos.** 1 Tim. iii. 6.

saeculo obstrictos. On secular service as a disqualification for Holy Orders, see Bingham *Ant.* iv. 4.

6. **lector.** This is the first mention of the Order of Readers, the oldest of the minor orders, and thus early adopted by heretics. On their duties see Bright's note on Chalc. Conc. *can.* xiv.

hodie presbyter . . . laicus. Indifference to the special value and distinctiveness of Holy Orders is here expressly attributed to heretics. In his later treatises, as a Montanist, Tertullian himself adopted the novel notion of the obliteration of all distinction between cleric and laic; *de exh. cast.* 6. Dr. Hatch *Bampt. lect.* p. 124, with a bold disregard for Tertullian's alteration of views, blends together passages from catholic and montanistic writings.

CHAP. XLII.—16. **eloqui non habent:** see note, ch. 18.

operentur stantium aedificiorum quam exstructiones iacentium ruinarum. Ad haec solummodo opera humiles et blandi et submissi agunt. Ceterum nec suis praesidibus reverentiam noverunt. Et hoc est quod schismata apud haereticos fere non sunt, quia cum sint, non parent. Schisma est enim unitas ipsa. Mentior si non etiam a regulis suis variant inter se, dum unusquisque proinde suo arbitrio modulatur quae accepit, quemadmodum de suo arbitrio ea composuit ille qui tradidit. Agnoscit naturam suam et originis suae morem profectus rei. Idem licuit Valentinianis quod Valentino, idem Marcionitis quod Marcioni, de arbitrio suo fidem innovare. Denique penitus inspectae haereses omnes in multis cum auctoribus suis dissentientes deprehenduntur. Plerique nec ecclesias habent, sine matre, sine sede, orbi fide, extorres, sua in vilitate vagantur.

CAPUT XLIII.

NOTATA sunt etiam commercia haereticorum cum magis quam pluribus, cum circulatoribus, cum astrologis, cum

1. **exstructiones.** So again of 'construction' *adv. Herm.* 40; *de res. carn.* 5: but note its different use *ad uxor.* ii. 3 ('adornment').

14. **Plerique nec ecclesias habent.** Ironical: all heresies were churchless by their very nature. Comp. *adv. Marc.* iv. 5 'Habet plane et illud ecclesias, sed suas, tam posteras quam adulteras, quarum si censum requiras, facilius apostaticum invenias quam apostolicum, Marcione scilicet conditore, vel aliquo Marcionis examine. Faciunt favos et vespae, faciunt ecclesias et Marcionitae.'

15. **sua in vilitate.** *Oehler's* emendation of the passage, which stands in *Leid.* quasi sibilat evagatur: in *Rhen. and Gang.* quasi sibilatae vagantur: in *Vatic., Pam.* quasi sibi late vagantur, which is followed by Dodgson in *Lib. Fath.* and translated 'they all for themselves as it were' = 'themselves are their all.' *Rig.* adopting a suggestion of *Fulv. Ursinus,* printed sine lare vagantur.

CHAP. XLIII.—17. **magis.** Iren. i. 7; 16. 3; 17. 1; 20. 2. Epiphan. *Haer.* xxvii. 3.

18. **circulatoribus**: *circulatores* = 'itinerant jugglers,' popularly invested with magical powers. Apuleius, *Metam.* 4, relates a trick

philosophis, curiositati scilicet deditis. Quaerite et invenietis, ubique meminerunt. Adeo et de genere conversationis qualitas fidei aestimari potest. Doctrinae index disciplina est. Negant Deum timendum: itaque libera sunt illis omnia et soluta. Ubi autem Deus non timetur, nisi ubi non est? Ubi Deus non est, nec veritas ulla est. Ubi veritas nulla est, merito et talis disciplina est. At ubi Deus, ibi metus in Deum, qui est initium sapientiae. Ubi metus in Deum, ibi gravitas honesta, et diligentia adtonita, et cura sollicita, et adlectio explorata, et communicatio deliberata, et promotio emerita, et subjectio religiosa, et apparitio devota, et processio modesta, et ecclesia unita, et Dei omnia.

performed by one of such men. Celsus, v. 27. 3, uses the word of quack medicine-men. Comp. *de idol.* 9, where Simon Magus is spoken of as belonging to 'circulatoria secta'; and *Apol.* 23, where magicians' tricks are described as effected 'circulatoriis praestigiis.

astrologis. Iren. i. 10.

1. **Quaerite et invenietis.** See above, ch. 8.

2. **conversationis.** See note, ch. 41.

4. **disciplina.** See note, ch. 6.

itaque libera, &c. As amongst the Cainites; ch. 33.

8. **qui est initium sapientiae.** Ps. cxi. 10; Prov. ix. 10.

9. **adtonita**: i.e. 'quae semper est in metu ne quid peccet' (*Rig.*).

10. **adlectio**: *sc.* 'in ordinem ecclesiasticum.' *Adlegere* is thus specifically used *de idol.* 9; *de exhort. cast.* 7 'Usque adeo nisi et laici ea observent per quae presbyteri adleguntur, quomodo erunt presbyteri qui de laicis adleguntur?'

explorata: 'well-assured,' after due investigation and publicity; in contrast to the 'ordinationes temerariae leves inconstantes' of the heretics (ch. 41).

communicatio deliberata, 'well considered communion,' both in its celebration and in those who are admitted to it; in contrast to the indiscriminate communion of the heretics (ch. 41).

11. **subjectio,** 'submissiveness,' 'obedience.' 1 Tim. ii. 11 *Vulg.* Comp. *Apol.* 2 'filium subiectum [patri].'

12. **apparitio,** 'attendance,' 'service': *apparere* is used synonymously with *ministrare*, *Apol.* 13 (see note), 48; *de idol.* 17; *de spect.* 17. Comp. Liv. ii. 55 'Quattuor et viginti lictores apparere consulibus.'

processio modesta, 'going forth,' 'walking abroad,' 'modesto

CAPUT XLIV.

Proinde haec pressioris apud nos testimonia disciplinae ad probationem veritatis accedunt, a qua divertere nemini expedit, qui meminerit futuri iudicii, quo omnes nos necesse est apud Christi tribunal adstare, reddentes rationem in primis ipsius fidei.

Quid ergo dicent qui illam stupraverint adulterio haeretico, virginem traditam a Christo? Credo allegabunt, nihil unquam sibi ab illo vel ab apostolis eius de saevis et perversis doctrinis futuris praenuntiatum et de cavendis abominandisque praeceptum. Agnoscent suam potius culpam et suorum, qui nos non ante praestruxerunt. Adicient

habito vultuque'; see *de cult. fem.* ii. 11 'Vobis autem nulla procedendi caussa non taetrica [=*seria, gravis*] . . . Aut sacrificium offertur aut Dei sermo administratur: quidvis horum gravitatis et sanctitatis negotium est, cui opus non sit habitu extraordinario.' In *ad uxor.* ii. 4 'si procedendum erit' has the same meaning.

Chap. XLIV.—1. **pressioris disciplinae**, 'of a stricter discipline,' such as is described *Apol.* 39.

3. **omnes nos necesse**, &c. 2 Cor. v. 10.

7. **virginem.** Comp. 2 Cor. xi. 2. It was probably some figurative expression like this in the text that gave rise to the false scandals respecting the moral character of Cerdo, Marcion, and Apelles. The phrase is taken from Hegesippus, Euseb. *H. E.* iii. 32; iv. 22.

Credo. The intense irony of this passage can hardly be matched even in the writings of Tertullian himself. 'Credo' is repeated below, and appears to be a stronger expression than Tertullian's usual 'opinor' in ironical passages, see note, ch. 3.

8. **saevis.** So the MSS. and Edd. (except *Rig.* seris). *Junius* suggested scaevis which *Oehler* adopts.

10. **Agnoscent**, *sc.* Christus et Apostoli. *Van der Vliet* would emend Agnoscet [Christus].

11. **et suorum**, &c. The harsh change of subject in the sentence has been overlooked, and the MSS. and Edd. exhibit considerable variations:—quam illorum *Rig., Fulv. Urs.*: quam suorum *Rhen., Gang., Pam.* The text follows *Leid., Gel.*

nos non ante. So *Gang., Gel., Pam.*: nos ante *Leid., Rhen.*: nos tanto ante *Rig., Fulv. Urs.*

Adicient. The subject shifts back again to 'haeretici.'

praeterea multa de auctoritate cuiusque doctoris haeretici; illos maxime doctrinae suae fidem confirmasse, mortuos suscitasse, debiles reformasse, futura significasse, uti merito apostoli crederentur. Quasi nec hoc scriptum sit, venturos multos, qui etiam virtutes maximas ederent, ad fallaciam muniendam corruptae praedicationis.

Itaque veniam merebuntur. Si vero memorés dominicarum et apostolicarum et scripturarum denuntiationum in fide integra steterint, credo, de venia periclitabuntur, respondente Domino: Praenuntiaveram plane futuros fallaciae magistros in meo nomine, et prophetarum et apostolorum etiam, et discentibus meis eadem ad vos praedicare mandaveram; scilicet cum vos non crederetis. Semel evangelium et eiusdem regulae doctrinam apostolis meis delegaveram; libuit mihi postea aliqua inde mutare. Resurrectionem promiseram, etiam carnis; sed recogitavi, ne implere non possem. Natum me ostenderam ex virgine; sed postea turpe mihi visum est. Patrem dixeram qui solem et pluvias facit; sed alius me pater melior adoptavit. Prohibueram vos aurem accommodare haereticis; sed erravi.

Talia capit opinari eos qui exorbitant et fidei veritatis periculum non cavent.

2. **mortuos suscitasse, &c.** Miracles of deceit wrought by false Christs and false prophets, S. Matt. xxiv. 24.

4. **Quasi nec .... praedicationis.** This is parenthetical: the irony is resumed with 'Itaque veniam,' and continued down to 'sed erravi.'

scriptum sit. S. Matt. xxiv. 24.

5. **virtutes.** See note, ch. 13.

13. **scilicet cum vos non crederetis,** 'with the idea of course that you would not believe it.' Sed vos non crederetis is the reading of *Leid. Rhen., Gang., Gel.* insert cum before vos. Scilicet is *Oehler's* correction for Sed.

16. **sed recogitavi.** The Gnostic tenets are again specially in Tertullian's mind; see ch. 33, 36, and notes.

19. **alius pater melior.** The higher god of Marcion, who sent Christ to reveal him (see above. ch. 7, 34); or the 'summus Deus nomine Abraxas' of Basilides (see Ps.-Tert. *adv. haer.* 1).

21. **capit opinari,** = 'potest fieri ut talia opinentur.' *Capit* with

XLV.

SED nunc quidem generaliter actum est nobis adversus haereses omnes certis et iustis et necessariis praescriptionibus repellendas a collatione scripturarum. De reliquo, si Dei gratia adnuerit, etiam specialiter quibusdam respondebimus. Haec in fide veritatis cum otio perlegentibus pax et gratia Dei nostri Iesu Christi in aeternum.

infin. is frequently used by Tertullian like the Greek ἐνδέχεται: see *Apol.* 17 'dum aestimari non capit' (and note there): *adv. Marc.* i. 6; ii. 9; iii. 6; iv. 11; v. 14; *de test. an.* 2; *de bapt.* 1; *de fug. in pers.* 1; *de idol.* 10; *de pud.* 1; *ad Nat.* ii. 3; *de cult. fem.* i. 2; *de anim.* 4.

exorbitant. See note, ch. 4.

CHAP. XLV.—1. **Sed nunc.** *Codex Agobard.* is again available.

nunc, 'in view of present circumstances,' see ch. 1 *ad init.*; 'nunc' is contrasted with 'de reliquo' below.

generaliter, on principles, that is, applicable to all heresies; contrasted with 'specialiter' below.

2. **praescriptionibus.** Comp. *de carn. Chr.* 3 'sed plenius huiusmodi praescriptionibus adversus omnes haereses alibi iam usi sumus.'

3. **a collatione scripturarum**: i.e. from the use and discussion of the scriptures in their arguments; comp. ch. 15, 19.

4. **quibusdam**: e.g. Marcion, Praxeas, Valentinus, Hermogenes, Apelles (a lost work).

respondebimus. *Codex Leidensis* ends here.

5. **cum otio perlegentibus.** *Oehler's* conjectural emendation of the MS. 'cum oci . . . legentibus.'

AD MARTYRAS

INTRODUCTION

THIS inspiriting Address has been usually regarded as the earliest of Tertullian's Christian writings, composed in the year A.D. 197, while the slaughter of Albinus' army near Lyon (February 27), and the still more terrible massacre of his partisans in Rome by Severus' orders were fresh in the minds of men [1]. But the reference on which this view of the treatise is based is vague, and might be interpreted equally well of the detection and punishment of the adherents of Niger in the East some years later [2]. There is, however, really no need to seek for the particular instances of imperial vengeance which may have been in Tertullian's mind. Any of the earlier years of Severus' reign would afford examples such as are alluded to; for punishment as widely spread as that which this Emperor inflicted could certainly not have been completed in a single year [3].

The Address contains no traces of Montanism, although imaginative commentators have found evidences of a leaning towards it in the simple allusion to the possibility of jealousies and dissensions arising amongst the imprisoned confessors [4]. It is scarcely necessary to point out the gratuitousness of reading such an idea into the passage; while there are on the other hand positive reasons for

[1] Dodgson in Library of Fathers *Tertullian*, p. 151.

[2] Dion Cass. lxxvi. 4; Herodian. iii. 12.

[3] See the references in note chap. 6.

[4] Chap. 1: Dodgson *v. s.* p. 152 note.

believing that the writer was not yet committed to the extravagances of the Eastern heresy.

There is, for instance, no undue exaltation of martyrdom, no fierce fanatical joy at the confessors' prospect of death *Dei caussa*; they are encouraged only to hold themselves still in the calm steadfast fortitude of patient enduring faith in their Lord, and in the assurance of the abiding presence of His Spirit. With this view of martydom it is only necessary to contrast such Montanistic passages as 'De Corona' 1, and almost any page of the treatise 'De fuga in persecutione,' in order to see at once the wide difference of tone which pervades this treatise.

Two other points also mark out this Address from the Montanistic writings. (1) The custom of unrestored penitents seeking *libelli* from imprisoned confessors, by whose intercession the lapsed were wont to be recommended to the merciful consideration of the Church; and (2) the practice of the Church contributing food and money to her imprisoned members, are both mentioned (chap. 1) in terms of approval; whereas both customs are broadly denounced in Montanistic treatises—the former *de pudicitia* 22, and the latter *de ieiuniis* 12.

It seems strange that Tertullian, when exhorting the confessors to courage by reminding them of past examples of fortitude, should make no mention of the brave witness unto death borne by the earlier African sufferers—Namphamo, and the Scillitan martyrs, A.D. 180[1]—and that all his examples should be drawn from paganism. This, however, may be intentional—'tanti vitreum, quanti verum margaritum?'

Still stranger is it to observe the liberty which was allowed to the Christians to openly visit and contribute to the support of their friends in prison. It is a curious feature which meets us constantly from the time of St. Paul down to

[1] Augustin. *Epist.* 15, 16

the close of the era of persecutions [1]. The intercourse of the prisoners with each other, with their friends, or with the lapsed who sought their intercession, seems to have been unrestricted, or at any rate easily obtainable by bribery [2]. Cyprian states that it had long been the custom in Africa for the clergy of the Church to have access to the imprisoned members of their flock [3], and the Acts of SS. Perpetua and Felicitas show that they were able to obtain certain privileges for them by giving gratuities to the prison officials [4]. Another passage in the same Acts proves that the large powers entrusted to the governor of the prison (*optio, praepositus carceris*) might be used at his will for the amelioration or aggravation of the prisoners' condition [5]. The whole of this Address to the Martyrs, indeed, is illustrated in its details by the account of S. Perpetua's 'Passion,' to which it bears so many resemblances in tone, in style, and in diction that the editing of the Acts in their present form has been attributed to Tertullian himself [6]. It has been further conjectured that the 'Ad Martyras' itself was specially written and addressed to Perpetua and her companions [7]; the conjecture being supported by the following facts:—(*a*) both groups of martyrs contained men as well as women; (*b*) in both cases the martyrs were young in years; (*c*) several of Tertullian's metaphors closely resemble scenes in the visions of the prisoners. The coincidences are certainly sufficient to establish the applicability of the Address to the circumstances of Perpetua and her fellow-sufferers. Nor is there anything in the treatise itself to

[1] On this point see Lightfoot *Ignatius* i. 357 f.; Apost. Const. v. 1; Aristides *Apol.* 15; Tert. *Apol.* 39.

[2] Lucian *de mort Peregr.* 12.

[3] *Epist.* 15 *ad mart.*

[4] Ch. 1.

[5] Ch. 3.

[6] Robinson *Pass. of S. Perp.*, Texts and Studies i. 2. pp. 47 ff. Bonwetsch *Die Schriften Tert.* pp. 75 ff. Salmon in *D. C. B.* iii. 944.

[7] Harris *Acts of Perp. and Fel.* pp. 28 ff.

preclude its date being fixed as late as 202 or 203. The Catholic tone of the Address might at first sight seem to bar a later date for it than about 200, but the Address to Scapula written in 212 is equally free from any signs of Montanism; while various reasons combine to lead to the conclusion that Perpetua and her friends, although they may have belonged to the stricter party in the African Church, were Catholic, and not, as has been asserted[1], Montanist, confessors. They had not separated from the communion of the Church, nor do they once mention the Paraclete in their accounts of their visions. And surely the Catholic bishop Optatus, in the vision of Saturus, would have been reproved in very different terms had the martyrs been Montanists. Whatever the views of the editor and supplementer of the Visions may have been—and they do not appear to have been those of a keen Montanist, for the tone of the Acts cannot be said to demand such an author—it is hard to see why they should be held to reflect upon the character of the belief of the martyrs.

An interesting example of Tertullian's concentration of vision and immersion in the point before him is seen in his treatment of the martyrs' prison which he views under five different aspects (see the notes). This tendency towards the overdevelopment of an idea is characteristic of our author, and in his polemical treatises sometimes leads him to indulge in unsatisfactory methods of argument. But the 'Ad Martyras' is wholly devoted to bracing the courage of the condemned confessors, and is charged with the breath of that sympathy and encouragement which springs only from a deep and inspiring faith.

[1] Harris *v. s.* pp. 2 ff.

SYNOPSIS

I. Let these words of mine be for the nourishment of your spirit, as the gifts of the brethren are for the refreshment of your bodies. Your prison is the devil's house; trample upon him in his own domain, and be at peace among yourselves.

II. You are severed from the world; and your prison has become a watch-house, where the spirit is relieved from the outward temptations which assail it in the world. You are in retreat, free in spirit, though restrained in body.

III. Hardship and discipline are inevitable in warfare, and you have been called to the warfare of God. Your prison is a training-place to prepare as spiritual athletes for the last contest.

IV. Let the flesh serve the spirit. Remember the heroic examples of pagan fortitude, both in women and men: how much more willingly and bravely ought you to suffer for the truth!

V. Mere vanity and love of display have often spurred men on to suffer; how much more should we be ready to suffer for our salvation!

VI. Suffering, tortures, and death, either from accident or from hostility, are not uncommon disasters. They are often risked in a human cause: still less ought we to hesitate when the cause is divine.

TEXT

I. Manuscripts.

1. Codex Vindobonensis (*Vind.*): a paper MS. of the fifteenth century, of the same family as the Codex Leidensis.

2. Codex Leidensis (*Leid.*).

3. A Florentine MS. (*Flor.* 12) in the Laurentian Library, number xxvi. 12, of the fifteenth century.

4, 5, 6. Three Florentine MSS. in the Magliabechian Library, numbered 527, 528, 529, of the same type as *Flor.* 12.

7, 8. Codex Divionensis (*Divion.*), and Codex Pithoei (*Pith.*) used by Rigalt.

9, 10, 11. Three Vatican MSS. (*Vat.*), used by Pamelius.

12. Codex Gorziensis (*Gorz.*), used by Pamelius.

II. Editions.

Rhenanus.
Gangnaeus.
Gelenius.
Pamelius.
Rigalt.
Migne.
Leopold.
Oehler.

AD MARTYRAS

CAPUT PRIMUM.

INTER carnis alimenta, benedicti martyres designati, quae vobis et domina mater ecclesia de uberibus suis et singuli fratres de opibus suis propriis in carcerem subministrant, capite aliquid et a nobis quod faciat ad spiritum quoque educandum. Carnem enim saginari et spiritum esurire non prodest. Immo, si quod infirmum est curatur aeque quod infirmius est negligi non debet. Nec tantus ego sum, ut vos alloquar; verumtamen et gladiatores perfectissimos non tantum magistri et praepositi sui, sed etiam idiotae et

TITLE.—The best supported form of the title is AD MATRYRAS which is found in *Flor.* 529, three Vatican MSS., and the editions of *Pam.*, *Rig.*, and *Oehl.* In *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 12, 527, 528, it is corrupted into AD MARTIRIAS. *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, printed AD MARTYRES.

Strictly speaking the Christian prisoners were as yet only 'confessores,' 'martyres designati,' as Tertullian terms them, ch. 1. The seal of their confession by death would promote them to the rank of 'martyres.'

2. **domina mater ecclesia.** Cp. *de orat.* 2 'mater ecclesia'; *de anim.* 43 'vera mater viventium, ecclesia'; Cyprian *de unit. eccl.* 6 'Habere iam non potest Deum patrem qui ecclesiam non habet matrem.' *Educandum* below carries on the same idea of the Church as a nursing-mother; comp. Varro *ap.* Non. p. 447 (ed. Merc.) 'educit enim obstetrix, educat matrix, instituit paedagogus, docet magister.'

3. **de opibus suis.** So *Rig.*, *Rhen.* (note in ed. 1528): operibus *rel.* I have remarked in the Introduction upon the frequency of such actions in times of persecution. Comp. *Apol.* 39 (note), and the earlier Apology of Aristides ch. 15 (*Texts and Studies* i. 1. p. 49), Euseb. iv. 23. 9, *Pass. S. Perp.* 2. See too the direction in the *Apost. Const.* v. 1 for contributions to be sent to those condemned to the beasts or in the mines, in order that they might buy food or bribe the soldiers to alleviate their wretched condition. As a Montanist, Tertullian disapproved of the Church feeding her prisoners, *de ieiun.* 12.

supervacue quique adhortantur de longinquo, ut saepe de ipso populo dictata suggesta profuerint. Inprimis ergo, benedicti, nolite contristare Spiritum Sanctum, qui vobiscum introiit carcerem. Si enim non vobiscum nunc introisset, nec vos illic hodie fuissetis. Et ideo date operam, ut illic vobiscum perseveret: et ita vos inde perducat ad Dominum. Domus quidem diaboli est et carcer, in qua familiam suam continet. Sed vos ideo in carcerem pervenistis, ut illum etiam in domo sua conculcetis. Iam enim foris congressi conculcaveratis. Non ergo dicat: In meo sunt, temptabo illos vilibus odiis, defectionibus, aut inter se dissensionibus. Fugiat conspectum vestrum, et ima sua delitescat contractus et torpens, tamquam coluber excantatus aut effumigatus.

2. **dictata suggesta**, 'hints suggested': *dictata* is used of 'rules of combat' Sueton. *Iul. Caes.* 26. On *suggerere* see note *de praescr. haer.* 6; *Apol.* 18.

3. **nolite contristare Spiritum.** Eph. iv. 30.

7. **Domus diaboli**, 'the devil's house,' the abode of criminals, and yet to be the scene of the devil's discomfiture. This is the first aspect in which Tertullian views the martyrs' prison.

9. **conculcetis.** With this phrase and the immediately following description of the baffled dragon compare Perpetua's account of her trampling upon the dragon's head in her ascent of the ladder in her first vision: *Pass. S. Perp.* 4.

congressi. Tertullian appropriately employs military terms in speaking of the Christian warfare; so below, *munitos*, &c. Cp. Eph. vi. 11 ff.

11. **odiis.** This is the reading of *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 529, *Flor.* 12, three *Vat. MSS.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*: inediis *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*: oediis *Divion.*: scidiis *Rig. conj.* It is a wholly arbitrary interpretation to make this refer to the refusal of the Catholic confessors to recognize their Montanist fellow-sufferers in prison (comp. Euseb. v. 16. 22); for there is absolutely nothing to suggest the presence of two such classes of martyrs amongst those addressed (Lib. Fath. note *ad loc.*). It seems to have been overlooked that Tertullian is not asserting that dissensions had actually arisen (as Kaye assumed, and even described their character, p. 140), but only that this was a likely form of temptation to befall them. His words are a warning, not a statement of fact.

13. **excantatus aut effumigatus.** Cp. *adv. Val.* 3. 'Excantatus' is read Hor. *Epod.* v. 45; Prop. iv. 2. 29, but in the sense of attraction, not of repulse as here: 'effumigatus' appears to be a ἅπαξ λεγ.

Nec illi tam bene sit in suo regno, ut vos committat, sed inveniat munitos, et concordia armatos: quia pax vestra bellum est illi. Quam pacem quidam in ecclesia non habentes a martyribus in carcere exorare consueverunt. Et ideo eam propterea in vobis habere et fovere et custodire debetis, ut, si forte, et aliis praestare possitis.

CAPUT II.

CETERA aeque animi impedimenta usque ad limen carceris deduxerint vos, quousque et parentes vestri. Exinde segregati estis ab ipso mundo, quanto magis a saeculo, rebusque eius? Nec hoc vos consternet, quod segregati estis a mundo. Si enim recogitemus ipsum magis mundum carcerem esse, exisse vos e carcere, quam in carcerem introisse, intellegemus. Maiores tenebras habet mundus, quae hominum praecordia excaecant. Graviores catenas induit mundus, quae ipsas animas hominum constringunt. Peiores immunditias exspirat mundus, libidines hominum.

1. **ut vos committat**, 'so as to set you at variance'; see note *de praescr. haer.* 24.

3. **pacem.** Something has been already said upon this custom in the Introduction. Originally the *libellus* of a martyr was a recommendation of a lapsed friend to the bishop's consideration, in order that after due penance he might be restored to the number of the faithful. But in time the exaggerated honours paid to martyrdom led to a subversion of all church discipline, and the martyrs' *libelli* superseded confession, penance, and absolution; see Cyprian. *Epist.* 9 ff.; Euseb. v. 2, of the Gallican martyrs; note *de praescr. haer.* 30. These *libelli* given by the martyrs must not be confused with two other kinds of documents bearing the same name:—(*a*) recantations tendered to the magistrates, Cyprian. *de laps.* 27, *Epist.* 30; (*b*) certificates of exemption from sacrificing purchased from the magistrates by apostatising Christians, Cypr. *Epist.* 55 *ad Anton.*

6. **si forte,** 'it may be'; εἰ τύχοι: so below ch. 2, *de coron.* 5, 8; *Pass. S. Perp.* 18. Tertullian also uses 'si forte' like εἰ ἄρα, 'if at all,' *Apol.* 16, 41; and 'si utique' in the same way *Apol.* 49.

CHAP. II.—8. **parentes vestri.** The youthfulness of some of the prisoners may be deduced from this sentence.

15. **induit:** imbuit, *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 12, *Flor.* 529, *Rhen.*

Plures postremo mundus reos continet, scilicet universum hominum genus. Iudicia denique non proconsulis, sed Dei sustinet. Quo vos, benedicti, de carcere in custodiarium, si forte, translatos existimetis. Habet tenebras, sed lumen estis ipsi: habet vincula, sed vos soluti Deo estis. Triste illic exspirat, sed vos odor estis suavitatis. Iudex exspectatur, sed vos estis de iudicibus ipsis iudicaturi. Contristetur illi, qui fructum saeculi suspirat. Christianus etiam extra carcerem saeculo renuntiavit, in carcere autem etiam carceri. Nihil interest, ubi sitis in saeculo, qui extra saeculum estis. Et si aliqua amisistis vitae gaudia, negotiatio est aliquid amittere, ut maiora lucreris. Nihil adhuc dico de praemio, ad quod Deus martyres invitat. Ipsam interim conversationem saeculi et carceris comparemus, si non plus in carcere spiritus acquirit quam caro amittit. Immo et quae iusta sunt caro non amittit per curam ecclesiae et agapen fratrum; et insuper quae semper utilia fidei, spiritus adi-

3. **sustinet**, 'awaits,' 'looks for,' *sustinere* frequently has the sense of *exspectare* in Tertullian: *Apol.* 35; *de test. an.* 5; *adv. Herm.* 29; *Scorp.* 2, 13; *de paen.* 6; *de fug. in pers.* 11; *adv. Iud.* 6.

in custodiarium, 'into a place of safety' or 'watching.' Here is a second aspect in which to view the martyrs' prison—as an escape from the prison-house of the world into a watch-house. 'Custodiarium' is used *adv. Iud.* 3 of the 'garden-watcher's hut' in citing Isaiah i. 7.

4. **Habet tenebras.** Comp. the description of the prison given by Perpetua, *Pass.* ch. 1; and the horrors endured by the Gallican martyrs *apud* Euseb. v. 1.

lumen estis ipsi. S. Matt. v. 14; Eph. v. 8; 1 Thess. v. 5. Cp. Cyprian. *Epist.* 81.

5. **soluti Deo.** Gal. v. 1.

6. **odor estis suavitatis.** Eph. v. 3; 2 Cor. ii. 15.

7. **iudicaturi.** 1 Cor. vi. 2.

8. **fructum saeculi suspirat**, 'who sighs for the enjoyment of the worldly life': *suspirare* is thus constructed with a simple acc. *Apol.* 15; *de spect.* 28; *de cult. fem.* i. 2, ii. 6. Cp. Iuven. xi. 152; Hor. *Carm.* iii. 7. 10; Tibull. i. 6. 35, iv. 5. 11.

16. **agapen.** This is one of many instances which will recur of the direct transliteration of Greek words in this treatise. The same feature is noticeable in the *Pass. S. Perp.*

piscitur. Non vides alienos deos, non imaginibus eorum incurris, non sollemnes nationum dies ipsa commixtione participas, non nidoribus spurcis verberaris, non clamoribus spectaculorum, atrocitate, vel furore, vel impudicitia celebrantium caederis: non in loca libidinum publicarum oculi tui impingunt: vacas a scandalis, a temptationibus, a recordationibus malis, iam et a persecutione. Hoc praestat carcer Christiano, quod eremus prophetis. Ipse Dominus in secessu frequentius agebat, ut liberius oraret, ut saeculo cederet. Gloriam denique suam discipulis in solitudine demonstravit. Auferamus carceris nomen, secessum vocemus. Etsi corpus includitur, etsi caro detinetur, omnia spiritui patent. Vagare spiritu, spatiare spiritu, et non stadia opaca aut porticus longas praeponens tibi, sed illam viam, quae ad Deum ducit. Quotiens eam spiritu deambulaveris, totiens in carcere non eris. Nihil crus sentit in nervo, cum animus in caelo est. Totum hominem animus circumfert, et quo

3. **nidoribus spurcis verberaris.** Comp. the description of the disgusting scenes at a popular festival, *Apol.* 35.

4. **atrocitate**: *sc.* in arena, see *Apol.* 38.
furore: in circo.
impudicitia: in theatro.

6. **vacas a scandalis**: see note below, ch. 3.

8. **Dominus in secessu.** S. Mark i. 35, vi. 31, 46, &c.

10. **Gloriam . . . demonstravit.** S. Matt. xvii. 1 ff.; S. Mark ix. 2 ff.; S. Luke ix. 28 ff.

11. **secessum vocemus**: 'let us call it a retreat'; the third aspect of the martyrs' prison—a place of retirement for spiritual refreshment.

13. **Vagare spiritu.** Vacare spiritus, *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 12, *Flor.* 529.

spiritu: spiritus, *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 12, *Flor.* 529.

stadia opaca. The recreation walks planted with trees seem to be designated; and *stadium* is similarly used (*de cor.* 4) of the garden-walks in Susanna's garden. Cp. Propert. iv. 21. 25 'Illic aut stadiis animum emendare Platonis Incipiam aut hortis, docte Epicure, tuis.'

stadia . . . porticus . . . viam. There is a reference in these words to the athletic and intellectual contests of the stadium and 'porch,' both of which are contrasted with the 'Via' through Whom alone the true 'brabium' could be gained. S. John xiv. 6 'Ego sum Via,' &c.

velit transfert. Ubi autem erit cor tuum, illic erit et thesaurus tuus. Ibi ergo sit cor nostrum, ubi volumus habere thesaurum.

CAPUT III.

SIT nunc, benedicti, carcer etiam Christianis molestus? Vocati sumus ad militiam Dei vivi iam tunc, cum in sacramenti verba respondimus. Nemo miles ad bellum cum deliciis venit, nec de cubiculo ad aciem procedit, sed de papilionibus expeditis et substrictis, ubi omnis duritia et imbonitas et insuavitas constitit. Etiam in pace labore et incommodis bellum pati iam ediscunt, in armis deambulando, campum decurrendo, fossam moliendo, testudinem densando.

1. **Ubi autem cor.** S. Matt. vi. 21.

CHAP. III.—5. **ad militiam Dei**: 'to the military service of the living God,' for which the hardships of the prison-life are only a natural and appropriate training: cp. 2 Tim. ii. 3. This is a fourth aspect of imprisonment. Cp. *de orat.* 19 'nam et militia [=milites] Dei sumus.'

in sacramenti verba. As the soldier was bound to the military service of the emperor by an oath (sacramentum), so also the soldier of Christ to a spiritual warfare by the baptismal vow of obedience. Cp. *Scorp.* 4 'Huic sacramento militans ab hostibus provocor.' Cyprian. *de laps.* 7, 13. On 'sacramentum' see note *de praescr. haer.* 20.

6. **respondimus**: 'we pledge our faith,' 'enter into the engagement' in the words of the baptismal oath of fealty. Cp. *de cor.* 10 'Credimusne humanum sacramentum divino superduci licere et in alium dominum respondere post Christum?'

9. **imbonitas.** This word does not seem to occur elsewhere. The glossaries recognize it; see Ducange.

insuavitas. Cp. *de paen.* 10; Aul. Gell. *N. A.* i. 21 'insolentia et insuavitas [dictionis].'

11. **testudinem densando**: 'by closing up so as to form the *testudo*.' This seems the most satisfactory reading, and so *Rig.* desudando *Vat.*: dessicando desudando *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 529: dessicando *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*: densitando *La Cerda*: destinando, desudando *Oehl.* 'Testudo' in military language had two significations, (1) a wooden penthouse to shelter besiegers (Caes. *B. G.* v. 43; Vitruv. x. 13); and (2) a shelter formed by the soldiers interlocking their shields over their heads like the shell of the tortoise (*testudo*), so Tacit. *Ann.* xiii. 39, *Hist.* iii. 31; Liv. xxxiv. 39, xliv. 9 'scudis super capita densatis'; Caes. *B. G.* ii. 6.

Sudore omnia constant, ne corpora atque animi expavescant de umbra ad solem et sole ad caelum, de tunica ad loricam, de silentio ad clamorem, de quiete ad tumultum. Proinde vos, benedicti, quodcumque hoc durum est, ad exercitationem virtutum animi et corporis deputate. Bonum agonem subituri estis in quo agonothetes Deus vivus est; xystarches Spiritus Sanctus, corona aeternitatis; brabium angelicae substantiae, politia in caelis, gloria in saecula saeculorum. Itaque epistates vester Christus Iesus, qui vos Spiritu unxit,

1. **expavescant.** Cp. the similar use of this verb *Apol.* 39; *de spect.* 17; *de orat.* 22; *adv. Prax.* 3; *Pass. S. Perp.* 1.

2. **ad caelum.** So *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 529, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*; but it is an extraordinary use of 'caelum' for 'cold weather,' and has led to the corrections ad gelum *Oehl.* following corr. of *Ios. Mercerus* and *Iunius*: ad gelu *Latinius.*

4. **benedicti.** The MSS. all read 'benedictae,' which *Rig.* first altered because the exhortation is a general one addressed to all the martyrs. In chap. 4 'benedictae' is undoubtedly right, the women being specially singled out.

5. **Bonum agonem.** 1 Tim. vi. 12; 2 Tim. ii. 4 f.; iv. 8. Comp. *de coron.* 15; *de spect.* 11. This metaphorical passage, based upon the athletic contests in the public games, furnishes another parallel to the visions of Perpetua; see *Pass. S. Perp.* 10. The same eloquent simile is used Clem. Alex. *Strom.* vii. 839.

6. **agonothetes,** 'the president' of the games, Spart. *Had.* 13. Comp. *de fug. in pers.* 1 'Ita agnosces ad eundem agonothetam pertinere certaminis arbitrium, qui invitat ad praemium.'

xystarches, 'the trainer' of the xystici or athletes, who directed their discipline and prepared them for competition.

7. **corona**: the victor's garland (στέφανος).

aeternitatis: aeternitas, *Rig.*

brabium, 'the prize' (βραβεῖον) assigned to the victor by the president. Comp. 1 Cor. ix. 24; Phil. iii. 14; Clem. Rom. 5.

angelicae substantiae. Comp. *Apol.* 48 'superinduti substantia propria aeternitatis'; *ad uxor.* i. 1 'translatis in angelicam qualitatem'; *de res. carn.* 26, 36. The idea was based on S. Luke xx. 36.

8. **politia in caelis**: 'citzenship (πολιτεία) in the heavens'; Phil. iii. 30; cp. Heb. xi. 13; 1 Pet. ii. 11.

9. **Spiritu unxit.** Comp. 1 S. John ii. 20. The metaphor is still that of the palaestra; see Ignatius *Ephes.* 3 with Lightfoot's note; *Pass. S. Perp.* 10.

et ad hoc scamma produxit, voluit vos ante diem agonis ad duriorem tractationem a liberiore condicione seponere, ut vires corroborarentur in vobis. Nempe enim et athletae segregantur ad strictiorem disciplinam, ut robori aedificando vacent. Continentur a luxuria, a cibis laetioribus, a potu iucundiore. Coguntur, cruciantur, fatigantur: quanto plus in exercitationibus laboraverint, tanto plus de victoria sperant. Et illi, inquit Apostolus, ut coronam corruptibilem consequantur. Nos aeternam consecuturi carcerem nobis pro palaestra interpretamur, ut ad stadium tribunalis bene exercitati incommodis omnibus producamur, quia virtus duritia exstruitur, mollitia vero destruitur.

CAPUT IV.

SCIMUS ex dominico praecepto, quod caro infirma sit, spiritus promptus. Non ergo nobis blandiamur, quia Dominus consensit carnem infirmam esse. Propterea enim praedixit spiritum promptum, ut ostenderet, quid cui debeat esse subiectum, scilicet, ut caro serviat spiritui, infirmior fortiori, ut ab eo etiam ipsa fortitudinem assumat. Colloquatur spiritus cum carne de communi salute, nec iam de incommodis carceris, sed ipso agone et proelio cogitans.

1. **scamma.** The *σκάμμα* was properly a portion of the palaestra dug out and sanded for the wrestlers or leapers; Krause *Hellen.* i. 105 f.; cp. Clem. Rom. 7 (Lightfoot's note). The martyrs' prison, then, from a fifth point of sight is a 'wrestling ground,' where the last contest is to be entered upon and the victory won.

4. **disciplinam,** 'training': see note *de praescr. haer.* 6.

5. **vacent:** 'that they may be free *for*': constructed with *a* and the *abl.* vacare = 'to be free *from*,' see above ch. 2; *de idol.* 8. For another use of vacare (= non exsistere) see note *Apol.* 1.

8. **inquit Apostolus.** 1 Cor. ix. 25.

coronam corruptibilem. The fading chaplet of leaves, oleaster, pine, ivy, parsley or bay.

10. **pro palaestra:** 'as a wrestling-school,' or 'training-ground,' see above on 'scamma.'

CHAP. IV.—13. **ex dominico praecepto.** S. Matt. xxvi. 41.

Timebit forsitan caro gladium gravem, et crucem excelsam, et rabiem bestiarum, et summam ignium poenam, et omne carnificis ingenium in tormentis. Sed spiritus contraponat sibi et carni, acerba licet ista, a multis tamen aequo animo excepta, immo et ultro appetita, famae et gloriae caussa; nec a viris tantum, sed etiam a feminis, ut vos quoque, benedictae, sexui vestro respondeatis. Longum est, si enumerem singulos, qui se gladio confecerint, animo suo ducti. De feminis ad manum est. Lucretia, quae vim stupri passa est, cultrum sibi adegit in conspectu propinquorum, ut gloriam castitati suae pareret. Mucius manum suam dexteram in ara cremavit, ut hoc factum eius fama haberet. Minus fecerunt philosophi: Heraclitus, qui se bubulo stercore oblitum exussit; item Empedocles, qui in ignes Aetnaei montis desilivit; et Peregrinus, qui non olim se rogo immisit: cum feminae quoque contempserint ignes: Dido, ne post virum dilectissimum nubere cogeretur; item

1. **Timebit forsitan,** &c. Compare the description of the tortures undergone by the Gallican martyrs in the Epistle *ap.* Euseb. v. 1.

9. **Lucretia.** Liv. i. 58; Cicero *de rep.* ii. 25. 47; Aur. Vict. *de vir. ill.* 9; Val. Max. vi. 1. 1.

11. **Mucius.** Liv. ii. 12; Aur. Vict. 12; Val. Max. iii. 3. 1. Comp. *Apol.* 50; Min. Felix 37; Martial x. 25.

13. **Heraclitus.** There are three accounts of the death of this philosopher given by Diogenes Laertius in his life, ix. 3, 4.

14. **Empedocles.** Diog. Laert. viii. 70. Comp. *Apol.* 50; *de anim.* 32.

15. **Peregrinus.** Peregrinus Proteus whose life is related by Lucian *de mort. Peregr.* If the details are not fictitious, he was a criminal refugee from his home at Parium on the Hellespont. In Palestine he became a Christian, and was imprisoned for his faith. Subsequently he apostatised and became a Cynic philosopher. Banished from Rome he went to Greece, and, to rival the death of Hercules, burnt himself alive at the Olympic games, A. D. 165. Ammian. Marc. xxix. 1 '[Peregrinus Proteus] qui cum mundo digredi statuisset, Olympiae quinquennali certamine sub Graeciae conspectu totius adscenso rogo quem ipse construxit, flammis absumptus est.' Aul. Gell. [viii. 3] xii. 11; Athenag. pro Christ. 26; Tatian. *Orat.* 25.

17. **Dido.** Verg. *Aen.* iv. 504 ff. Comp. *Apol.* 50; *ad Nat.* i. 18.

Asdrubalis uxor, quae iam ardente Carthagine cum maritum suum supplicem Scipionis videret, cum filiis suis in incendium patriae devolavit. Regulus, dux Romanorum, captus a Carthaginiensibus, cum se unum pro multis captivis Carthaginiensibus compensari noluisset, maluit hostibus reddi et in arcae genus stipatus undique extrinsecus clavis transfixus, tot cruces sensit. Bestias femina libens appetiit, et utique horridiores aspides serpentes tauro vel urso, quas Cleopatra immisit sibi, ne in manus inimici perveniret. Sed mortis metus non tantus est, quantus tormentorum. Itaque, cessit carnifici meretrix Atheniensis, quae conscia coniurationis cum propterea torqueretur a tyranno, et non prodidit coniuratos et novissime linguam suam comestam in faciem tyranni exspuit, ut nihil agere in se sciret tormenta, etsi ultra perseveraret. Nam quod hodie apud Lacedaemonas sollemnitas maxima est, *διαμαστίγωσις*, id est, flagellatio, non

1. **Asdrubalis uxor.** Flor. ii. 15; Val. Max. iii. 28. Comp. *ad Nat.* i. 18.

cum maritum. *Rig.*: ne maritum *Oehl.* following *Ios. Scaliger*: maritum *rel.*

3. **Regulus.** His brave story was told by Livy in his 18th (lost) book. Comp. Cicero *de offic.* iii. 26. 99; Hor. *Carm.* iii. 5; Val. Max. ii. 10. 8; Aul. Gell. vi. 4; *Apol.* 50; *ad Nat.* i. 18; *de exhort. cast.* 31.

9. **Cleopatra.** Flor. iv. 11; Hor. *Carm.* i. 37. 26; but Plutarch doubtfully, *vit. Ant.* xliv. Comp. *ad Nat.* i. 18.

10. **Itaque, cessit, &c.** This is ironical: *cessit* = 'succumbed.' Tertullian frequently thus glides into irony without inserting his favourite 'plane' or 'opinor.' Below *cesserit plagis* = 'should yield itself to stripes'; and *cessit* here might bear the meaning of 'yielded herself to the power of,' 'let him do his worst upon her,' not ironically said; though I prefer it as given above.

11. **meretrix Atheniensis.** Leaena, see her story in Plin. *H. N.* vii. 23; Pausan. i. 23; comp. *Apol.* 50; *ad Nat.* i. 18. A similar feat is recorded of Zeno and of Anaxarchus, Diogen. Laert. ix. 58, x. 59; Val. Max. iii. 3. 4.

13. **novissime** = postremo; see note *de praescr. haer.* 14.

14. **in se.** *Iun.*, *Oehl.*: se sciret in tormenta *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Flor.* 529, *Rhen.*: se scierent tormenta *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*

16. **διαμαστίγωσις.** On these flagellations see Plutarch. *de Lac.*

latet. In quo sacro, ante aram nobiles quique adolescentes, flagellis affliguntur, astantibus parentibus et propinquis, et uti perseverent adhortantibus. Ornamentum enim et gloria deputabitur maiore quidem titulo, si anima potius cesserit plagis, quam corpus. Igitur si tantum terrenae gloriae licet de corporis et animi vigore, ut gladium, ignem, crucem, bestias, tormenta contemnat, sub praemio laudis humanae, possum dicere, modicae sunt istae passiones ad consecutionem gloriae caelestis et divinae mercedis. Tanti vitreum, quanti verum margaritum? Quis ergo non libentissime tantum pro vero habeat erogare, quantum alii pro falso?

CAPUT V.

OMITTO nunc gloriae caussam. Eadem omnia saevitiae et cruciatus certamina, iam apud homines affectatio quoque et morbus quidam animi conculcavit. Quot otiosos affectatio armorum ad gladium locat? Certe ad feras ipsas affectatione

Inst. 4. They were connected with the worship of the Brauronian Artemis, before whose altar they were inflicted. They have been explained as inculcating fortitude, or as a substitute for the human sacrifices offered to the goddess. Comp. *Apol.* 50; *ad Nat.* i. 18.

1. **In quo sacro**: 'in this religious ceremony': *sacro* is here used as *Apol.* 9 'de infanticidis nihil interest, sacro an arbitrio.'

10. **margaritum.** This is the form of the word which Tertullian uses, *ad uxor.* ii. 5; *de pall.* 5. For the thought, comp. Ignatius *Ephes.* 11 writing of his bonds τὰ δεσμὰ περιφέρω τοὺς πνευματικοὺς μαργαρίτας Tert. *adv. Marc.* ii. 4. The proverb occurs often in Jerome's writings.

11. **habeat.** On this use of *habere* [=debere] see note *de praescr. haer.* 18.

erogare = impendere. Its other uses in Tertullian have been noted *de praescr. haer.* 2.

CHAP. V.—15. **Certe ad feras, &c.** Even Roman citizens forgot their dignity and descended into the arena. The shameless Commodus gloried in such deeds, Lampr. *Comm.* 8; Dion Cass. lxxii. 15; comp. Sueton. *Iul. Caes.* 39. Juvenal bewails such degradation of nobly-born Romans *Sat.* ii. 143 ff.; see too Dion Cass. lxi. 19 ff., Suet. *Ner.* 22 of Nero's exhibitions of himself in the Circus Maximus.

descendunt et de morsibus et de cicatricibus formosiores sibi videntur. Iam et ad ignes quidam se auctoraverunt, ut certum spatium in tunica ardente conficerent. Alii inter venatorum taureas scapulis patientissimis inambulaverunt. Haec, benedicti, non sine caussa Dominus in saeculum admisit; sed ad nos et nunc exhortandos, et in illo die confundendos, si reformidaverimus pati pro veritate in salutem, quae alii affectaverunt pro vanitate in perditionem.

CAPUT VI.

SED haec exempla constantiae omittamus de affectatione venientis. Convertamur ad ipsam condicionis humanae contemplationem, ut et illa nos instruant, si qua constanter adeunda sint, quae et invitis evenire consueverunt. Quotiens enim incendia vivos cremaverunt! quotiens ferae et in silvis suis et in mediis civitatibus elapsae caveis homines devoraverunt! quot a latronibus ferro, ab hostibus etiam cruce extincti sunt, torti prius, immo et omni contumelia expuncti! Nemo non etiam hominis caussa pati potest, quod in caussa Dei pati dubitat. Ad hoc quidem vel praesentia nobis

2. **se auctoraverunt.** See note *ad Scap.* 1.

3. **tunica ardente.** Comp. *ad Nat.* i. 18. For the tunica molesta, made of pitch, in which criminals were burnt alive, see Iuven. i. 155, viii. 235; Martial. x. 25; Seneca *de ira* ii. 3, *Epist.* 14; cp. Tacit. *Ann.* xv. 44.

4. **taureas.** *Taurea* is here the long hunting-whip of cowhide: Iuvenal. vi. 492; Salvian. *de gub. Dei* viii. 4. Comp. *ad Nat.* i. 18.

6. **in illo die.** 2 Tim. iv. 8.

CHAP. VI.—16. **expuncti**: 'having been disposed of,' 'got rid of,' with every kind of insult. *Expungere* is used very curiously by Tertullian: the original and underlying idea is that of 'pricking out of a list' and so 'discharging,' 'disposing of,' 'fulfilling.' For instances see *Apol.* 2, 15, 21, 35; *ad Nat.* i. 7; *de orat.* 9; *de coron.* 1; *de idol.* 1, 13.

18. **praesentia nobis tempora, &c.** These words may be interpreted of Severus' wholesale slaughter of the followers of Albinus and Niger which is related by Spartian. *Sever.* 12; Dion Cass. lxxv. 8,

tempora documenta sint, quantae qualesque personae inopinatos natalibus et dignitatibus et corporibus et aetatibus suis exitus referunt hominis caussa; aut ab ipso, si contra eum fecerint: aut ab adversariis eius, si pro eo steterint.

lxxvi. 4; Herodian. iii. 8, 12. The eradication of the suspected traitors must have spread over several years, and might well have continued as late as the year 202 or 203; see the Introduction.

AD SCAPULAM

INTRODUCTION

Some fifteen years had passed since Tertullian had pleaded for Christianity in the 'Apology,' pouring scorn and contempt upon the persecutors for their disregard of the simplest rules alike of justice and of common sense, in condemning the Christian religion unheard and unknown; and now he once more takes up his pen to recapitulate his arguments in a personal appeal to the proconsul of the African province. The edict of Severus, which forbade Jews and Christians to proselytize[1], had been issued in the year 202 whilst he was in the East; and this prohibition was made the occasion of open attacks upon the Church in various parts of the Empire. The martyrdom of Perpetua and Felicitas with their companions at Karthage under Hilarian the procurator was, we may be sure, no isolated case, and throughout the next decade persecutions were frequent, their recurrence depending on the indifference, good nature, or hostility of the provincial executive[2]. Severus died at York early in 211, and his sons, the two Augusti Caracalla and Geta, shared between them the sovereignty of the Roman empire. But that fraternal

[1] Spartian, *Sever.* 17 'In itinere Palestinis plurima iura fundavit. Iudaeos fieri sub gravi poena vetuit. Idem de Christianis sanxit.' Two points in this edict deserve notice: (1) it refers only to new converts, and does not legislate with regard to persons already Christians; (2) the Jews and Christians are now formally and explicitly distinguished in a legal enactment.

[2] Chap. 4.

hatred which Tertullian had satirically denounced in the 'Apology'[1] as customary amongst the Romans received a signal exemplification in the case of these joint rulers; for little more than a year elapsed before Caracalla contrived his brother's assassination in his mother's arms, himself assisting in the bloody deed[2]. The exiles of Severus' reign had been early recalled[3], and although this action presumably carried with it to some extent a cessation of persecution, it may be inferred from expressions in this treatise that attacks upon the Christians, after the death of Severus and murder of Geta[4], were abetted by the African proconsul Scapula, and that Tertullian was on these grounds led to address the present dignified remonstrance to that governor.

The true nature of Christianity appears to be no better known to the magistrates than when the 'Apology' was written; its position is the same—that of a 'religio illicita,' and the persecutors are still ignorant of its aims and doctrines. Yet a loftier tone breathes through the condensed sentences of this Address, the opening chapters of which admirably epitomize the 'Apology.' Time had taught Tertullian rather to pity than to deride the aggressors.

The Address is free from any taint of Montanism, although Tertullian had for some years been engaged *inter alia* in the defence of Montanistic tenets. The claim of religious liberty and of freedom of conscience as a civil right, which was advanced in the 'Apology,' reappears here; and the natural tendency to see the hand of Divine judgement in the temporal afflictions which befel persecuting governors and people is especially marked.

The proconsul Scapula has been identified with great pro-

[1] Chap. 39.

[2] February 27, 212. Dion Cass. lxxvii. 23; Herodian, iv. 4; Spartian, *Sever.* 21; *Geta* 6.

[3] Dion Cass. lxxvii. 3.

[4] See note chap. 4.

bability with Scapula Tertullus, who was consul in the year 195, and whose proconsulship, according to the usual rules of promotion at this time, would fall some fifteen years later. This would coincide with the date already suggested for the Address, viz., sometime later than February in the year 212. The authorities for the text of AD SCAPULAM are the same as those for AD MARTYRAS.

SYNOPSIS

CHAPTER

I. Fear for you, not for ourselves, has prompted this address.

II. Our worship is that of the True God, and your refusal to allow us freedom of conscience is contrary to the principles of all religion. We are honest and loyal citizens.

III. Punishment has invariably overtaken those who have persecuted us: do you therefore take warning.

IV. It is your duty to punish crime, whereas your perverse administration of the law shews that you know us to be innocent. Other governors, aware of the same thing, have connived at our acquittal, or even shewn us honour. The manner of our life is just, pure, and benevolent.

V. We do not shrink from martyrdom; but we beg you to pause, and consider our numbers and our position, before you proceed to further persecutions.

AD SCAPULAM

CAPUT PRIMUM.

Nos quidem neque expavescimus, neque pertimescimus ea quae ab ignorantibus patimur, cum ad hanc sectam utique suscepta condicione eius pacti venerimus, ut etiam animas nostras auctorati in has pugnas accedamus, ea quae Deus repromittit consequi optantes, et ea quae diversae vitae comminatur pati timentes. Denique cum omni saevitia vestra concertamus, etiam ultro erumpentes, magisque damnati quam absoluti gaudemus. Itaque hunc libellum non nobis timentes misimus, sed vobis et omnibus inimicis nostris,

AD SCAPULAM. The MSS. and Edd. agree in the Title of this address. Rigalt quotes an inscription in the Farnese palace at Rome DEDICATA III. ID. APRIL. SCAPULA TERTULLO ET TINEIO CLEMENTE COS.

4. **auctorati,** 'having hazarded our very lives.' This deponent form *auctorari* is found in Apul. *Metam.* ix. 19; Digest. xxvi. 8. 4, xxvii. 6. 9. Elsewhere Tertullian uses the active, *ad mart.* 5; *ad Nat.* i. 18. The metaphor is taken from the gladiators who 'hired themselves out' to risk their lives in the shows.

6. **Denique,** 'Accordingly.' There are many instances of *denique* in the sense of *igitur, adeo, ex consequenti, proinde* in Tertullian's writings; below ch. 2, *Apol.* 42; *de bapt.* 10; *de paen.* 3; *de pat.* 4; *de pud.* i. 13; *de fug. in pers.* 2, 6; *de exh. cast.* 13; *adv. Marc.* i. 10, iv. 5, 25, 28, 39, v. 9, 10, 15, 17. For another very frequent use (= exempli gratia) see note *de praescr. haer.* 2.

7. **concertamus.** The metaphor is that of the battle-field: comp. *Apol.* 50 'Proelium est nobis, quod provocamur ad tribunalia, ut illic sub discrimine capitis pro veritate certemus.'

8. **gaudemus.** Comp. *Apol.* i. 46, 50. 1 S. Pet. iv. 14 ff.

nedum amicis. Ita enim disciplina iubemur diligere inimicos quoque, et orare pro iis qui nos persequuntur, ut haec sit perfecta et propria bonitas nostra, non communis. Amicos enim diligere omnium est, inimicos autem solorum Christianorum. Qui ergo dolemus de ignorantia vestra, et miseremur erroris humani, et futura prospicimus, et signa eorum cottidie intentari videmus, necesse est vel hoc modo erumpere ad proponenda vobis ea quae palam non vultis audire.

CAPUT II.

Nos unum Deum colimus, quem omnes naturaliter nostis, ad cuius fulgura et tonitrua contremiscitis, ad cuius beneficia gaudetis. Ceteros et ipsi putatis deos esse, quos nos daemonas scimus. Tamen humani iuris et naturalis potestatis est unicuique quod putaverit colere; nec alii obest aut prodest alterius religio. Sed nec religionis est cogere religionem, quae sponte suscipi debeat, non vi; cum et hostiae ab animo

1. **disciplina**, 'by our religion'; see note *de praescr. haer.* 6.

diligere inimicos. S. Matt. v. 44, 48; S. Luke vi. 28. Comp. *Apol.* 31.

5. **de ignorantia.** On this use of *de* (=*propter*) see note *de praescr. haer.* 3.

CHAP. II. 9. **Nos unum Deum colimus.** *Apol.* 17.

naturaliter. This is an echo of the argument touched upon *Apol.* 17, and elaborated in the treatise 'De Testimonio Animae.' The same confidence in the natural instincts of the human conscience towards the truth no doubt influenced Tertullian in his assertion of the claim of religious liberty, and in his repudiation of legal coercion in questions of worship.

11. **deos esse . . . daemonas.** The identity of the heathen gods with daemons had been already proved, *Apol.* 23.

12. **Tamen humani iuris**, &c. Comp. *Apol.* 24, where Tertullian complains that although this principle was recognized by the Romans so far that they admitted even the most ridiculous foreign cults, yet the Christians were debarred the free exercise of their religion and formed a solitary exception to the otherwise univeral extension of toleration.

15. **ab animo libenti.** On the necessity of spontaneity in worship see *Apol.* 9, 24, 28.

libenti expostulentur. Ita etsi nos compuleritis ad sacrificandum, nihil praestabitis diis vestris: ab invitis enim sacrificia non desiderabunt, nisi si contentiosi sunt; contentiosus autem Deus non est. Denique qui est verus, omnia sua ex aequo et profanis et suis praestat. Ideoque et iudicium constituit aeternum de gratis et ingratis. Tamen nos, quos sacrilegos existimatis, nec in furto unquam deprehendistis, nedum in sacrilegio. Omnes autem qui templa despoliant, et per deos iurant, et eosdem colunt, et Christiani non sunt, et sacrilegi tamen deprehenduntur. Longum est si retexamus, quibus aliis modis et derideantur et contemnantur omnes dii ab ipsis cultoribus suis. Sic et circa maiestatem imperatoris infamamur, tamen nunquam Albiniani, nec Nigriani, vel Cassiani inveniri potuerunt Christiani, sed idem ipsi qui per genios eorum in pridie usque iuraverant, qui pro salute eorum hostias et fecerant et voverant, qui Christianos saepe damnaverant, hostes eorum sunt reperti. Christianus

5. **et profanis et suis.** S. Matt. v. 45. Comp. *Apol.* 41, where Tertullian answers a retort based on the common sufferings of Christians and heathens in this world.

7. **nec in furto.** The integrity and loyalty of the early Christians were points on which they might deservedly boast: see below ch. 4; *Apol.* 2, 42, 44, 46; Aristid. *Apol.* 15; Iust. Mart. *Apol.* i. 16, 17. Comp. Plin. *Epist.* x. 96.

8. **nedum in sacrilegio.** *Apol.* 15, 37.

11. **contemnantur, &c.** This was shewn with much acuteness and satire *Apol.* 12, 14, 15.

12. **circa maiestatem.** The crime of 'majesty' or disloyalty was even more heinous than that of 'atheism' or 'sacrilege,' and formed one of the most frequent charges brought against the Christians. This indictment was fully answered *Apol.* 28 ff.

13. **Albiniani, Nigriani,** 'adherents of Albinus and Niger,' the two claimants to the imperial title, and rivals of Severus, in 193. They are mentioned *Apol.* 35 in a similar way as types of traitors along with Cassius, a usurper of the purple in the East in the reign of Marcus Aurelius, 175. Comp. below ch. 3.

14. **Cassiani,** 'followers of Cassius,' the usurper mentioned in the last note.

nullius est hostis, nedum imperatoris, quem sciens a Deo suo constitui, necesse est ut et ipsum diligat et revereatur et honoret et salvum velit, cum toto Romano imperio, quousque saeculum stabit: tamdiu enim stabit. Colimus ergo et imperatorem sic quomodo et nobis licet et ipsi expedit, ut hominem a Deo secundum, et quicquid est a Deo consecutum et solo Deo minorem. Hoc et ipse volet. Sic enim omnibus maior est, dum solo vero Deo minor est. Sic et ipsis diis maior est, dum et ipsi in potestate sunt eius. Itaque et sacrificamus pro salute imperatoris, sed Deo nostro et ipsius, sed quomodo praecepit Deus, pura prece. Non enim eget Deus, conditor universitatis, odoris aut sanguinis alicuius. Haec enim daemoniorum pabula sunt. Daemones autem non tantum respuimus, verum et revincimus, et cottidie traducimus, et de hominibus expellimus, sicut plurimis notum est. Ita nos magis oramus pro salute imperatoris, ab eo eam postulantes

1. **nullius**: *i.q.* neminis, as frequently; e.g. ch. 4; *Apol.* 8; *de idol.* 18; *Scorp.* 6.

a Deo suo constitui. *Apol.* 33 'noster est magis Caesar, ut a nostro Deo constitutus.' Rom. xiii. 1; Titus iii. 1; 1 S. Peter ii. 13.

4. **tamdiu enim stabit.** Tertullian states the common Christian belief of the early centuries that the destruction of the Roman empire would involve, and synchronize with, that of the world. 2 Thess. ii. 6 was frequently so interpreted; see note *Apol.* 32; Cyr. Ier. *Catech.* xv. 11 f.; August. *de civ. Dei* xx. 19; Lactant. vii. 25; Ambros. *ad Epist. i. ad Thess.* 'Non prius veniet Christus quam regni Romani defectio fiat, et appareat Antichristus'; &c.

6. **a Deo secundum.** *Apol.* 30, 33, 34.

9. **in potestate sunt eius.** *Apol.* 5, 13, 29, 30.

sacrificamus. *Apol.* 30; *de orat.* 28 'haec est hostia spiritalis quae pristina sacrificia delevit.' Tertullian also applies the term 'sacrificium' to fasting and mortification, *de res. carn.* 8; and to the Holy Eucharist, *de orat.* 19; *de cult. fem.* ii. 11.

13. **daemoniorum pabula.** See note *Apol.* 22.

14. **traducimus** = patefacimus; Tertullian often employs this word for *convincere, refutare*: *de anim.* 1; *de pud.* 8, 22; *adv. Herm.* 38; *adv. Prax.* 1.

de hominibus expellimus. *Apol.* 23: for *de* [=*ex*] see note *de praescr. haer.* 3.

qui praestare potest. Et utique ex disciplina patientiae divinae agere nos, satis manifestum esse vobis potest, cum tanta hominum multitudo, pars paene maior civitatis cuiusque, in silentio et modestia agimus, singuli forte noti magis quam omnes, nec aliunde noscibiles quam de emendatione vitiorum pristinorum. Absit enim ut indigne feramus ea nos pati quae optamus, aut ultionem a nobis aliquam machinemur, quam a Deo exspectamus.

CAPUT III.

TAMEN, sicut supra diximus, doleamus necesse est, quod nulla civitas impune latura sit sanguinis nostri effusionem; sicut et sub Hilariano praeside, cum de areis sepulturarum nostrarum adclamassent: Areae non sint! areae ipsorum

1. **disciplina.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 6.

3. **pars paene maior civitatis.** Comp. ch. 5; and for other early references to the numbers of the Christians see note *Apol.* 1, 37; and add Ignat. *Magn.* 10, *Rom.* 1.

5. **noscibiles**, 'recognizable': a word confined to ecclesiastical Latin. It is found in Augustin. *de Trin.* ix. 5. 12.

de emendatione vitiorum. *Apol.* 3.

7. **ultionem . . . a Deo exspectamus.** *Apol.* 37; Lactant. *de mort. pers.* 1.

CHAP. III.—11. **Hilariano.** Hilarian was the governor under whom Perpetua and her fellow-martyrs suffered at Karthage in 203: *Pass. S. Perp.* 6 'Hilarianus procurator qui tunc, loco proconsulis Minuci Timiniani defuncti, ius gladii acceperat.'

praeside. *Praeses* is the generic title which Tertullian gives to provincial governors, *Apol.* 2, 9, 30, 50; *de spect.* 30. Comp. Digest. i. *tit.* 18 'praesidis nomen generale est, eo quod et proconsules et legati Caesaris et omnes provinciae regentes, licet senatores sint, praesides appelluntur.' Gai. *Inst.* i. 6 (quoted Introd. to *Apol.* p. xviii); Suet. *Oct.* 23; Capitol. *Ant. Pius* 6.

12. **Areae non sint!** &c. '"Let them have no cemeteries!" they themselves had no threshing-floors: for they gathered no harvests.' The refusal of burying-places to the Christians was avenged by the failure of the harvests. Any open vacant spaces were termed *areae*, and Tertullian plays upon the word as applied, first, to the spaces outside the cities which were used as cemeteries, and secondly, to the

non fuerunt: messes enim suas non egerunt. Ceterum et imbres anni praeteriti quid commemoraverint genus humanum apparuit, cataclysmum scilicet et retro fuisse propter incredulitates et iniquitates hominum; et ignes qui super moenia Carthaginis proxime pependerunt per noctem, quid minati sint, sciunt qui viderunt; et pristina tonitrua quid sonaverint, sciunt qui obduruerunt. Omnia haec signa sunt imminentis irae Dei, quam necesse est, quoquo modo possumus, ut et annuntiemus et praedicemus, et deprecemur interim localem esse. Universalem enim et supremam suo tempore sentient, qui exempla eius aliter interpretantur. Nam et sol ille in conventu Uticensi, extincto paene lumine, adeo portentum

raised and levelled plats constructed in the fields for threshing-floors. For the former use of the word see Pont. Diac. *in Actis Cyprian.* 5 'eius corpus . . . sublatum ad areas Macrobii Candidiani procuratoris, quae sunt in via Mappaliensi iuxta piscinas': for the latter Verg. *Georg.* i. 178 ff.; Colum. v. 1. 4; 2. 20; Varro *de re rust.* i. 51.

2. **commemoraverint.** So *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Rhen.* Commemorare = commonere, commonefacere similarly August. *de unit. eccl.* 11; *contr. Cresc.* i. 38; *post Collat.* 20. See too Plaut. *Pseudol.* v. 1. 36. *Flor.* 12 reads commeruerunt: other MSS. and Edd. commeruerit.

3. **retro** = antea, as frequently in Tertullian; *Apol.* 1, 2, 3, 4, 21, 27, 40; *de idol.* 15; *de spect.* 9, 39; *de res. carn.* 58; *Pass. S. Perp.* 8.

4. **ignes.** Probably the Northern Lights described by Dion Cass. lxxvi. 4, writing of the year 196 *πῦρ αἰφνίδιον νυκτὸς ἐν τῷ ἀέρι τῷ πρὸς βορρᾶν τοσοῦτον ὤφθη, ὥστε τοὺς μὲν τὴν πόλιν ὅλην, τοὺς δὲ καὶ τὸν οὐρανὸν αὐτὸν καίεσθαι δοκεῖν.* (I owe this and the following note to Prof. Harris *Acts of Perp. and Fel.* p. 8.)

6. **tonitrua.** The thunderings and darkness have been explained as due to volcanic causes; since Dion Cass. lxxvi. 2 records an eruption of Vesuvius and very loud mutterings audible for many miles, sometime about the year 203.

11. **in conventu Uticensi.** 'Conventus' is the Latin equivalent of *διοίκησις*, the term applied to the 'political districts' or 'jurisdictions' into which certain Roman provinces were divided: see Plin. *H.N.* v. 29, where 'conventus' is used synonymously with 'iurisdictio.' Cicero *pro Lig.* 8 'conventus firmi atque magni [erant in Africa].' This is probably the meaning of the word here; though it is explained of the 'session of the annual African assembly' at Utica by Professor Salmon (*D. C. B.* iv. 592). 'Conventus' is also used of the judicial metropolis of a district,

fuit, ut non potuerit ex ordinario deliquio hoc pati, positus in suo hypsomate et domicilio. Habetis astrologos. Possumus aeque et exitus quorumdam praesidum tibi proponere, qui in fine vitae suae recordati sunt deliquisse, quod vexassent Christianos. Vigellius Saturninus, qui primus hic gladium in

Plin. *H. N.* iii. 1. 3 'iuridici conventus [Baeticae] quattuor, Gaditanus, Cordubensis,' &c. It may be in this sense that Jerome's phrase is to be understood, *de vir. illustr.* 17, where he asserts that Polycarp's letter was still read 'in conventu Asiae.'

extincto paene lumine. Astronomical calculations fail to discover any eclipse about this time visible in Africa which would explain this phenomenon; and Tertullian's reference to the astronomers implies that it baffled contemporary scientific opinion.

2. **hypsomate** = *ὑψώματι*, 'in its ascension,' or 'altitude.' *ὕψωμα* and *ταπείνωμα* are converse astrological terms used of the ascension and declension of stars; Sext. Empiric. v. 35. Tertullian's meaning is not very clear; but by 'suo hypsomate' he may mean the highest point of the plane of the ecliptic above the plane of the moon's orbit; and in such a position an eclipse of the sun would be, as he says, impossible. See however Petrus Possinus *apud* Migne *P. L.* iii. 59.

domicilio. This again is an astrological term, the technical signification of which in this connexion is obscure.

astrologos = *ἀστρολόγους*, 'astronomers': see note *Apol.* 1, and add *de idol.* 9; Apuleius *Apol.* 47; Hippol. *Philosoph.* iv *passim.*

3. **exitus.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 2. Lactantius in the fourth century collected instances of the dooms of persecutors and embodied them in his treatise 'De mortibus persecutorum' (comp. Euseb. i. 8). In more recent times Spelman ('De non temerandis ecclesiis') and Wayland Joyce ('Doom of Sacrilege') have attempted historical reviews of a similar nature.

5. **Vigellius Saturninus.** Under this proconsul, who had been 'legatus Augusti' in Lower Moesia, and whose full name was Publius Vigellius Raius Plarius Saturninus Atilius Braduanus Aucidius Tertullus, Namphamo the 'archimartyr' of Africa, with his companions Miggin, Lucitas, and Samaë, suffered martyrdom at Karthage on July 4, 180; Augustin. *Epist.* 15, 16. A fortnight later, July 17, the twelve Scillitan martyrs were put to death (for their names see *D. C. B.* ii. 501 *s. v.* FELIX 212). On Saturninus see a paper by Renier *Rev. Archéol.* 1864, x. 396; Comptes Rend. de l'Acad. des Inscr. 1864, pp. 256 ff. Lightfoot *Ignatius* i. 522 ff., where the martyrdoms are discussed and further references given.

nos egit, lumina amisit. Claudius Lucius Herminianus in Cappadocia, cum, indigne ferens uxorem suam ad hanc sectam transisse, Christianos crudeliter tractasset, solusque in praetorio suo vastatus peste, convivis vermibus ebullisset: Nemo sciat, aiebat, ne gaudeant Christiani aut sperent Christianae. Postea cognito errore suo, quod tormentis quosdam a proposito suo excidere fecisset, paene Christianus decessit. Caecilius Capella in illo exitu Byzantino: Christiani gaudete!

1. **lumina amisit.** This is almost entirely a poetic use of *lumina* for 'the eyes': Cicero *Tusc. disp.* v. 39. 114 has the exact expression, 'luminibus amissis.'

Herminianus. If the order be chronological the date of this governor will lie between that of Saturninus in 180, and that of Caecilius Capella in 196, and therefore probably during the reign of Commodus. The form of the name is very uncertain, Herminianus *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*, *Oehl.*: Gerominianus 3 *Vat.*: Hierorainianus *Vind.*, *Leid.*: Hierominianus *Rhen.*: Hieronymianus *alii*. Lightfoot has pointed out that in the middle of the fourth century the name Clodius Hermogenianus occurs in the inscriptions as belonging to two African proconsuls (*Ignatius* i. 539).

3. **praetorio.** The official residence of the provincial governor; originally 'the tent of the general' in time of war. 'Praetorium' was further applied to any splendid mansion or palatial residence, see *Pass. S. Perp.* 3; Martial. x. 79. 1.

4. **convivis.** Scaliger's emendation of the MSS. cum muris *Vind.*, *Leid.*: cum vivus *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*: cum vivis *Rhen.*

ebullisset. Tertullian uses *ebullire* in the sense of *fervere*, *ardere adv. Marc.* i. 27; *Scorp.* 1; *de idol.* 3.

5. **aut sperent Christianae.** These words are omitted in *Gorz.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*: for 'sperent,' *Vind.*, *Leid.* present 'spe.'

8. **Caecilius Capella.** Caecilius seems to have commanded the garrison at Byzantium on behalf of Niger, 194–196, and the Christians to have incurred his hatred by their loyalty to Severus, or at least by their refusal to aid his rival. Burton *Eccl. Hist.* p. 444 ff., Lightfoot *Ignatius* i. 526 f. Tertullian's oft-repeated boast that no Christian sided with Niger or Albinus seems to appeal to a fact that was notorious. The Byzantine persecution was referred to the reign of Marcus Aurelius by Tillemont *Mém.* ii. 315; and Renan *Marc. Aurèle* 279; but this would rob Tertullian's references to it of all point.

Byzantino. Byzantium was the last stronghold to remain in the hands of Niger's party; Spartian. *Sever.* 8. After a three years'

exclamavit. Sed qui videntur sibi impune tulisse, venient in diem divini iudicii. Tibi quoque optamus admonitionem solam fuisse, quod cum Adrumeticum Mavilum ad bestias damnasses, et statim haec vexatio subsecuta est, et nunc ex eadem caussa interpellatio sanguinis. Sed memento de cetero.

CAPUT IV.

NON te terremus, qui nec timemus; sed velim, ut omnes salvos facere possimus, monendo μὴ θεομαχεῖν. Potes et officio iurisdictionis tuae fungi et humanitatis meminisse, vel quia et vos sub gladio estis. Quid enim amplius tibi mandatur

siege it finally surrendered in 196 to Severus, who inflicted upon its inhabitants a terrible vengeance; Dion Cass. lxxiv. 10; Herodian. iii. 6.

Christiani gaudete! 'Gaudete!' was the congratulatory formula indicative of exultation or victory. Rigalt quotes the inscription on a gold coin commemorating a victory of Maximian GAUDETE ROMANI. Comp. Prudent. *Cath.* xii. 201; Martial xi. 61.

3. **Adrumeticum Mavilum.** Nothing more is known of this martyr. He is commemorated on Jan. 4 in the Bollandis Acts. Adrumetum (modern Susa), a city on the coast 100 miles south of Karthage, was the capital of the African province of Byzacium. Caes. *B. G.* ii. 23; Liv. xxx. 29; Plin. *H. N.* v. 4. 3.

ad bestias damnasses. This was contrary to law, see below ch. 4. The nobly-born Perpetua was thus illegally condemned.

4. **et statim haec vexatio, &c.** This sentence is very obscure: *haec vexatio* may be (1) identical with *interpellatio sanguinis*, and then will probably refer to an attack of illness which had seized the proconsul, and was now again repeated as a warning; *interpellatio* on this view simply = monitus. Or (2) on the other hand they may be distinguished, *vexatio* referring to the destructive rains mentioned above, and *interp. sang.* to a new outbreak of pestilence.

5. **interpellatio.** The 'interruption,' in the form of some personal or public calamity, which put a stop to the governor's persecuting policy. In the Oxford translation, however, the phrase has been interpreted quite differently of the blood of the Christian martyrs appealing for justice; *interpellatio* being in legal terminology an 'appeal to the court': Digest. v. 1. 23, l. 16. 1.

de cetero, 'for the future': comp. *Apol.* 2 'quid de cetero ageret.'

CHAP. IV.—8. **μὴ θεομαχεῖν.** Acts v. 39.

quam nocentes confessos damnare, negantes autem ad tormenta revocare? Videtis ergo quomodo ipsi vos contra mandata faciatis, ut confessos negare cogatis. Adeo confitemini innocentes esse nos, quos damnare statim ex confessione non vultis. Si autem contenditis ad elidendos nos, iam ergo innocentiam expugnatis. Quanti autem praesides, et constantiores et crudeliores, dissimulaverunt ab huiusmodi caussis! ut Cincius Severus, qui Thysdri ipse dedit remedium, quomodo responderent Christiani, ut dimitti possent; ut Vespronius Candidus, qui Christianum quasi tumultuosum civibus suis satisfacere dimisit; ut Asper, qui modice vexatum

3. **negare cogatis.** *Apol.* 2.

5. **ad elidendos nos,** 'to squeeze a denial out of us.' I believe *elidere* here bears this meaning rather than 'to strangle our existence,' 'to stamp us out.' Tertullian's use of *elidere* is not confined to its more usual signification of 'throttling,' see note *Apol.* 23; *de spect.* 18 'primos homines diabolus elisit,' where it simply means 'overthrew.' 'From your persistent efforts to make us deny our confession,' Tertullian would say, 'it is obvious that the object of your assault (*expugnatis*) is our innocence.'

6. **Quanti** = quot, as frequently; see note *de praescr. haer.* 10.

7. **dissimulaverunt ab h. caussis** = neglexerunt has caussas. Dissimulare = neglegere *Apol.* 2 'Parcit et saevit, dissimulat et animadvertit.' So dissimulatio = neglegentia *adv. Marc.* v. 5.

8. **Cincius Severus.** This governor was put to death by Severus some time after the slaughter of the numerous and distinguished partizans of Albinus in 197; Spartian. *Sever.* 13. Tertullian may have had Cincius in his mind when writing in *Apol.* 35 of those who were daily being detected as disloyal subjects.

Thysdri. Thysdrus, Θυσδρός, a fortified city in the province of Byzacium, 150 miles south of Karthage; modern El Djem. It was at this city that the proconsul Gordian assumed the purple in February 238; Capitol. *Gord.* 8; Herodian. vii. 6.

10. **Vespronius Candidus.** Proconsul A.D. 190–192. Vespronius had been sent as one of the legates of the Senate to the legions under Severus in 193 to persuade them to desert their commander and support Didius Julianus; Spartian. *Iul.* 5.

11. **Asper.** Julius Asper, proconsul of Africa cir. 205.

modice vexatum, 'only slightly racked.'

hominem et statim deiectum, nec sacrificium compulit facere, ante professus inter advocatos et adsessores, dolere se incidisse in hanc caussam. Pudens etiam missum ad se Christianum in elogio concussione eius intellecta dimisit, scisso eodem elogio, sine accusatore negans se auditurum hominem secundum mandatum. Haec omnia tibi et de officio suggeri possunt, et ab eisdem advocatis, qui et ipsi beneficia habent Christianorum, licet adclament, quae volunt. Nam et cuiusdam notarius, cum a daemone praecipitaretur, liberatus est;

1. **deiectum**; *sc.* fide: 'apostatized.' The word is thus used of 'steadfastness overthrown' *Pass. S. Perp.* 3, 5.

2. **advocatores et adsessores.** Two forensic terms: 'advocatus' being a counsel or witness called in to the aid of a litigant; and 'adsessor,' exactly what the English derivative denotes, the assistant of a judge; Sueton. *Galb.* 14; Digest. i. 22; August. *Conf.* vi. 10.

3. **Pudens.** This governor may perhaps be identified with Quintus Servilius Pudens who was consul 166; Lamprid. *Comm.* 11. If so, his proconsulship may be dated just before that of Saturninus, cir. 178 or 179. He may, however, as the last governor mentioned by Tertullian, have been the immediate predecessor of Scapula, A.D. 210.

4. **elogio.** *Elogium* is a word of very frequent recurrence in Tertullian. Here it signifies the written 'warrant,' capable of being torn (*scisso*), which contained the summary of the criminal charge. More generally it is used of the 'indictment,' 'accusation,' or 'crime': see note *Apol.* 2; and add *Apol.* 15 'Iovis elogia,' 'the crimes of Jupiter'; *de idol.* 1; *de coron.* 5; *de ieiun.* 17.

concussione. In juridical Latin 'concussio' is 'an extortion of money under threats'; Digest. xlvi. 17; and so below ch. 5 (see note), *Apol.* 7 (see note). Here of a 'vexatious' indictment. The verb 'concutere' is used in its ordinary sense of natural or political disturbances *Apol.* 25, 31; and so 'concussio totius mundi' of the Last Day, *de monogam.* 16.

5. **secundum mandatum.** Anonymous accusations had been forbidden by Trajan, and it is to that ruling that the words refer; Plin. *Epist.* x. 97 'Sine auctore vero propositi libelli, nullo crimine locum habere debent: nam et pessimi exempli, nec nostri saeculi est.' Lightfoot, following Rigalt, refers it to the rescript of Hadrian to Fundanus, Euseb. iv. 9 (*Ignatius* i. 476 ff., 522).

6. **suggeri possunt,** 'might be suggested': see notes *Apol.* 18; *de praescr. haer.* 6.

8. **cuiusdam notarius,** 'a short-hand writer in the employ of a certain attorney (*advocatus*).'

et quorumdam propinquus et puerulus; et quanti honesti viri (de vulgaribus enim non dicimus) aut a daemoniis aut valetudinibus remediati sunt! Ipse etiam Severus pater Antonini, Christianorum memor fuit. Nam et Proculum Christianum qui Torpacion cognominabatur, Euhodiae procuratorem, qui eum per oleum aliquando curaverat, requisivit et in palatio suo habuit usque ad mortem eius; quem et Antoninus optime noverat lacte Christiano educatus. Sed et

3. **Severus pater Antonini.** The form of this expression implies that Antoninus, i.e. Bassianus Caracalla, was reigning alone, otherwise 'et Getae' would naturally have been added. This address was therefore written after the murder of Geta in February 212.

5. **Euhodiae.** There can be little doubt that this is the right form of the name, which also occurs in an inscription quoted by Oehler from Gruter DCCLXXXIX. 5. The text follows *Rig.*, *Scaliger*, *Oehl.*: Euhodeae *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*: Euhodae *Vind.*: Enhodae *Leid.*: Euhode *Gorz.*: Euhodi *Pith.* Rigalt, however, was disposed to follow Pamelius and Junius in their suggestion to read 'euhodiae' (not as a proper name), and to refer it to the duties of Proculus as overseer of the roads (τῇ εὐοδίᾳ). This Proculus they would identify with Eutychius Proculus the grammarian, a friend of Antoninus Pius (who is mentioned Capitol. *Ant. Pius* 2; Trebell. Poll. *Trig. tyr.*, *Aemilian*), on the ground that Eutychius is the Greek equivalent of the Punic name Torpacion (Topacron, Toparcion); but these conjectures were rightly rejected by Casaubon *Hist. August.* p. 57.

procuratorem, 'the agent' of Euhodia. The 'procurator' was the steward or man of business of a private citizen, and often the manager of his estates. In the senatorial provinces under the empire the 'procurator' was the emperor's steward and took charge of his private revenues, on emergency also assuming the duties of the proconsul, as Hilarian did, *Pass. S. Perp.* 6 (quoted above ch. 3); comp. Tacit. *Hist.* i. 11; *Ann.* xii. 60. In the imperial provinces he filled the place of the 'quaestor'; while in some special districts, such as Judaea and the Alpine regions, the direct deputy of the emperor received the title of 'procurator.' Gibbon i. 201; Merivale *Hist. Rom.* iv. 125.

6. **per oleum . . . curaverat.** Severus suffered from gout; Spartian. *Sever.* 16.

8. **lacte Christiano educatus.** These words have been understood to imply that Caracalla had had a Christian wet-nurse, or at least had been brought up under Christian influences. Spartian mentions incidentally that as a boy he had a Jewish (=most probably, Christian)

clarissimas feminas et clarissimos viros Severus, sciens huius sectae esse, non modo non laesit, verum et testimonio exornavit, et populo furenti in nos palam restitit. Marcus quoque Aurelius in Germanica expeditione Christianorum

playmate; *Caracalla* 1, 'Septennis puer, cum conlusorem puerum ob Iudaicam religionem gravius verberatum audisset, neque patrem suum neque patrem pueri velut auctores verberum diu respexit.' *Cod. Divion.* reads instead of the text, 'Christianis educatum,' referring the Christian education to Proculus instead of Caracalla.

1. **clarissimas . . . clarissimos.** That Christianity did include amongst its disciples some persons of rank and distinction is proved both by the words of Pliny (*Epist.* x. 96 'omnis ordinis') written in 112, and by incidental notices in other writers: below ch. 5 'tui ordinis viros'; see note *Apol.* 1: Lightfoot *Philippians* p. 21, *Ignatius* ii. 186, 196, *Clem. Rom.* i. 30.

2. **exornavit.** The occasion of this clemency and protection seems to have been on Severus' entry into Rome after the victory over Albinus (Feb. 197), when the Christians were attacked by the mob for consistently holding aloof from the riotous and to them idolatrous demonstrations of public joy; comp. *Apol.* 35. A writer in *D. C. B.* i. 401 suggests, from conjecture, 'exoneravit' for the text.

3. **Marcus Aurelius,** &c. Comp. *Apol.* 5. Of the story of the 'Thundering Legion' the historical facts are these. During the intense heat of the summer of 174, during his expedition against the Quadi, M. Aurelius was surprised near Carnuntum and cut off from all water supplies. At this juncture an opportune storm relieved the wants of his soldiers, who were then led on to victory; and the Emperor wrote to announce the fact to the Senate. The rain was attributed by the Christians in the army to their own prayers; by the pagans to the prayers of Aurelius (Capitol. *M. Ant. Phil.* 24; Themistius *Orat.* 15), to Jupiter Pluvius (Anton. Column), or to the incantations of two magi Arnuphis and Julian (Dion Cass. lxxi. 8 ff.). The miraculous element disappears from the story entirely under scrutiny, and the additions of later writers need not be noticed (Oros. vii. 15; Niceph. iv. 12). To the statement of Claudius Apollinaris (*apud* Euseb. v. 5) that the name 'Thundering Legion' was given by Aurelius to the Legion of Christian soldiers, at whose intercession the relief had been vouchsafed, it is sufficient to oppose the fact that in the time of Nero there was already a Legion so called—the XIIth (*C. I. L.* iii. 30, 6097; Dion Cass. lv. 23) τὸ κεραυνοφόρον, 'Fulminata.' It is clear too that at this time a whole legion could not have been composed entirely of Christians. In *Apol.* 5 Tertullian hazards a conjecture that the letter written by Aurelius to

militum orationibus ad Deum factis imbres in siti illa impetravit. Quando non geniculationibus et ieiunationibus nostris etiam siccitates sunt depulsae? Tunc et populus adclamans Deo deorum, qui solus potens, in Iovis nomine Deo nostro testimonium reddidit. Praeter haec depositum non abnegamus, matrimonium nullius adulteramus, pupillos pie tractamus, indigentibus refrigeramus, nulli malum pro malo reddimus. Viderint, qui sectam mentiuntur, quos et ipsi recusamus. Quis denique de nobis alio nomine queritur? Quod aliud negotium patitur Christianus, nisi suae sectae quam incestam, quam crudelem, tanto tempore nemo probavit? Pro tanta innocentia, pro tanta probitate, pro iustitia, pro pudicitia, pro fide, pro veritate, pro Deo vivo, cremamur; quod nec sacrilegi, nec hostes publici veri, nec tot maiestatis

the Senate would be found among the archives and that it would contain a reference to the Christians. He nowhere claims to have seen the letter however, and the latter part of his conjecture is certainly unfounded. Merivale *Hist. Rom.* viii. 338; Lightfoot *Ignatius* i. 485 ff.

3. **siccitates sunt depulsae.** Comp. *Apol.* 40.

5. **testimonium reddidit.** See notes *Apol.* 14, 46.

depositum non abnegamus. See note ch. 2.

6. **nullius.** See note ch. 2.

pupillos pie tractamus. Comp. Iuvenal, vi. 628 ff. for the dangers menacing rich wards from the avarice of their relatives or guardians.

7. **refrigeramus,** 'we relieve,' 'refresh': it is a common verb in Tertullian, as also the subst. 'refrigerium'; *Apol.* 39, 49; *adv. Marc.* iii. 24, iv. 16; *de idol.* 13; *Pass. S. Perp.* 1, 3, 5; *de anim.* 51; *de ieiun.* 10; *adv. Prax.* 16.

nulli malum, &c. Rom. xii. 17.

8. **Viderint:** see note *de praescr. haer.* 7.

quos et ipsi recusamus. Heretics or delinquents, who were excommunicated; comp. *Apol.* 39, 44, 46; *de pudic.* 3, 18; *de paen.* 9. The Church often suffered through heretical misrepresentations of her doctrines, and the gross immoralities of certain heretical sects; *de praescr. haer.* 4; Euseb. iv. 7.

9. **alio nomine.** *Apol.* 44.

14. **hostes publici.** *Apol.* 35.

veri. So *Vind.*, *Leid.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*: verum *Rig.*, *Latinius.*

rei pati solent. Nam et nunc a praeside Legionis, et a praeside Mauritaniae vexatur hoc nomen, sed gladio tenus, sicut et a primordio mandatum est animadverti in huiusmodi. Sed maiora certamina, maiora praemia.

CAPUT V.

CRUDELITAS vestra gloria est nostra. Vide tantum ne hoc ipso, quod talia sustinemus, ad hoc solum videamur erumpere, ut hoc ipsum probemus, nos haec non timere, sed ultro vocare. Arrius Antoninus in Asia cum persequeretur instanter, omnes illius civitatis Christiani ante tribunalia eius se manu facta obtulerunt. Tum ille, paucis duci iussis, reliquis ait, Ὦ δεῖλοι, εἰ θέλετε ἀποθνήσκειν, κρημνοὺς ἢ βρόχους ἔχετε. Hoc si placuerit et hic fieri, quid facies de tantis millibus hominum, tot viris ac feminis, omnis sexus, omnis

1. **Legionis.** Numidia is no doubt intended, where the IIIrd Augustan Legion had its camp at the town of Lambaesa; Dion Cass. lv. 23; Cyprian. *Epist.* 55.

2. **Mauritaniae.** Mauritania had been temporarily annexed to the empire in B. C. 33 on the death of king Bocchus (Dion Cass. xlix. 43); but eight years later Augustus presented it to Juba, a son of the late king of Numidia. In A. D. 42 it was again incorporated, and divided by Claudius into the two provinces of Tingitana and Caesariensis.

gladio tenus, 'only by the sword,' not by the inhuman deaths inflicted by Scapula, such as throwing to the beasts (ch. 3) or burning at the stake.

3. **huiusmodi.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 4.

CHAP. V.—8. **Arrius Antoninus.** A proconsul of Asia of this name, whose character agrees with what is here told of him, was put to death on a false charge by Commodus; Lamprid. *Comm.* 7. An earlier proconsul of the same name under Titus or Domitian, is addressed by Pliny (*Epist.* iv. 3) and mentioned by Capitolinus (*Ant. Pius* 1). See Lightfoot *Ignatius* i. 539.

10. **manu facta.** See note *Apol.* 39.

duci, 'to be executed': *duci* is used thus absolutely (*sc.* 'ad mortem') Phil. *Epist.* x. 96; Sueton. *Calig.* 27; Lactant. *de mort. pers.* 40; Acts Scillit. mart. *ad fin.*

12. **tantis.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 10.

tantis millibus hominum. See above chap. 2.

aetatis, omnis dignitatis, offerentibus se tibi? Quantis ignibus, quantis gladiis opus erit! quid ipsa Carthago passura est, decimanda a te, cum propinquos, cum contubernales suos illic unusquisque cognoverit, cum viderit illic fortasse et tui ordinis viros et matronas, et principales quasque personas, et amicorum tuorum vel propinquos vel amicos? Parce ergo tibi, si non nobis. Parce Carthagini, si non tibi. Parce provinciae, quae visa intentione tua obnoxia facta est concussionibus et militum et inimicorum suorum cuiusque. Magistrum neminem habemus, nisi Deum solum. Hic ante te est, nec abscondi potest, sed cui nihil facere possis. Ceterum quos putas tibi magistros, homines sunt et ipsi morituri quandoque. Nec tamen deficiet haec secta, quam tunc magis aedificari scias, cum caedi videtur. Quisque enim tantam tolerantiam spectans, ut aliquo scrupulo percussus, et inquirere accenditur, quid sit in caussa, et ubi cognoverit veritatem, et ipse statim sequitur.

omnis sexus. *i.q.* utriusque sexus; so again *Apol.* 1; Min. Fel. 9. 28; Lactant. i. 20, 25.

8. **intentione tua,** 'by your purpose': an unusual meaning of 'intentio'; but see Plin. *Paneg.* 78; Digest. xxxiv. 1, 10.

9. **obnoxia . . . concussionibus,** 'liable to violent extortions (to avert accusation) at the hands of the soldiery and one's private enemies.' See note ch. 4; comp. *de fug. in pers.* 12; *Apol.* 7.

10. **Magistrum neminem habemus.** *Apol.* 34; *de idol.* 18.

12. **magistros, homines.** *Apol.* 33.

14. **tunc magis aedificari.** *Apol.* 50.

APPENDIX

PSEUDO-TERTULLIANI

ADVERSUS OMNES HAERESES

INTRODUCTION

THIS Appendix is not from Tertullian's pen, but is usually printed along with the treatise 'De Praescriptione Haereticorum.' In the editions of Gangnaeus, Gelenius, and Pamelius, it forms an immediate continuation of the last chapter of that treatise. Rigalt separated it, but without a fresh heading. It is not found in Codices *Agob.*, *Corb.*, *Brit.* The MSS. which contain it are *Leid.*, *Flor.* 13, *Flor.* 55, *Magl.* 527, *Magl.* 528, *Gorz.*, *Vatic.*, *Patern.*, *Hirsaug.* Its title in *Leid.*, *Flor.* 55, *Magl.* 528, *Vatic.*, is ADVERSUS OMNES HAERESES: in *Flor.* 13, *Magl.* 527, ADVERSUS OMNES HAERETICOS. *Patern.* gives no title. It was included by Routh in his Opuscula Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum under the title 'Adversus omnes Haereticos Libellus.'

The Appendix is now generally believed to be an abridged Latin translation of the short work of Hippolytus which Photius (*Bib. Cod.* 121) calls a Σύνταγμα or 'Compendium,' and entitles Κατὰ αἱρεσέων βιβλιδάριον [1]. This work of Hippolytus comprised an account of thirty-two heresies, beginning with the Dositheans and ending with the Noëtians. It was based on some lectures which he had heard Irenaeus deliver in Rome, probably about the year 177. Its date would be certainly earlier than 190. The work itself is lost, but

[1] Lightfoot, *Clem. Rom.* ii. 413 ff.; Lipsius, *Quellenkritik des Epiphanios*, Wien 1865; *Quellen der ältesten Ketzergesch*; Harnack, *Quellenkritik der Gesch. des Gnost.* Salmon in *D. C. B.* iii. 93 ff.

Lipsius has succeeded in partly restoring it by a method described in his work on Epiphanius cited in the footnote. The contents of the Appendix agree remarkably with Photius' description of Hippolytus' little treatise. The heresies enumerated are about thirty-two, beginning with Dositheus and ending with Praxeas, whose Patripassianism was identical with that of Noëtus, and who perhaps occupied a more prominent place in the translator's mind at the time [1]. The absence of the names of heretics later than Praxeas makes it probable that the Appendix was subjoined to Tertullian's treatise sometime about the pontificate of Zephyrinus (A. D. 199–217) and at Rome, but by whom it is impossible to determine [2].

[1] See *Christian Remembrancer* Jan. 1853, p. 239. Tertullian's own work against Praxeas was largely indebted to Hippolytus' work against Noëtus; Noedechen *Tert. wider Praxeas* in Jahrb. f. Prot. Theol. xiv. 576 (1888).

[2] Oehler conjectured that the Appendix was the work of Victorinus (martyred 303) of Petavium, 'Adversus omnes Haereses,' mentioned by Jerome *de vir. illustr.* 74. This view has been criticized and rejected by Dr. Caspari (Plummer's Döllinger's *Hippolytus*, p. 357).

PSEUDO-TERTULLIANI
ADVERSUS OMNES HAERESES

CAPUT I.

* * * * * *

QUORUM haereticorum, ut plura praeteream, pauca perstringam. Taceo enim Iudaismi haereticos, Dositheum, inquam, Samaritanum, qui primus ausus est prophetas, quasi non in Spiritu Sancto locutos, repudiare. Taceo Sadducaeos, qui ex huius erroris radice surgentes, ausi sunt ad hanc haeresim etiam resurrectionem carnis negare. Praetermitto Pharisaeos, qui additamenta quaedam legis adstruendo a Iudaeis divisi sunt; unde etiam hoc accipere ipsum quod habent nomen digni fuerunt: cum his etiam Herodianos, qui Christum Herodem esse dixerunt. Ad eos me converto, qui ex evangelio haeretici esse voluerunt.

Ex quibus est primus omnium Simon Magus, qui in Actis

2. **Taceo enim, &c.** This opening sentence is extracted by Hieronym. *adv. Lucif.* iv. 304 (Bened.).

Dositheum. Dositheus was probably a Samaritan false Messiah. He is included in the list of heresies given by Hegesippus *apud* Euseb. *H. E.* iv. 22, and is mentioned several times by Origen *de prin.* iv. 1 ff., *contra Cels.* vi. 11, *Tract.* 27 *in Matth.*, *Comm. in Ioann.* iv. The sect is described *Clem. Recog.* ii. 8, *Hom.* ii. 24; Epiphan. *Haer.* 13; but see Salmon *s. v.* in *D. C. B.*

9. **nomen**, i. e. Pharisees = the separated. The name is derived from the Hebrew root פרש *separavit.*

12. **Simon Magus.** Simon Magus is usually regarded as the earliest Gnostic heretic, but Salmon has given reasons for doubting the correctness of the early heresiologists in identifying Simon the Samaritan heretic with the Simon of the 'Acts of the Apostles' (*D. C. B.* iv. 682 ff.). Justin Martyr is the first authority on the Simonian heresy

Apostolorum condignam meruit ab apostolo Petro iustamque sententiam. Hic ausus est summam se dicere Virtutem, id est, summum Deum; mundum autem ab angelis suis institutum; ad daemonem se errantem, qui esset Sapientia, descendisse quaerendum; apud Iudaeos se in phantasmate Dei non passum, sed esse quasi passum.

Post hunc Menander discipulus ipsius, similiter magus, eadem dicens quae Simon, aeque quicquid se Simon dixerat, hoc se Menander esse dicebat, negans habere

(*Apol.* i. 16, 56, *Dial.* 120; Euseb. ii. 13), and he is followed by Irenaeus i. 16; Hippol. *Philosoph.* vi. 7, 18, 19; Tertull. *de anim.* 34; Epiphan. *Haer.* 31; Philast. 29; Theodor. *Haer. fab.* i. 1. Simon apparently adopted a current Gnostic terminology and teaching, but added the doctrine of the transmigration of souls in order to enable him to identify himself with the Supreme Power and his companion Helena with the female principle. His followers were guilty of the grossest immoralities. His Christology, like that of all the Gnostics, was Docetic. He taught that he himself had appeared as Jesus amongst the Jews.

in Actis Apostolorum. Acts viii. 20 f.

3. **mundum ab angelis institutum.** This was a common tenet of all the Gnostic teachers.

4. **ad daemonem se errantem.** Oehler's correction. a daemone se errante *Leid.*, *Hirsaug.*: a daemone se oberrante *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.*: ac daemone se oberrante *Rhen.*: ad oves aberrantes se *Rig. conj.*: ad Ennoiam se ovem errantem *Herald.*: ad daemonem secum errantem *Jun.* The 'daemon' or 'lost sheep' was Helen, Simon's first Ennoia, whom he had purchased at Tyre; Iren. i. 16.

Sapientia = Σοφία of the common Gnostic myths, here identified with the fallen Helen, to effect whose deliverance Simon had appeared.

7. **Menander.** A Samaritan teacher in Antioch and a pupil of Simon, our knowledge of whom is derived from Justin Martyr *Apol.* i. 26, 56, and Irenaeus i. 17: comp. Euseb. iii. 26; Tertull. *de anim.* 23, 50; *de res. carn.* 5. The Menandrianists are named in the list of Hegesippus; Euseb. iv. 22.

8. **aeque.** *Leid.*: ipse *reliqui.*

quicquid se Simon dixerat. According to Irenaeus, whose ultimate authority was no doubt Justin Martyr, Menander did not identify himself, as Simon did, with the Supreme Power, Whom he declared to be unknown to all, but asserted that he himself was sent as a Saviour for mankind; Iren. *l. c.*

posse quemquam salutem, nisi in nomine suo baptizatus fuisset.

Secutus est post haec et Saturninus, et hic similiter dicens: innascibilem Virtutem, id est Deum, in summis et illis infinitis partibus et in superioribus manere; longe autem distantes ab hoc angelos inferiorem mundum fecisse: et quia splendor quidam luminis desursum in inferioribus refulsisset, ad similitudinem illius luminis angelos hominem instituere curasse; hunc super terram iacuisse reptantem;

1. **in nomine suo baptizatus.** By this 'baptism,' which was doubtless some form of magical incantation (Iustin Mart. *l. c.*), he taught that a resurrection was assured to his disciples, and that they would be preserved from death and from growing old; Iren. and Iust. *ll. cc.*

3. **Saturninus.** A native of the Syrian Antioch, and possibly a pupil of Menander; Iren. iii. 4, 3; Tert. *de anim.* 23. His name is variously given as *Σατορνῖνος* (Iren., Euseb.), *Σατορνεῖλος* or *Σατορνῖλος* (Hippol., Epiph., Theodor.). His system is described by Irenaeus (i. 18) and by Hippolytus (*Philos.* vii. 16, 28), both accounts being probably taken from Justin Martyr's 'Syntagma.' Comp. Euseb. iv. 7; Philast. 31; Epiph. *Haer.* 23; Theodor. *Haer. fab.* i. 3. He postulated One Supreme Unknown, the Father of all, from Whom issued a series of spiritual beings. Creation was the work of seven angels, who also made man, a frail creature unable to do more than wriggle on the ground like a worm until raised by the Supreme Power. The same myth as to the creation of man is attributed below (chap. 3) and in Iren. i. 28. 3 to the Ophites, in whose system however the seven sons of Sophia-Prunikos replace the seven creator angels of Saturninus. A close affinity can be traced throughout between the Irenaean Ophites and Saturninus, the latter no doubt having evolved the original and simpler elements of the system. Saturninus' Christology was Docetic, his rule of life Encratite.

4. **innascibilem.** Oehler quotes Iren. i. 18 'Salvatorem autem innatum demonstravit'; Theodor. *l. c.* *τὸν δὲ Σωτῆρα . . . ἀγγένητον ἔφησε καὶ ἀσώματον καὶ ἀνείδεον*: but these phrases do not refer to the First Principle. Junius (rightly I think) conjectured 'innoscibilum,' quoting Iren. *l. c.* 'Saturninus . . . unum patrem incognitum omnibus ostendit.'

6. **inferiorem.** Rig. following conjecture of *F. Ursin.*: inferiores *rel.*

9. **instituere curasse.** The MSS. insert angelos between these two words.

cuius lumen illud et Virtutem illam superiorem propter misericordiam, scintillam salvam esse, cetera hominis perire; Christum in substantia corporis non fuisse, et phantasmate tantum quasi passum fuisse; resurrectionem carnis nullo modo futuram esse.

Postea Basilides haereticus erupit. Hic esse dicit summum Deum nomine Abraxan, ex quo mentem creatam, quam Graece *νοῦν* appellat; inde Verbum: ex illo Providentiam, Virtutem et Sapientiam; ex ipsis inde principatus et potestates et angelos factos, deinde infinitas angelorum editiones et probolas; ab istis angelis trecentos sexaginta quinque caelos institutos et mundum in honore Abraxae, cuius nomen hunc in se habeat numerum computatum. In ultimis quidem angelis; et qui hunc fecerunt mundum, novissimum ponit Iudaeorum Deum, id est, Deum legis et

super terram, &c. Tertull. *de anim.* 23. See note above, and below chap. 3.

6. **Basilides.** Basilides lived about A.D. 130, and was the originator of a modified Docetism, according to which Jesus exchanged His outward form and appearance with Simon the Cyrenian who was crucified in His stead. His heretical system is described Iren. i. 19; Hippol. *Philos.* vii. 2 ff.; Epiph. *Haer.* 21. It was refuted by a powerful writer Agrippa Castor, of whom nothing more is known, Euseb. iv. 7; Theodor. *Haer. fab.* i. 4. A commentary of Basilides on the Gospels called 'Exegetica' is quoted by Clem. Alex. *Strom.* iv. 12, and Acta Archel. 55.

7. **Abraxan.** This form of the word appears also in the Latin translation of Irenaeus; the Greek writers invariably, and the legends on gems generally, present the truer form Ἀβρασάξ. No satisfactory etymology has been suggested for it; and it was probably adopted by the Basilidians from some foreign mythology because of its numerical value (365). Abrasax was the chief of the 365 archons in the Basilidian system, the supreme power and source of being. See Hort. in *D. C. B.* *s. v.* ABRASAX, BASILIDES; King *Gnostics* p. 117; Harvey *Irenaeus* i. 203.

8. **Providentiam.** This represents the Φρόνησιν of Irenaeus and Hippolytus. Harvey proposes 'Prudentiam.' *Rig.*, *Pam.* insert ex Providentia between Providentiam and Virtutem, following Iren. i. 19 'a Phronesi autem Sophiam et Dynamin.'

prophetarum; quem Deum negat, sed angelum dicit. Huic sortito obtigisse semen Abrahae, atque ideo hunc de terra Aegypti filios Israël in terram Chanaan transtulisse. Hunc turbulentiorem prae ceteris angelis, atque ideo et seditiones frequenter et bella concutere, sed et humanum sanguinem fundere. Christum autem non ab hoc qui fecerit mundum, sed ab illo Abraxa missum venisse in phantasmate, sine substantia carnis fuisse; hunc passum a Iudaeis non esse, sed vice ipsius Simonem crucifixum esse: unde nec in eum credendum esse, qui sit crucifixus, ne quis confiteatur in Simonem credidisse. Martyria negat esse facienda. Carnis resurrectionem graviter impugnat, negans salutem corporibus repromissam.

Alter haereticus Nicolaus emersit. Hic de septem diaconis, qui in Actis Apostolorum allecti sunt, fuit. Hic dicit tenebras in concupiscentia luminis, et quidem foeda et obscena fuisse: ex hac permixtione pudor est dicere quae fetida et immunda sint. Sunt et cetera obscena. Aeones enim refert quosdam turpitudinis natos, et complexus et permixtiones exsecrabiles, obscenosque coniunctus, et quaedam ex ipsis adhuc turpiora. Natos praeterea daemones et deos et spiritus septem et alia satis sacrilega pariter et foeda, quae referre erubescimus, et iam praeterimus. Satis est

9. **Simonem.** Cyrenaeum. Comp. Epiphan. *Haer.* 24 *Οὐχὶ Ἰησοῦν φάσκων πεπονθέναι ἀλλὰ Σίμωνα τὸν Κυρηναῖον· καί φησιν ἐκεῖνον, ἐν τῷ βαστάζειν τὸν σταυρόν, μεταμεμορφωκέναι εἰς τοῦ ἑαυτοῦ εἶδος, καὶ ἑαυτὸν εἰς τὸν Σίμωνα· ἐκείνου δὲ σταυρωμένου, ἑστήκει κατάντικρυς ἀοράτως ὁ Ἰησοῦς, καταγελῶν τῶν τὸν Σίμωνα σταυρούντων.*

11. **Martyria, &c.** This was a common tenet of the antinomian Gnostics; comp. Iren. iii. 19. 4 writing of the Docetists 'ad tantam temeritatem progressi sunt quidam ut etiam martyres spernant, et vituperant eos qui propter Domini confessionem occiduntur.'

14. **Nicolaus.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 33.

18. **Aeones.** Rigalt's emendation of the MSS. Omnes or Homines. Comp. Epiphan. *Haer.* 25.

20. **obscenosque coniunctus.** The MSS. present the reading obscenasque *conjunctas*, which is explained by Rigalt, but not justified, as = *coniunctiones.*

nobis quod totam istam haeresim Nicolaitarum Apocalypsis Domini gravissima sententiae auctoritate damnavit, dicendo: Quia hoc tenes, odisti doctrinam Nicolaitarum, quam et ego odi.

CAPUT II.

ACCESSERUNT his haeretici etiam illi, qui Ophitae nuncupantur. Nam serpentem magnificant in tantum, ut illum etiam ipsi Christo praeferant. Ipse enim, inquiunt, scientiae nobis boni et mali originem dedit. Huius animadvertens potentiam et maiestatem Moyses, inquiunt, aereum posuit serpentem: et quicumque ipsum adspexerunt, sanitatem consecuti sunt. Ipse, aiunt praeterea, Christus in evangelio suo imitatur serpentis ipsius sacram potestatem, dicendo: Et sicut Moyses exaltavit serpentem in deserto, ita

1. **Apocalypsis.** Rev. ii. 6.

CHAP. II.—4. **Ophitae.** The account here given of the Ophites agrees more or less closely with the unnamed system described by Irenaeus i. 28, and which Theodor. *Haer. fab.* i. 14 calls undiscriminatingly Sethiani, Ophiani, Ophites. It has but little in common with Hippolytus' account of the Naassenes or Serpentarians (*Philos.* v. 1 ff.). Serpent worship had a place amongst Phoenician and Aegyptian rites, and was doubtless suggested from these to certain Gnostic sects to whom it would be especially commended by the mention of the serpent in the O. T. account of the Fall. From the Gnostic point of view the serpent, as the enemy of the Demiurge or Creator of (evil) matter, was the friend of mankind; and was sometimes identified with Nous, sometimes with Sophia, and even (by the Naassenes) with the Logos (Iren. i. 28, 3, 8). The Ophite system was an extraordinary mixture of Zoroastrianism, Gnosticism, and Christianity, and was largely indebted to Old Testament terms and ideas. It postulated a triplicity in the Supreme Principle—Light (Pater omnium, Primus Homo), Ennoia (Filius Hominis, Secundus Homo), Spirit (Prima Femina). From the Spirit was generated a third male, Christ, and a bisexual Sophia-Prunikos who fell into the world of matter, and was eventually, through her seven sons, the cause of the creation. Such is the commencement of the Irenaean account; for a comparison of it with the Hippolytean Naassenes see Salmon *D. C. B.* iv. 80 ff.

7. **boni et mali.** Gen. iii. 1 ff.

8. **aereum serpentem.** Numb. xxi. 4 ff.

12. **Et sicut Moyses.** S. John iii. 14.

exaltari oportet Filium hominis. Ipsum introducunt ad benedicenda eucharistia sua. Sed tota istius erroris et scena et doctrina inde fluxit. Dicunt enim de illo summo primario Aeone complures alios Aeones exstitisse inferiores; omnibus tamen istis Aeonem antestare, cuius sit nomen Ialdabaoth. Hunc autem conceptum esse ex altero Aeone Aeonibus inferioribus permixto; seque postea cum in superiora voluisset eniti, gravitate materiae permixta sibi, non potuisse ad superiora pervenire, in medietate relictum, extendisse se totum, effecisse sic caelum. Ialdabaoth tamen inferius descendisse et fecisse sibi filios septem: quem occlusisse superiora dilatatione, ut, quia angeli quae superiora essent scire non possent, ipsum solum Deum putarent. Virtutes igitur illas et angelos inferiores hominem fecisse, et quia ab infirmioribus et mediocribus virtutibus institutus esset, quasi vermem iacuisse reptantem: illum vero Aeonem, ex quo Ialdabaoth processisset, invidia commotum, scintillam quandam iacenti homini immisisse, qua excitatus per prudentiam saperet et intellegere posset superiora. Sic rursum Ialdabaoth istum in indignationem conversum ex semetipso

2. **eucharistia** = εὐχαριστεῖα. This is the reading of *Leid.*, *Divion.*, *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Rig.*: eucharistica *Pam.* This revolting practice of allowing tame serpents to crawl over and sanctify the eucharistic bread is described by Epiph. *Haer.* 37; comp. Augustin. *Haer.* 17.

3. **inde**, 'from the following sources.'

5. **Ialdabaoth**, i. e. perhaps יָהּ־אֵל־דַאֲבָהוֹת, *Dominus Deus patrum*; or יַלְדָּא בָּהוּת, *son of Chaos*; see Harvey *Irenaeus* i. 230, where other suggested etymologies are given. Ialdabaoth was the son born to Sophia from her contact with the waters; and from him came six successive generations of sons. In his distress at their revolt from him he produced another son Ophiomorphus, the serpent-shaped Nous; see below.

7. **seque**, quae *Leid.*: quem seems to be required.

11. **filios septem.** This is an error perhaps of the epitomator. The sons of Ialdabaoth were six in number and named as follows—Iao, Sabaoth, Adoneus, Eloeus, Oreus, Astaphaeus. These with Ialdabaoth formed the Hebdomad who ruled the seven heavens, and created man.

16. **quasi vermem**, see note on Saturninus ch. I.

edidisse virtutem et similitudinem serpentis, et hanc fuisse virtutem in paradiso, id est, istum fuisse serpentem, cui Eva quasi filio Dei crediderat. Decerpsit, inquiunt, de fructu arboris, atque ideo generi humano scientiam bonorum et malorum contribuit. Christum autem non in substantia carnis fuisse; salutem carnis sperandam omnino non esse.

Necnon etiam erupit alia quoque haeresis, quae dicitur Cainaeorum. Et ipsi enim magnificant Cain, quasi ex quadam potenti Virtute conceptum, quae operata sit in ipso. Nam Abel ex inferiore Virtute conceptum, procreatum, et ideo inferiorem repertum. Hi qui hoc adserunt, etiam Iudam proditorem defendunt, admirabilem illum et magnum esse memorantes propter utilitates, quas humano generi contulisse iactatur. Quidam enim ipsorum gratiarum actionem Iudae propter hanc caussam reddendam putant. Animadvertens enim, inquiunt, Iudas, quod Christus vellet veritatem subvertere, tradidit illum, ne subverti veritas posset. Et alii sic contra disputant et dicunt: Quia potestates huius mundi nolebant pati Christum, ne humano generi per mortem ipsius salus pararetur, saluti consulens generis humani, tradidit Christum, ut salus, quae impediebatur per virtutes, quae obsistebant ne pateretur Christus, impediri omnino non posset, et ideo per passionem Christi non posset salus humani generis retardari.

Sed et illa haeresis processit, quae dicitur Sethoitarum. Huius perversitatis doctrina haec est: Duos homines ab angelis constitutos, Cain et Abel; propter hos magnas inter angelos contentiones et discordias exstitisse, ob hanc caussam

1. **similitudinem serpentis.** Comp. Iren. i. 28. 3 ὀφιόμορφον.

8. **Cainaeorum,** see note *de praescr. haer.* 33. Chaldaeorum is the reading of *Leid., Rhen.*

25. **Sethoitarum.** The Sethoites or Sethians are not mentioned by Irenaeus, and the sect so-named, Σιθιανοί, in Hippolytus (*Philos.* v. 21), differs in many respects from the one here described. Epiphanius gives an account of them, substantially the same as Pseudo-Tertullian; comp. Philast. 3. See Salmon *D. C. B.* iv. 87.

illam virtutem, quae super omnes virtutes esset, quam matrem pronuntiant, dum Abel interfectum dicerent, voluisse concipi et nasci hunc Seth loco Abelis, ut evacuarentur angeli illi, qui duos priores illos homines condidissent, dum hoc semen mundum oritur et nascitur. Permixtiones enim dicunt angelorum et hominum iniquas fuisse: ob quam caussam illam virtutem, quam, sicut diximus, pronuntiant matrem, ad vindictam etiam cataclysmum inducere, ut et illud permixtionis semen tolleretur, et hoc solum semen, quod esset purum, integrum custodiretur. Sed enim illos, qui seminis illos prioris instituissent, occulte et latenter, et ignorante illa matre virtute, cum illis octo animabus in arcam misisse, etiam semen Cham, quo semen malitiae non periret, sed cum ceteris conservatum et post cataclysmum terris redditum exemplo ceterorum excresceret et effunderetur et totum orbem et impleret et occuparet. De Christo autem sic sentiunt, ut dicant illum tantummodo Seth et pro ipso Seth ipsum fuisse.

CAPUT III.

CARPOCRATES praeterea hanc tulit sectam. Unam esse

2. **dicerent.** Routh acutely suggested 'disceret' quoting Epiph. *l.c.* *γνοῦσα ὅτι ἀπέκτανται Ἄβελ*, &c.

3. **evacuarentur**: 'Hoc est viribus privarentur vel superarentur' (Oehl.). *Evacuare* is found in Tertullian in the sense of *infirmare, abolere, de pat.* 12; *de monog.* 7, 13; *de res. carn.* 24, 51; *adv. Marc.* v. 7, 11; and in Irenaeus v. 21, 22, 24. In the Cod. Iustinian. it is used of 'cancelling' an obligation, viii. 43. 4; comp. Vulg. 1 Cor. 1. 17.

6. **iniquas**, inaequales, impares. Routh suggested 'impias.'

13. **Cham.** *Rhen.*, *Rig.*, *Oehl.*: Chain *Leid.*: Cain *rel.* Comp. Epiph. *l.c.* *εἰσέδυσαν τὸν Χὰμ εἰς τὴν κίβωτον ὄντα τοῦ αὐτῶν σπέρματος.*

18. **ipsum.** Christum.

CHAP. III.—18. **Carpocrates.** Carpocrates was a Platonist of Alexandria in the reign of Hadrian, and his followers were the first to call themselves Gnostics; Iren. i. 20. He maintained the Unity of the First Principle, from Whom issued a series of spiritual beings, the lowest

dicit Virtutem in superioribus principalem; ex hac prolatos angelos atque Virtutes, quos distantes longe a superioribus Virtutibus mundum istum in inferioribus partibus condidisse; Christum non ex virgine Maria natum, sed ex semine Ioseph, hominem tantummodo genitum, sane prae ceteris iustitiae cultu, vitae integritate meliorem; hunc apud Iudaeos passum, solam animam ipsius caelo receptam, eo quod et firmior et robustior ceteris fuerit; ex quo colligeret, retentata animarum sola salute, nullas corporis resurrectiones.

Post hunc Cerinthus haereticus erupit, similia docens. Nam et ipse mundum institutum esse ab illis dicit; Christum ex semine Ioseph natum proponit, hominem illum tantummodo sine divinitate contendens, ipsam quoque legem ab

of whom formed the world and man. Man's object was to overcome by magical arts the spiritual rulers of this world, and so to regain the Father of all. The Carpocratians thus laid great stress on magic, held the transmigration of souls, and the final salvation of the souls of all. They used secret marks, and inasmuch as all actions were regarded as indifferent, the immorality of the sect became proverbial, and probably afforded a foundation for many of the infamous charges brought against the Christians by the heathen (see note *Apol.* 7). Carpocrates' Christology was purely Psilanthropic. The authorities upon the sect are Iren. i. 20, ii. 48 f.; Hippol. vii. 20; Clem. Alex. *Strom.* iii. 2; Tertull. *de anim.* 23, 35.

9. **retentata.** Oehl.: tentatam *Leid.*: tentata Edd.

11. **Cerinthus.** Cerinthus, an Aegyptian by race, lived at the close of the Apostolic age, and is said by Irenaeus on the authority of Polycarp (Iren. iii. 3. 4) to have personally encountered S. John at Ephesus. The distinctive characteristic of his Docetism was the separation of the man Jesus from the divine Christ, Who (he taught) descended on Jesus at his baptism and left him before the crucifixion. Unlike other Gnostics he admitted the resurrection of the human body of Jesus. His views on creation and the First Principle resemble those of Menander. Iren. i. 21; Hippol. vii. 33, x. 17; Caius *apud* Euseb. iii. 25; Dionysius *apud* Euseb. vii. 25; Theodor. *Haer. fab.* ii. 3; Epiph. *Haer.* 28.

12. **ab illis,** *sc.* **angelis**: probably 'angelis' should be read instead of 'illis.'

14. **legem ab angelis.** Comp. Acts vii. 53; Gal. iii. 19; Heb. ii. 2; Deut. xxxiii. 2; Ps. lxviii. 17.

angelis datam perhibens, Iudaeorum Deum non Dominum, sed angelum promens.

Huius successor Ebion fuit, Cerintho non in omni parte consentiens, quod a Deo dicat mundum, non ab angelis factum; et quia scriptum sit: Nemo discipulus super magistrum, nec servus super dominum, legem etiam proponit, scilicet ad excludendum evangelium et vindicandum Iudaismum.

CAPUT IV.

VALENTINUS autem haereticus multas introduxit fabulas: has ego circumcidens breviter expediam. Introducit enim Pleroma et Aeonas triginta; exponit autem hos per syzygias, id est, coniugationes quasdam. Nam dicit in primis esse Bython et Silentium, ex his processisse Mentem et Veritatem; ex quibus erupisse Verbum et Vitam, de quibus rursum creatum Hominem et Ecclesiam. Sed enim ex his quoque processisse duodecim Aeonas; de Sermone autem et Vita Aeonas alios decem. Hanc esse Aeonum triacontada, quae fit in Pleromate ex ogdoade et decade ac duodecade. Tricesimum autem Aeonem Bython illum videre voluisse, et ad videndum illum ausum esse in superiora conscendere; et quoniam ad magnitudinem ipsius videndam capax non fuit, in defectione fuisse et paene dissolutum esse, nisi qui missus ad constabiliendum illum ille quem appellant Horon, con-

3. **Ebion.** See notes *de praescr. haer.* 33.

5. **scriptum sit.** S. Matt. x. 24; S. Luke vi. 40; S. John xiii. 16.

9. **Valentinus.** See *de praescr. haer.* 7, 30, 33.

10. **circumcidens.** *Leid.*, *Rhen.* (*marg.*), *Routh*, *Oehl.*: circumdicens *Rhen.*: circumducens *rel.*

13. **Silentium.** Sigé had a place in nearly all the Gnostic systems, even in Simon's; Greg. Naz. *Orat.* xxv. 8. 1; and Hippolytus (*Philos.* vi. 21) states that Valentinus' system was founded on that of Simon.

processisse Mentem. The MSS. present processisse semen mentem by repetition of the last two letters of the first word and the first three of the second.

firmasset illum dicto Iao pronuntiato. Istum autem Aeonem in defectionem factum Achamoth dicit in passionibus desiderii quibusdam fuisse, et ex passionibus materias edidisse. Expavit enim, inquit, et extimuit, et contristatus est, et ex his passionibus concepit et edidit. Hinc fecit caelum et terram et mare et omnia quaecumque sunt in eis, ob quam caussam omnia infirma esse et fragilia et caduca et mortalia, quaecumque sunt ab ipso facta; quoniam quidem ipse fuerit de deceptatione conceptus atque prolatus; hunc tamen instituisse istum mundum ex his materiis, quas

1. **Iao.** This mystic word is either an attempt to represent the sound of the Ineffable Name יהוה, or more probably is a symbolic combination of the initial letter of the Greek form of the tetragrammaton with the first and last letters of the Greek alphabet, signifying 'Eternal Existence.' But see King's *Gnostics* p. 319; Harvey *Irenaeus* i. 33; and especially Driver in *Studia Biblica* i. 7 ff. Ἰάω was undoubtedly the name by which the God of the Jews was known to some of the ancient Greek writers; Diodor. Sic. i. 94 παρὰ δὲ τοῖς Ἰουδαίοις Μωυσῆν τὸν Ἰάω ἐπικαλούμενον θεόν: and it appears in several of the Gnostic schemes (see note ch. 2; Iren. i. 1. 7, 28, 3; Tertull. *adv. Val.* 10, 14; Epiph. *Haer.* 34. The name is associated in engravings with Horus, the Aegyptian God of Spring, as well as with the Abrasax figure (King *u.s.* Plate C), a fact which illustrates the extraordinary syncretism of the Gnostic systems.

pronuntiato. *Oehl.*: hoc pronuntiatio appellat. *Rig.*, *Routh*: hoc pronuntiat Io Apelles. *Migne.*

2. **Achamoth.** There is considerable confusion in the account here given. The thirtieth Aeon was a female, the higher Sophia, and was the parent of Achamoth or Enthymesis, the lower Sophia, from whose emotions the universe was derived; see note *de praescr. haer.* 7. Lipsius in *D.C.B.* iv. 1084.

9. **deceptatione.** *Leid.*, *Rhen.* This word must represent ἀπορίᾳ of Iren. i. 1. 7. Oehler corrects into 'defectione' or 'desperatione': other editions print 'aporiatione.'

hunc tamen, &c. The abruptness of this change of construction is not unparalleled (see note on *seque* ch. 2), but it points to a careless transcription or still more careless translation. It may be, however, that the sources from which the original Greek of Hippolytus was compiled were not harmonized or consecutively adjusted. If, as seems to be the case, Hippolytus' work was a transcription of notes taken at

Achamoth vel pavendo, vel timendo, vel contristando, vel sudando praestiterat. Nam ex pavore, inquit, tenebrae factae sunt; ex timore et ignorantia spiritus nequitiae et malignitatis; ex tristitia et lacrimis humida fontium, fluminum materia marisque. Christum autem missum ab illo propatore, qui est Bythos. Hunc autem in substantia corporis nostri non fuisse, sed spiritale nescio quod corpus de caelo deferentem, quasi aquam per fistulam, sic per Mariam virginem transmeasse, nihil inde vel accipientem vel mutuantem. Resurrectionem huius carnis negat, sed alterius. Legis et prophetarum quaedam probat, quaedam improbat: id est, omnia improbat, dum quaedam reprobat. Evangelium habet etiam suum praeter haec nostra.

Post hunc exstiterunt Ptolemaeus et Secundus haeretici,

Irenaeus' lectures, which were themselves based upon Justin Martyr's 'Syntagma' and another work on heresiology, some confusion is not altogether surprising.

7. **corpus de caelo.** The artificial Christology of Valentinus allowed to Jesus Christ a visible and passible, but not a material, body. His body (it was held) was not of the Virgin's substance, but was conveyed through her (see next note). This quasi-Docetic view was reproduced later in Apollinarianism and Monophysitism, and was revived in the sixteenth century by the mystical Anabaptists; see Bright *Serm. S. Leo,* note 24. Marcion held a view of Christ's Body very similar to this according to Athanasius *contr. Apollin.* i. 12, ii. 3, comp. note *de praescr. haer.* 33.

8. **aquam per fistulam.** Iren. iii. 16 'Iesus qui per Mariam transierit'; Epiph. *Haer.* 31; Philast. 38; Augustin. *Haer.* 11.

10. **sed alterius. Legis.** So all the MSS.: sed non alterius. Legis *Lat.*: sed alterius, legis *Iun.*, *Routh.*: sed alterius legis. *Oehl.* Valentinus believed in the resurrection of the *σῶμα πνευματικόν*, Epiph. *l. c.* Tertull. *adv. Val.* 27. The omission of 'probat' or some such antithetic verb to 'negat' is an instance of zeugma common enough in condensed writers; cp. Tacit. *Ann.* ii. 20; 1 Tim. iv. 3.

14. **Ptolemaeus.** Ptolemaeus is described by Irenaeus (i. *praef.*) as *ἀπάνθισμα τῆς Οὐαλεντίνου σχολῆς*, 'flosculum Valentini scholae,' and as still living at the head of his following. Hippolytus (vi. 35) couples him with Heracleon, as leaders of the Italic School of Valentinians, i. e. they attributed to our Lord a *σῶμα ψυχικόν*, and not a *σῶμα*

qui cum Valentino per omnia consentiunt. In illo solo differunt: nam cum Valentinus Aeonas tantum triginta finxisset, isti addiderunt alios complures; quatuor enim primum, deinde alios quatuor adgregaveruut. Et quod dicit Valentinus Aeonem trigesimum excessisse de pleromate, ut in defectionem, negant isti: non enim ex illa triacontade fuisse hunc, qui fuerit in defectionem propter desiderium videndi propatoris.

Exstitit praeterea Heracleon alter haereticus, qui cum

πνευματικόν. All that is known of him is derived from Irenaeus i. 1. 18, 6. 1, and an independent notice in Tertull. *adv. Val.* 4. Comp. Philast. 39, Epiph. *Haer.* 33. His characteristic tenet was the independent personal subsistence, outside the Deity, of the Aeons of Valentinus. Some notion of his teaching may be gathered from the two fragments of his writing preserved in Iren. i. 1. 18 (in which he deduces teaching on the Ogdoad from the prologue to S. John's Gospel) and in Epiphan. *l. c.* (a letter of Ptolemaeus to Flora on the origin of the Mosaic Law).

Secundus. Secundus is the first of the Valentinian Gnostics described by Irenaeus (i. 5. 2), who is followed by Tertullian (*adv. Val.* 38), Hippolytus (vi. 38), and Epiphanius (*Haer.* 32): cp. Philast. 40; Augustin. *Haer.* 12. He divided the Valentinian Ogdoad into two Tetrads, a right and a left, calling the masculine Aeons Light, and the feminine Darkness, thus approximating in terminology more closely than Valentinus to Oriental dualism.

3. **isti addiderunt.** This is a misunderstanding on the part of the author. Neither Ptolemaeus nor Secundus, whom he here couples together, made any addition to the number of the Valentinian Aeons: the peculiarity of Secundus' teaching lay in the grouping of them.

6. **negant isti.** This exclusion of the Sophia, whose emotions gave birth to the material world, from the Thirty Aeons, is ascribed to Secundus, but not to Ptolemaeus, by the authorities cited above.

9. **Heracleon.** Heracleon was another pupil of Valentinus; Origen *Comm. in Ioann.* ii. 8. His system was more truly philosophical than the Valentinian, betraying certain Pythagorean elements, and commencing with a Monad in place of Valentinus' Duad. He attempted to use its details in his interpretations, often wildly allegorical, of the Gospels in his Ὑπομνήματα or 'Commentaries' (Orig. *u. s.* vi. 8). Fragments of these are embedded in Origen's *Commentaries on S. John*; Clement of Alexandria's *Stromata* iv. 9 *Eclog. Proph.* 25; and Photius *Epist.* 134. They have been edited,

Valentino paria sentit, sed novitate quadam pronuntiationis vult videri alia sentire. Introducit enim in primis illud fuisse quod pronuntiat, et deinde ex illa monade duo, ac deinde reliquos Aeonas; deinde introducit totum Valentinum.

CAPUT V.

NON defuerunt post hos Marcus quidam et Colarbasus novam haeresim ex Graecorum alphabeto componentes. Negant enim veritatem sine istis posse litteris inveniri; immo totam plenitudinem et perfectionem veritatis in istis litteris esse dispositam. Propter hanc enim caussam

with a discussion of the position and date of Heracleon, in the Cambridge *Texts and Studies* i. 4. Comp. Epiph. *Haer.* 36; Tert. *adv. Val.* 4, 8; Augustin. *Haer.* 16; Iren. ii. 3. 2.

3. **quod pronuntiat.** Some word seems to be wanted, perhaps 'Monadem.' Routh suggested 'Dominum,' citing Philast. 41 'Post Secundum Heracleon surrexit dicens Principium esse unum quem Dominum appellat.' See also Lipsius *Quellenkr. des Epiph.* p. 170.

CHAP. V.—6. **Marcus.** The Marcosians were a Valentinian sect noted for their pronounced use of magical incantations, and arithmetical mysticism, deduced from the numerical value of the letters of the alphabet, by which they designated the Valentinian Aeons. The puerilities of Marcus' system, and his gross charlatanism with a view to gaining an immoral ascendency over women, are fully described by Irenaeus i. 7 ff., who is followed by Hippol. vi. 39; Epiph. *Haer.* 34. Marcus seems to have lived in Asia Minor as a contemporary of Irenaeus, but his teaching was rife also in the neighbourhood of Lyon (Iren. *l. c.*).

Colarbasus. It is most probable that this name has arisen from a misunderstanding of an obscure and possibly corrupt passage in Irenaeus i. 8 Οὗτος οὖν ὁ Μαρκὸς μήτραν καὶ ἐκδοχεῖον τῆς Κολαρβάσου Σιγῆς: and that no heretic so named ever existed. Hippolytus gives no information about him distinct from Marcus (*Philos.* vi. 1; iv. 13); and Philaster treats the teaching of the two heretics as identical (*Haer.* 43); while the statements of Epiphanius (*Haer.* 35) and Theodoret (*Haer. fab.* i. 12) are worthless. The word very possibly represents the Hebrew קולארבע, *The Voice of Four*, i.e. of the Divine Tetrad which revealed to Marcus the mysteries of Sigé. See Hort. *D. C. B.* i. 594 f.; Harvey, *Irenaeus* i. 127.

Christum dixisse: Ego sum A et Ω. Denique *in* Iesum Christum descendisse, id est, columbam in Iesum venisse, quae Graeco nomine cum περιστερὰ pronuntietur, habere secundum numerum DCCCI. Percurrunt isti Ω, Ψ, Χ, Φ, Υ, Τ, totum usque ad Α, Β, et computant ogdoadas et decadas; ita afferre illorum omnes vanitates et ineptum sit et otiosum. Quod tamen non tantum iam vanum, sed etiam periculosum sit: alterum deum fingunt praeter Creatorem; Christum in substantia negant carnis fuisse; negant carnis resurrectionem futuram.

CAPUT VI.

ACCEDIT his Cerdon quidam. Hic introducit initia duo, id est duos deos, unum bonum et alterum saevum, bonum superiorem, saevum hunc mundi creatorem. Hic prophetias et legem repudiat. Deo creatori renuntiat, superioris Dei Filium Christum venisse tractat, hunc in substantia carnis negat, in phantasmate solo fuisse pronuntiat; nec omnino passum, sed quasi passum; nec ex virgine natum, sed omnino nec natum; resurrectionem animae tantummodo probat, corporis negat. Solum evangelium Lucae, nec tamen totum recipit: apostoli Pauli neque omnes neque totas

1. **Ego sum A et Ω.** Rev. i. 7, xxi. 6, xxii. 13.

in Iesum. The addition of *in* seems to be required, as Semler first pointed out.

4. **secundum.** So the MSS. *Scaliger* proposed secum hunc: *Oehl.* prints secum; but no alteration is necessary.

CHAP. VI.—11. **Cerdon.** Cerdon was a native of Syria who went to Rome in the episcopate of Hyginus, A. D. 137–141, and there, after several lapses and reconciliations, separated from the Church. He is known chiefly through his having been the teacher of Marcion; and their fundamental tenets seem to have been identical. Iren. i. 24, iii. 4. 2; Hippol. *Philos.* x. 15; Epiph. *Haer.* 41; Philast. 44.

19. **Solum evangelium Lucae.** The author here seems to have transferred to Cerdon statements which in the original referred to Marcion; see *de praescr. haer.* 38.

epistulas sumit. Acta Apostolorum et Apocalypsin quasi falsa reicit.

Post hunc discipulus ipsius emersit Marcion quidam nomine, Ponticus genere, episcopi filius, propter stuprum cuiusdam virginis ab ecclesiae communicatione abiectus. Hic ex occasione qua dictum sit: Omnis arbor bona bonos fructus facit, mala autem malos, haeresim Cerdonis approbare conatus est, *ut* eadem diceret quae ille superior haereticus ante dixerat.

Exstitit post hunc Lucanus quidam nomine, Marcionis sectator atque discipulus: et hic per eadem vadens blasphemiae genera, eadem docet quae Marcion et Cerdon docuerant.

Post hos subsequitur Apelles, discipulus Marcionis, qui

3. **Marcion.** Marcion's heresy was free from pagan elements, being purely a perversion of Judaism and Christianity, between which (he maintained) there existed an irreconcileable antagonism. He rejected the Old Testament, and accepted only S. Luke's Gospel and ten of S. Paul's Epistles, all of which he mutilated. He held two *ἀρχαι* or ruling powers, the Supreme God of pure benevolence, and the Creator, or God of the Jews, whose character was 'just' or 'severe.' The Gnosticism which he imbibed from Cerdon naturally led him into a quasi-Manichaeism with regard to matter, and into a Docetic Christology (see note *de praescr. haer.* 33); while his characteristic hatred of Judaism made him an extreme Paulinist and opponent of S. Peter. Justin Martyr wrote against him in a work now lost; Euseb. *H.E.* iv. 11. 18; Iren. iv. 11. 2, v. 26. 3; Phot. *Cod.* 125. Marcion himself wrote a work called 'Antitheses,' or instances of opposition between the Law and the Gospel. His system is fully set out and refuted in Tertullian's five books 'Adversus Marcionem': see also *de praescr. haer.* 7, 30, 33, 34; Iren. i. 25.

4. **stuprum.** This libel is repeated Epiph. *Haer.* 41; but the purity of Marcion's life is unimpeachable; see the notes *de praescr. haer.* 30.

6. **Omnis arbor.** S. Matt. vii. 17.

8. **ut eadem diceret:** eadem diceret *Leid.* (which demands *ut*): eadem dicere *Rhen.*, *Gang.*, *Gel.*, *Pam.*, *Rig.* (which requires *et*).

10. **Lucanus.** See note *de praescr. haer.* 7.

14. **Apelles.** See notes *de praescr. haer.* 6, 30.

posteaquam in carnem suam lapsus est, a Marcione segregatus est. Hic introducit unum Deum infinitis superioribus partibus. Hunc potestates multas angelosque fecisse; propterea et aliam Virtutem, quam dici Dominum dicit, sed angelum ponit. Hoc vult videri mundum institutum ad imitationem mundi superioris, cui mundo permiscuisse paenitentiam; quia non illum tam perfecte fecisset quam ille superior mundus institutus fuisset. Legem et prophetas repudiat; Christum neque in phantasmate dicit fuisse, sicut Marcion, neque in substantia veri corporis, ut evangelium docet, sed ideo quod e superioribus partibus descenderet, ipso descensu sideream sibi carnem et aëream contexuisse; hunc in resurrectione singulis quibusque elementis, quae in descensu suo mutuata fuissent, in ascensu reddidisse, et sic dispersis quibusque corporis sui partibus, in caelo spiritum tantum reddidisse. Hic carnis resurrectionem negat. Solo utitur et apostolo, sed Marcionis, id est non toto. Animarum solarum dicit salutem. Habet praeterea privatas, sed extraordinarias lectiones suas, quas appellat Phaneroseis, Philumenes cuiusdam puellae, quam quasi prophetissam sequitur. Habet praeterea suos libros, quos inscripsit Syllogismorum, in quibus probare vult quod omnia quae-

9. **Christum, &c.** Apelles' Docetism resembled Marcion's in denying the birth of Christ's body, but differed in allowing Him a solid body of flesh for temporary use derived from the elements; Tertull. *de carn. Chr.* 6 'solidum Christi corpus sed sine nativitate [praedicavit] .... De sideribus et de substantiis superioris mundi mutuatus est carnem.' Hippol. *Philos.* vii. 38 *τοῦτον δὲ οὐκ ἐκ παρθένου γεγενῆσθαι, οὐδὲ ἄσαρκον εἶναι φανέντα λέγει, ἀλλ' ἐκ τῆς τοῦ πάντος οὐσίας μεταλαβόντα μερῶν, σῶμα πεποιηκέναι, τουτέστι θερμοῦ καὶ ψυχροῦ καὶ ὑγροῦ καὶ ξηροῦ, καὶ ἐν τούτῳ τῷ σώματι λαβόντα τὰς κοσμικὰς ἐξουσίας, βεβιωκέναι ὃν ἐβίωσε χρόνον ἐν κόσμῳ.*

16. **Solo ... apostolo.** S. Paul.

19. **Phaneroseis.** These 'Manifestations' appear to be the work, referred to by Tertullian *de praescr. haer.* 30, which was inspired by Philumena. 'Lectiones' will then probably mean public readings in his schismatic assemblies.

22. **Syllogismorum.** These books of 'Reasonings' are mentioned

cumque Moyses de Deo scripserit vera non sint, sed falsa sint.

CAPUT VII.

HIS haereticis omnibus accedit Tatianus quidam alter haereticus. Hic Iustini Martyris discipulus fuit, post hunc diversa sentire coepit. Totus enim secundum Valentinum sapit, adiciens illud, Adam nec salutem consequi posse, quasi non, si rami salvi fiunt, et radix salva sit.

Accesserunt alii haeretici, qui dicuntur Secundum Phrygas, sed horum non una doctrina est. Sunt enim qui Kata Proclum dicuntur, sunt alii qui Secundum Aeschinem pronuntiantur. Hi habent aliam communem blasphemiam,

by Hippolytus (x. 16) and Eusebius (v. 13), and cited by Ambrose (*de Parad.* v. 28), probably following Origen *Comm. in Gen.* ii. 2.

CHAP. VIII.—3. **Tatianus.** An Assyrian, born cir. A.D. 110. Having become a convert to Christianity, he attached himself to Justin Martyr in Rome, and continued orthodox during Justin's lifetime. Subsequently he developed strange views savouring of Gnosticism and Encratism, the germs of which are discernible even in his orthodox 'Oratio' (see Fuller in *D. C. B.* iv. 803). Irenaeus i. 26 expressly states Tatian's indebtedness to Valentinus as regards his system of Aeons, and to Marcion and Saturninus for his ascetic teaching; the non-salvability of Adam being Tatian's own peculiar invention. Comp. Iren. iii. 37; Hippol. *Philos.* viii. 16; Euseb. *H. E.* iv. 29; Epiph. *Haer.* 46; Rhodon *apud* Euseb. v. 13.

8. **Secundum Phrygas.** A soloecism for the Phrygians (Cataphrygians) or Montanists, who are here represented as being divided on the Patripassian question into two parties, the followers of Proclus, and the followers of Aeschines. Hippolytus (*Philos.* viii. 19) also mentions this schism. On Montanus and his heresy see Salmon in *D. C. B.* iii. 935 ff., and the references there given.

10. **Proclum.** Proclus is best known as the Montanist opponent of Caius in a public disputation at Rome, the published record of which, by Caius, is mentioned Euseb. *H. E.* ii. 25, iii. 28, 31, vi. 20: comp. Hieron. *de vir. illustr.* 59; Theodor. *Haer. fab.* ii. 3, iii. 2. The Proculus mentioned by Tertullian, *adv. Val.* 5, is no doubt the same person: comp. Pacian. *Epist.* 1 *ad Sympr.* See Lightfoot *Clem. Rom.* ii. 380.

aliam blasphemiam non communem, sed peculiarem et suam: et communem quidem illam, qua in apostolis quidem dicant Spiritum Sanctum fuisse, Paracletum non fuisse, et qua dicant Paracletum plura in Montano dixisse quam Christum in evangelium protulisse, nec tantum plura, sed etiam meliora atque maiora. Privatam autem blasphemiam illi, qui sunt Kata Aeschinem hanc habent qua adiciunt etiam hoc, ut dicant Christum ipsum esse Filium et Patrem.

CAPUT VIII.

EST praeterea his omnibus etiam Blastus accedens, qui latenter Iudaismum vult introducere. Pascha enim dicit non aliter custodiendum esse, nisi secundum legem Moysi XIV. mensis. Quis autem nesciat, quoniam evangelica gratia evacuatur, si ad legem Christum redigit?

Accedit his Theodotus haereticus Byzantius: qui postea-quam Christum, pro nomine adprehensus, negavit, in

3. **Paracletum non fuisse.** Comp. Iren. iii. 11. 12, where he explains the Montanist rejection of S. John's Gospel as due to its containing the promise of the Paraclete to the Apostles, and therefore traversing Montanus' exclusive claim to His inspiration.

CHAP. VIII.—9. **Blastus.** It appears from Pacian. *Epist.* 1 *ad Sympr.* that Blastus the Greek was a Montanist as well a Quarta-deciman. He lived probably in the episcopate of Victor, A. D. 189–198. Irenaeus addressed to him an Epistle 'On Schism,' now lost; Euseb. *H.E.* v. 13, 20.

13. **evacuatur.** See note ch. 2.

14. **Theodotus.** A leather-cutter of Byzantium, who denied his faith during a persecution in his native city, fled to Rome, and was excommunicated during the episcopate of Victor for teaching psilanthropic views of the Christ, whom he distinguished from Jesus. Hippolytus *Philos.* vii. 35; *Little Labyr. apud* Euseb. v. 28; Epiphan. *Haer.* 54.

15. **Christum.** *Leid., Hirsaug., Rhen.*: Christi *Patern., Gorz., Vat., Gang., Gel., Pam., Rig.*

adprehensus. *Leid., Hirsaug., Patern., Gorz., Rhen., Gang., Gel.*: comprehensus *Vat., Pam., Rig.*

Christum blasphemare non destitit. Doctrinam enim introduxit, qua Christum hominem tantummodo diceret, Deum autem illum negaret, ex Spiritu quidem Sancto natum ex virgine, sed hominem solitarium atque nudum, nulla alia prae ceteris, nisi sola iustitiae auctoritate.

Alter post hunc Theodotus haereticus erupit, qui et ipse introduxit alteram sectam, et ipsum hominem Christum tantummodo dicit ex Spiritu Sancto, et virgine Maria conceptum pariter et natum; sed hunc inferiorem esse quam Melchisedech, eo quod dictum sit de Christo: Tu es sacerdos in aeternum secundum ordinem Melchisedech. Nam illum Melchisedech praecipuae gratiae caelestem esse Virtutem, eo quod agat Christus pro hominibus, deprecator et advocatus ipsorum factus, Melchisedech facere pro caelestibus angelis atque Virtutibus; nam esse illum usque adeo Christo meliorem, ut ἀπάτωρ sit, ἀμήτωρ sit, ἀγενεαλόγητος sit, cuius neque initium neque finis comprehensus sit aut comprehendi possit.

Sed post hos omnes etiam Praxeas quidam haeresim introduxit, quam Victorinus corroborare curavit. Hic

6. **Theodotus.** The banker, a follower of the first Theodotus, and leader of the sect in succession to his teacher. He held the same psilanthropic Christology, but added the doctrine of the superiority of Melchizedek to Christ, based on Heb. v. 6. Hippol. *Philos.* vii. 36; *Little Labyr. u. s.*; Epiph. *Haer.* 55; Philast. 52.

10. **Tu es sacerdos.** Heb. v. 6, vi. 20, vii. 17.

16. **ἀπάτωρ**, &c. Heb. vii. 1 f.

19. **Praxeas.** Praxeas, an Asiatic by birth, was a Monarchian who spent a short time in Rome during the episcopate of Zephyrinus, whose Montanism he successfully combated, and then passed to Karthage. Our knowledge of him is derived from Tertullian's treatise 'Adversus Praxean' which is a general refutation of patripassian opinions. Praxeas is not mentioned by Hippolytus, nor by any earlier writer than Augustine except Tertullian and the present author.

20. **Victorinus.** This Victorinus is unknown, and the name is generally supposed to be a combination on the part of a scribe of the names of the popes Victor and Zephyrinus, the one probably having been written over the other. That the bishop of Rome referred

Deum Patrem omnipotentem Iesum Christum esse dicit; hunc crucifixum passumque contendit et mortuum: praeterea seipsum sibi sedere ad dexteram suam, cum profana et sacrilega temeritate proponit.

to by Tertull. *adv. Prax.* 1 was Zephyrinus and not Victor, see Salmon *D. C. B.* iii. 940; Lightfoot *Clem. Rom.* ii. 418.

GENERAL INDEX

I.

II.

INDEX OF TEXTS

THE END.

DEC 10 1969

OCT 1 3 1969

~~13 '63~~

NOV 5 1974

~~APR 23 '63~~

~~MAY 23 '63~~

~~MAY 31 1963~~

~~Jul 30~~

~~Sept 3~~

Dec Nov 30

~~64~~

~~NOV 21 '66~~

~~DEC 1966~~

OCT 24 1974